



City of Seattle

Gregory J. Nickels, Mayor

Department of Planning and Development

D.M. Sugimura, Director

**DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
RECOMMENDATION**

Meeting date November 19, 2008

Application Number: 3007358

Applicant: Mithun Architects for JC Mueller LLC.

Address: 2051 East Madison Street

Board Members Present: Sharon Sutton
Rumi Takahashi, chair
Jason Morrow
Evan Bourquard

Board Member Absent: Brian Cavanaugh

Land Use Planner: Holly J. Godard

Note: Board Recommendations begin on page 7 of this document.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION:

The site is located at 2051 East Madison Street just north of East Olive Street. The site is the eastern portion of a triangular block. There is no alley in this block. The site is somewhat rectangle with a “knuckle” or “jog” midway along 22nd Avenue. The existing buildings will be demolished. The site has a small slope to the south.

AREA DEVELOPMENT

The site is four (4) platted lots and has different zoning. Zoning at the north end of the site is Neighborhood Commercial 3 with a height limit of 65 feet (NC3P-65). There is a pedestrian overlay (P). The next, mid-site, zoning to the south drops the Pedestrian (P) designation and remains NC3-65. The southern most parcel on the site is zoned Neighborhood Commercial 2 with a 40 foot height limit. (NC2-40). Neighboring uses include a two story woodshop to the south, a large parking lot and a clinic to the west. The Summit apartments and a Safeway grocery store are across 22nd Avenue; the parking entry to the Safeway store is located on 22nd Avenue across from the south end of the subject site.

EARLY DESIGN GUIDANCE

Architect's Presentation

The developer introduced the design team and himself. He pointed out his long time residence in the area and briefly described the site. Mr. Mueller pointed out that the corner of 22nd and Madison Street has been the home of several popular music venues. Former businesses located in the area include the R&B/jazz club Birdland named for Charlie "Bird" Parker. In the mid-1950's, The area hosted artists such as Quincy Jones, Ray Charles, Ernestine Anderson and later, Jimi Hendrix. Other clubs included the Mardi gras, and the Twilight Exit. He pointed out the site's unique geometry and the wishes of the design team to explore some architectural response to both the music history of the site and the physical geometry.

The architect began his presentation by describing the details of the site's location in the city and the geometry created by the street grid and platted parcels. The site is at the bend of Madison Street and 22nd Avenue. The site is three platted lots and has different zoning. Zoning at the north end of the site is Neighborhood Commercial 3 with a height limit of 65 feet (NC3P-65). There is a pedestrian overlay (P). The next, mid-site, zoning to the south drops the Pedestrian (P) designation and remains NC3-65. The southern most parcel on the site is zoned Neighborhood Commercial 2 with a 40 foot height limit. (NC2-40). The sidewalks are curb and gutter and the 22nd Avenue sidewalk is an amenity that is approximately 16 feet wide. At the upper levels there will be views to the west and to Mount Rainier. Neighboring uses include a two story woodshop to the south, a large parking lot and a clinic to the west. The Summit apartments and a Safeway grocery store are across 22nd Avenue; the parking entry to the Safeway store is located on 22nd Avenue across from the south end of the subject site. Currently the site is occupied by the Twilight Exit tavern and USA Nails salon, parking and a vacant single family house.

Three concept alternatives were presented to the Board. All three approaches have underground parking, a garage entry near the southeast corner of the site, some covered parking at grade level, retail at grade along Madison Street and 22nd Avenue, a residential entry located on 22nd Avenue and a fourth floor terrace on the south end of the site due to the lower height limit NC2-40 zone.

Alternative One has a dominant curved façade along 22nd Avenue. The proposed retail spaces are large and the residential entry faces onto the knuckle of 22nd Avenue. The curved façade holds the building footprint off of the property line and could allow for a large entry courtyard when melded with the wide sidewalk. The residential units are double loaded along a corridor, a large south facing terrace on the fourth floor, and a second story garden terrace which faces to the west.

Alternative Two is a similar proposal as noted above, but the 22nd Avenue façade follows the property line "jog or knuckle". The residential entry is south of the retail uses and somewhat close to the garage entry. The retail spaces are not as deep as alternative one. The second floor

garden terrace is similarly located on the west side of the building with views and light out to the west.

Alternative Three is similar to the other alternatives, but the garden terrace at level 2 is located on 22nd Avenue. The first floor follows the property line along 22nd giving the building form at that level the 22nd Avenue knuckle bend. The levels above the terrace would have east, south and north views into the garden terrace and along 22nd Avenue. The retail, parking and residential entries are the same as alternative two where there is more parking, less deep retail spaces and two residential entries. No anticipated development standard departures were discussed at the meeting.

