

2014-15 Food Waste Ban Outreach to Minority and Immigrant and Refugee-Owned Restaurants and Grocery Stores

October 14, 2014

Project Objective

Provide support to minority and immigrant and refugee owned restaurants and grocery stores to help them achieve compliance with Seattle’s new ban on food waste in the garbage.

Summary of Approach

Audience

Focus the majority of efforts in Korean, Chinese, Vietnamese, Hispanic, Ethiopian, and Somali businesses due to high numbers of restaurants and grocery stores and limited English-speaking proficiency.

Include other minority and immigrant and refugee-owned businesses in broader education efforts, and provide additional support on an as needed basis. These audiences include African American, Indian, Pakistani, Arab or Middle Eastern, Japanese, Thai, Filipino, and Eastern European businesses.

In addition to restaurants and grocery stores, also provide support to minority and immigrant and refugee community and faith-based organizations that serve food in their facilities.

Outreach Strategies

The primary audiences will receive outreach through direct mail, ethnic media, in-depth technical assistance, and community meetings and events.

Secondary audiences will be included in the direct mail outreach, and also receive the standard level of education provided by SPU’s Green Business Program. They may also receive additional technical assistance on an as needed basis.

Outreach Methods	Approximate # Businesses Reached
Direct Mail	800
Ethnic Media	up to 500
Basic Green Business Program Outreach	tbd in Cascadia contract
In-Depth Tech Assistance for Restaurants and Grocery Stores	250
In-Depth Tech Assistance for Community & Faith-Based Orgs	20
Up to 15 Community Meetings & Events	150

Contracts and Partnerships

After reviewing the capacity of current consultant contracts and collecting input from community organizations and City staff, a mix of different contracts and partnerships may be best for this project.

- Increase funding in SPU’s Green Business Program contract to assist with Hispanic outreach, as well as provide some limited support for additional outreach and materials.
- Contract with the Department of Neighborhood’s Public Outreach and Engagement Liaisons (POEL) Program. The program is made up of trusted community advocates trained to engage and educate their communities about City programs and services.

- Contract with a few organizations serving key neighborhoods, including the International District and Little Saigon. Their staff will make introductions to businesses in their communities to ease the work of the POEL liaisons and other community partners. If staffing is available, they may also provide more in-depth technical assistance in place of the POEL liaisons.

Collaboration Opportunities

Develop a collaborative relationship with the Office of Economic Development’s new restaurant liaison in order to provide cross-referrals, and also establish a long-term system for reaching new restaurants and grocery stores as they open.

When feasible and appropriate, take advantage of the food waste ban outreach to move forward SPU’s commercial recycling, food+ packaging, clear alleys, and Green Business Program messaging.

Coordinate efforts with single and multifamily food waste ban outreach efforts to support a more holistic outreach approach within minority and immigrant and refugee communities.

Materials

Continue providing businesses with waste bins, samples of compostable bags, signage and bin stickers.

Modify the existing signage and handouts based on community input.

Tracking and Evaluation

Develop a list of minority and immigrant and refugee-owned restaurants, grocery stores, and community and faith-based organizations. Use the list to track progress towards establishing food waste collection programs at these facilities.

Track warnings and fines to identify businesses that need additional technical assistance.

Timeline, Staffing and Budget

2014 will focus on overall program planning and coordination, including developing contracts and partnerships, developing outreach materials, and purchasing supplies. There will also be some initial outreach, including direct mail, ethnic media, Hispanic business community outreach, and providing technical assistance to community and faith-based organizations. 2015 will transition from planning to full implementation of outreach strategies and program tracking.

Program development will take a significant amount of staff time in 2014, but staffing needs will reduce in 2015 once consultants begin work.

	2014	2015
Estimated Program Manager Staff Time	0.85 FTE	0.44 FTE
Estimated Non-Labor Budget	\$73,855	\$99,918

Audience

Based on best estimates, there are about 800 minority or immigrant and refugee-owned restaurants and grocery stores in Seattle.

Approximately 76% of the businesses are **Korean, Chinese, Vietnamese or Hispanic**-owned. Focusing 2014-15 outreach efforts on these larger business communities should result in the most efficient and effective use of funds.

About 3% of minority or immigrant and refugee-owned restaurants and grocery stores are **Ethiopian or Somali**-owned. Focusing funds in these communities will also be important since they are more recent arrivals with limited English-speaking proficiency.

Due to their smaller numbers and/or higher English-speaking proficiency, the following communities will continue receiving the existing level of support SPU provides through direct mail and the Green Business Program: **African American, Indian, Pakistani, Arab/Middle Eastern, Japanese, Thai, Filipino, and Eastern European**. In addition, SPU will look for opportunities to attend community meetings and events and provide more in-depth assistance as needed using SPU staff time.