Board Questions and Comments

The Board had several questions of the architect regarding the proposal alternatives. They were as follows with response by the architect. :

- Is the amount of open space similar in scale for all three schemes? Yes it is.
- Is the garage entry at the south for all three schemes? Yes it is.
- What types of materials are being considered for the building? Fiber cement panels, storefront anodized aluminum systems and vinyl windows may be in the palette.
- How could you build in a programmatic response to your interest in the musicological nature of the site? There could be studio space for practice, reduced residential unit rental for musicians, a music venue, a music store, music school, etc.
- Are townhouses a part of these design proposals? No, there are no townhouses.
- There appear to be different residential entry locations. What is the thinking on locating the residential entry? The preferred alternative has a residential entry at the knuckle where the largest outdoor space, one or more retail spaces and the residential lobby can interact. At the same time we are exploring moving the residential off the knuckle to avoid the Safeway vehicle entry across the street
- How can you add to the pedestrian experience at the knuckle? How will the human activity be animated there? Outdoor uses related to the ground floor retail, pedestrian and residential passers-by and landscape design can help activate the area.
- How will one experience different geometries at the corner and at the knuckle. This will be developed and described later
- How will the garden roof tops be managed? More details will be coming at the next meeting
- What kind of retail will be interested in locating at this site? A restaurant may be a good fit and further research will determine other interested retail establishments.
- What is the width of the sidewalks? The architect quoted 16 feet on 22nd Avenue
- Describe the design relationship to the clinic building on Madison Street. How will the exit work there? The exit will be recessed with a transparent fence along the property line.
- What is the floor to floor height at the first floor retail? The floor to floor height is 13 feet.

Public Comments

Approximately 13 members of the public were present. Their comments included the following:

- The Safeway Summit building across 22nd Avenue still has vacant retail spaces on Madison Street. Please find a way that the retail spaces can be attractive enough to be rented.
- The light industrial building to the south appears to be only 2 feet off of the property line.
- The garden terrace at the second floor would give southern exposure and views to the south and possibly Mount Rainier if it was located on the south side of the building rather than on the east or the west facades.
- Scheme number 1 is a good scheme. The curved façade is interesting. Traffic on 22nd Avenue can move very fast and should have traffic calming measures. Encouraging pedestrians to activate 22nd Avenue is important. Opportunities for southern light to be captured in plazas or residential units would be a good design move.

Board Deliberations

- The Board shared initial reactions including curiosity and desire to see the site geometries fully explored and studied for best design solutions for the site, especially design of the ground plane. The site geometries include the orthographic intersection of 22nd Avenue and Madison Street, a somewhat unique form on Madison Street and the knuckle or jog of the property midway along the 22nd Avenue façade.
- A south facing garden terrace would help optimize the sites location and ability to provide solar access.
- Keep the wide sidewalk and use it to spill onto the site where possible.
- The residential lobby should be encourage more activity than as a simple pass through.
- Scheme One is preferred by the Board.
- Overhead weather protection should be provided along both streets and good quality materials should be used.
- Loading functions for the building need to be identified and integrated into the site and building.
- The corner at 22nd Avenue and Madison Street should have an appropriate architectural treatment.

DESIGN GUIDELINES.

A Site Planning

A-1 Responding to Site Characteristics. The siting of buildings should respond to specific site conditions and opportunities such as non-rectangular lots, location on prominent intersections, unusual topography, significant vegetation and views or other natural features.

Examine the unique site geometries and express them in an appropriate architectural manner. Consider the “knuckle” in this site in designing the ground plane to include special characteristics that could be gleaned from the unique site opportunities. Stories of the site history, uses and greats who may have played music on site are encouraged to be explored in

architectural expression and programmatic commitments such as practice studios, reduced rent programs, music performance or club settings.

A-2 Streetscape Compatibility

The siting of buildings should acknowledge and reinforce the existing desirable spatial characteristics of the right-of-way.

The current and commodious sidewalk on 22nd Avenue should be retained and enhanced by siting the building footprint to reinforce the open feeling and pedestrian scale.

A-4 Human Activity. New development should be sited and designed to encourage human activity along the street.

Retail spaces should engage the sidewalk and encourage transparency. The design should create level entries with the sidewalk for retail uses.

A-7 Residential Open Space. Residential projects should be sited to maximize opportunities for creating usable, attractive, well-integrated open space.

The Board wants to see the fourth floor south terrace well designed and utilized as well as for any roof top open space. The Board directed the applicant to create a garden terrace located on the south side rather than the east and west facing alternative shown in the edg packet schemes.

A-10 Corner Lots. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and public street fronts. Parking and automobile access should be located away from corners.

The Board expects to see a strong architectural solution at the corner of 22nd and Madison to be presented at the next meeting. This corner should communicate the resolution of the site geometries, history and position along Madison Street.

C Architectural Elements and Materials

C-3 Human Scale. The design of new buildings should incorporate architectural features, elements, and details to achieve a good human scale.

The street level design should have high quality materials, overhead weather protection and building to sidewalk relationships that work with the residential lobby and entry, sidewalk interface, and retail uses. The street level landscape design should be developed within a full definition of plants, paving, sculpture, public art, seating, water features etc.

C-4 Exterior Finish Materials.

Building exteriors should be constructed of durable and maintainable materials that are attractive even when viewed up close. Materials that have texture, pattern, or lend themselves to a high quality of detailing are encouraged.

The Board would like to see high quality materials for building materials on this project. Materials or material boards and color should be presented at the next design review meeting.

C-5 Structured Parking Entrances. The presence and appearance of garage entrances should be minimized so that they do not dominate the street frontage of a building.

The Board directed the applicant to study the garage entrance and the impacts on the sidewalk in light of the many users who will be frequenting the garage.

D Pedestrian Environment

D-1 Pedestrian Open Spaces and Entrances. Convenient and attractive access to the building's entry should be provided. To ensure comfort and security, paths and entry areas should be sufficiently lighted and entry areas should be protected from the weather. Opportunities for creating lively, pedestrian-oriented open space should be considered.

The Board directed the applicant to study the building façade curve and present a design that responds appropriately to the site geometries and at ground level ensures the comfort and security of the pedestrian spaces.

D-5 Visual Impacts of Parking Structures. The visibility of all at-grade parking structures or accessory parking garages should be minimized. The parking portion of a structure should be architecturally compatible with the rest of the structure and streetscape. Open parking spaces and carports should be screened from the street and adjacent properties.

The south façade of the building at grade is the parking level and should be designed with care to minimize the impact on the neighbor to the south and to create an interesting visual appearance.

D-9 Commercial Signage

Signs should add interest to the street front environment and should be appropriate for the scale and character desired in the area.

The applicant should bring a signage plan to the next meeting

D-12 Residential Entries and Transitions

The space between the residential entry and the sidewalk should provide security and privacy for residents and be visually interesting for pedestrians.

The residential entry and lobby should interface with other uses to make it a lively and attractive part of the development.

E Landscaping

E-3 Landscape Design to Address Special Site Conditions. The landscape design should take advantage of special on-site conditions such as high-bank front yards, steep slopes, view corridors, or existing significant trees and off-site conditions such as greenbelts, ravines, natural areas, and boulevards.

The Board directed the applicant to fully develop a striving and interesting landscape plan to enhance the building and site especially around the “knuckle”, the terraces, the corner streetscape, planting strips and other open spaces

The applicant is anticipating several development standard departure requests at this time. They may include relief from street level transparency, site triangles, and structural building overhangs. The Board will entertain departures from development standards if they help the project better meet the priority guidelines stated above.

The applicant applied for a Master Use Permit on November 13, 2007.

RECOMMENDATION MEETING – November 19, 2008

The Board was reconvened to consider the design response to the Early Design Guidance and to make recommendations to DPD on November 19, 2008.

Architect’s Presentation

Mithun Architects made the presentation to the Board and Public. The architect briefly reviewed the project site, vicinity uses, opportunities and constraints of the project site. He explained the design intent of the building forms, colors and massing. He presented the response of the architectural design to the site geometries and additional setback at the sidewalk level. He presented the separate open space areas where adjoining residents can step out onto small decks and the roof top open space available to all residents. The Landscape Architect presented the open space design and planting plans. The building is proposed to be clad in hardi panel used both vertically and horizontally and as an entry element. The architect showed the board drawings that describe the residential entry with a red wall element which extends from the inside of the residential lobby to the exterior as a way finding element. A permanent display related to the music history of the site will be installed in or near the lobby entry. The color palette is proposed to be a beige background which changes across the length of the building along with a bold accent red used in varying forms along the building façade.

Board Clarifying Questions

Board questions focused on construction details of hardi board cladding, window and corner details and the color palette. Questions continued regard soffit and reglet details, coping and venting hood chase locations. The Board asked for more details on the west façade composition. One Board member asked about the “knuckle” treatment and its visibility in the project entry sequence and sidewalk experience.