Communities	Approx. %	Direct Mail	Ethnic Media	GBP Outreach	In-Depth Tech Asst	Community & Faith Orgs	Mtgs/ Events
Korean	29%	X	X		X	X	X
Chinese	20%	X	X		X	X	X
Vietnamese	14%	X	X		X	X	X
Hispanic	13%	X	X		X	X	X
Indian and Pakistani	7%	X		X	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>
Japanese	6%	X		X	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>
Arab/Middle Eastern	4%	X		X	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>
Ethiopian	2%	X	X		X	X	X
Somali	1%	X	X		X	X	X
African American	1%	X		X	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>
Thai	1%	X		X	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>
Filipino	<1%	X		X	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>
Cambodian/Khmer	<1%	X		X	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>
Pacific Islander	<1%	X		X	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>
Eastern European	<1%	X		X	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>	<i>as needed</i>

Outreach Strategies

1. **Direct Mail:** Many ethnic restaurants and grocery stores indicate that mail is a good form of communication for them. SPU will develop a list of immigrant and refugee and minority owned businesses for targeted mailings. The mailings will be multilingual, based on the languages likely to be spoken in a neighborhood or community. We will request input from community partners on the direct mail piece before finalizing it.

We will create the mailing list based on business owner surname and food type, but will need to adjust it over time as the information is fact-checked during site visits.

2. **Ethnic Media:** Community organizations suggested that media will be a very important strategy for reaching ethnic communities, including businesses. While at work, business owners and employees read the ethnic newspapers that are often distributed through their restaurants and stores, listen to ethnic radio stations in the kitchen, and watch ethnic television displayed in customer eating areas. SPU's Communications Plan includes an ethnic media focus that will be broad enough to encompass both the residential and commercial sectors.

SPU will also work with its community partners to include information in BIA and chamber newsletters.

3. **Green Business Program (GBP) Outreach:** SPU's current Green Business Program includes education on how to start food waste collection. This message will be expanded to explain the new requirements. The GBP will continue providing its current level of education to African American, Indian, Pakistani, Arab or Middle Eastern, Japanese, Thai, Filipino, and Eastern European-owned restaurants and grocery stores.
4. **In-Depth Technical Assistance:** The community has indicated a need for more in-depth technical assistance for immigrant and refugee-owned businesses with limited English-speaking skills. They face greater challenges with hauler communication and staff training. SPU will contract with community liaisons and organizations to conduct more in-depth technical assistance for Korean, Chinese, Vietnamese, Hispanic, Ethiopian, and Somali businesses. The number of site visits will vary based on what systems the business currently has in place, but we anticipate 2-5 visits (up to 5 hours total) per business in order to:

- *Inform:* explain the details of the new requirements and how it applies to their business
- *Inventory:* document what systems the business already has in place for food waste collection, recycling and food packaging, and where they need help
- *Provide Technical Assistance:* provide direct support to help businesses: 1) sign up for food waste collection; 2) right size their waste collection services; 3) apply for an exemption as appropriate; 4) order bins and signage through SPU; 5) set up bins and signage for best placement
- *Train:* conduct in-language staff training

In addition to community contracts, SPU staff will provide additional in-depth technical assistance to African American, Indian, Pakistani, Arab or Middle Eastern, Japanese, Thai, Filipino, and Eastern European-owned businesses on an as needed basis. The GBP will inform SPU of any businesses requiring a greater level of support.

- 5. Community & Faith-Based Organizations:** Beyond restaurants and grocery stores, there are also many minority and immigrant and refugee community and faith-based organizations serving food at their facilities through meal programs, community events, and food service establishments. SPU will provide them technical assistance, materials and staff training so they can establish successful food waste collection programs. These organizations can then serve as models within their communities, including for business owners who are involved in and attend events at the organizations.

Advantages: 1) creating a model that others in the community can learn from and follow; 2) begin developing relationships that can be built upon for multifamily and single family ban education; 3) create a sense that composting is the “norm” in the community; 4) potentially create advocates to promote composting to the community members visiting their facility; 5) potentially recruit community spokespeople for ethnic media.

- 6. Community Meetings and Events:** Community input indicates that it’s very difficult for small businesses to send employees to meetings and events, so it wouldn’t be an efficient use of SPU’s resources to arrange special meetings or events for this audience. However, we can still take advantage of existing meetings and events where businesses will already be in attendance. We will work with our community and City partners to identify opportunities where community liaisons and/or SPU staff can present or have information tables.