Public Comments

Approximately 14 members of the public attended the meeting. Several members of the public made comments. Their comments include the following:

- Plant mid-height plants at the north portion of 23rd Avenue. The larger plants would serve as a screen from vehicle headlights for the retail corner and any sidewalk café patrons.
- The red pillar at the residential entry could use some lighting.
- Change the red pillar at the residential entry to an all lighted pillar.
- The strong vertical bays of the building form are very good.
- The painted bays may be hard to maintain.
- There should be overhead weather protection for the public sidewalk and not just attached at the building for the retail/restaurant near the building.
- The west façade concrete plinth is too high and blank.
- The angled bays make an interesting facade.
- Study the penthouses and choose their color and detailing so they blend with the project.
- Please check that the façade ordering and composition includes the windows layout.

Board Deliberations

After visiting the site, considering the analysis of the site and context provided by the proponents, and hearing public comment, the Design Review Board members provided the siting and design guidance described below and identified by letter and number those siting and design guidelines found in the City of Seattle's *"Design Review: Guidelines for Commercial and Mixed Use Buildings"* of highest priority to this project.

Board Discussion

The Board began discussions by noting several topics of primary interest. Residential and retail entry spaces need to read better from Madison and as one travels along the sidewalk. They noted that the pedestrian environment needs to be more dynamic. There is an opportunity to develop a more striving design on the ground plane for public interaction and space making. A new design should open up more walk able and gathering surfaces areas and reduce some areas of landscaping to create a better circulation and open area for pedestrians. The red elements should have some relief, i.e. pop out from the building. The planting plan does not relate to the building architecture, the western elevation is not as well designed and it is a façade that is very visible.

The Board continued to deliberate and discuss the different facades of the building, the sidewalk and open space terraces and details of the building. They consulted the architects on different proposed design and construction aspects. The Board requested that a musical reference be used in the residential lobby at least. The board thought the existing weather protection plan was sufficient. The Board questioned the relationship of the building and the sidewalk and even suggested that the designers consider more musical reference along the 23rd Avenue façade to help the façade references "touch down" onto the sidewalk where it could become more

comprehensible at the ground level. The Board discussed how the garage entrance needs to have the garage door closed most of the day and night in order to provide a continuous façade along 23rd Avenue. They suggested a project condition to have the garage door operable by key card entry to help keep the garage door closed. The Board considered the proposed departures from development standards.

Summary of Requested Departures

Development Standard	Requirement	Proposed	Departure Amount	Comments	Board Action
SMC 23.53.035 A 4 c Structural Building Overhangs	9 feet along the leading edge	12 feet along the leading edge	3 feet	The code allows for 15 foot angled bay projections. A 12 rectangular bay allows for better space in the units and responds to the design language of the proposal.	Recommend approval
SMC 23.54.030 D2A2 Driveway width	Minimum width for two way traffic shall be 22 feet.	Decrease driveway width to 20 feet.	2 feet	Reducing the driveway width to 20 feet lessens the impact of 23 rd Avenue, users will be repeat users.	Recommend approval
SMC 23.54.030G Site Triangle	Site triangle shall be kept clear of obstructions	Use mirrors instead of sight triangle	full	Applicant will provide other means for pedestrian safety, for instance, mirrors, paving, lighting.	Recommend approval

After considering the proposed design and the project context, hearing public comment, and reviewing the design priorities, the Board feels that the guidance has been addressed by the applicant. The Board unanimously **recommends approval** of the departure requests to the Director. Conditions in the decision may include the following unless they are documented on up-dated MUP plans by the design team in advance of the publication of the director’s decision:

1. Provide a key card entry, or similar device to the vehicle garage.
2. Study options, and provide a solution for DPD review, to bring the musical references in the design elements to the ground plane. This could be a continuation of the red panels or something else.
3. Provide a musical interpretive display, or rotating musical interpretive displays, describing the music history of the site, or album cover art in the residential lobby.
4. Redesign the landscape along 23rd Avenue. Landscaping should be viewed in its largest definition of plants, sculpture, art, grade changes, seating, paving, place making. Have the landscape respond, signal or give way to the residential and retail entries. The landscaping should be dedicated more to providing more open areas and spaces for circulation and gathering. Also extend the paving pattern out into the right of way from the retail areas, too.

5. Provide notes on the MUP plans for a “pedestrian safety plan” at the vehicle garage entry. Mirrors, lights, stop signs, and change in paving should be considered.

H:\projects..godardh\SEPA\3006 files\3007358 recommendation.doc