In addition to providing information at events, SPU can also begin offering technical assistance to help the organizers of minority and immigrant and refugee community events set up the recycling and food waste collection bins for their events. The community also indicated interested in having visual signage included with the event bins SPU loans out, which SPU is already planning to create.

- 7. Recognition:** Work with community partners to identify neighborhood events and publications that could provide an opportunity for recognizing businesses that are doing a great job with their food waste collection programs.

Contracts & Partnerships

- 1. DON’s Public Outreach and Engagement Liaisons (POEL) Program:** Submit an application to DON to request liaisons from the following communities: Korean, Vietnamese, Chinese (Mandarin and Cantonese speakers), Ethiopian and Eritrean (Amharic and Tigrinya speakers), and Somali. The liaisons will serve as the primary outreach staff for these communities after receiving training on how to assist businesses with establishing a successful food waste collection program.

If DON does not approve our POEL application, we will contract with individual community-based organizations and/or add the work to the 2015 Green Business Program contract.

Advantages: 1) a single MOA that encompasses multiple communities; 2) DON manages the contract, freeing up SPU staff time; 3) a fiscal agent (Seattle Neighborhood Group) that is experienced in contracting with the City; 4) trusted advocates from the community who are already familiar with City programs and services.

2. **Neighborhood Organizations:** Contracts or partnerships with a few key organizations that have influence in neighborhoods with a large number of ethnically owned businesses. These organizations will go door-to-door with the POEL liaisons for the first site visit to make the introductions, provide follow-up support as needed, and arrange for the liaison to present at neighborhood meetings. If staffing is available, the neighborhood organizations may also provide the in-depth technical assistance instead of the POEL liaisons.

Both the Chinatown-ID BIA and Friends of Little Saigon have expressed interest in partnering to assist businesses in their neighborhoods.

Advantages: 1) provides SPU with the backing of organizations with existing influence and relationships within the community; 2) allows organizations to be included as partners at a level that won't overwhelm their limited staffing resources.

3. **Green Business Program (GBP) Consultants (Cascadia + Subs):**

- a. The GBP will be testing out a new liaison model ("promotoras") for the Hispanic business community. Increase funds for this portion of the contract so the promotoras can serve the same function as the POEL liaisons within the Hispanic community.
- b. The GBP has a sub-consultant that works for the Rainier Beach Merchants Association. Increase funds in that portion of the contract for the sub to support POEL liaisons by making introductions to businesses in the Rainier Beach area. The sub will serve the same function as other local organizations, such as the Chinatown-ID BIA.
- c. The GBP will continue reaching out to minority and immigrant and refugee-owned restaurants and grocery stores as part of its regular outreach program. GBP staff will be directed to get an initial assessment of the food waste collection program at these businesses, and provide this information to the appropriate community liaison or SPU staff for follow-up. SPU will also provide Cascadia with list of businesses visited by the POELs in order to ensure good coordination.

Collaboration Opportunities

1. **Office of Economic Development (OED):** OED has a new restaurant liaison, Jennifer Tam, who is interested in coordinating efforts with SPU.
 - a. Provide basic cross training with OED staff and SPU's POEL, CBO and GBP consultants so they're familiar with each department's programs. Provide referrals to each other as appropriate.
 - b. Work with OED to establish a long-term system for helping new restaurants and grocery stores establish food waste collection and recycling programs as they open.
2. **SPU's Green Business Program (GBP):** Provide basic training to the POEL liaisons on the other GBP focus areas (water conservation, drainage, energy). The purpose of the training will be for the liaisons to be equipped to make referrals if a business asks about another program. Include training about potential issues with using garbage disposals instead of composting food waste.
3. **SPU's Commercial Recycling Program:** The City recently implemented new commercial recycling requirements. SPU will incorporate this messaging into the food waste ban education to ethnic

restaurants and grocery stores, and provide technical assistance as needed to help improve recycling at businesses.

4. **SPU's Commercial Food Waste Prevention Program:** SPU is interested in developing a program to help businesses divert edible food from the waste stream through donations and/or food waste prevention strategies. Incorporate this messaging into the larger food waste ban efforts.
5. **SPU's Food+ Packaging Program:**
 - a. Provide basic training to the POEL liaisons on the food packaging requirements. As part of their initial assessment, the liaisons will document the types of packaging currently used at each business they visit and make referrals as needed to the GBP. The liaisons will not conduct food packaging enforcement visits or fill out enforcement forms.
 - b. Collect input from businesses on the list of product exemptions for the proposed compostable packaging ordinance. Potentially recruit some businesses to participate in testing the performance of compostable packaging for different food types.
6. **SPU's Clear Alleys Program:** Based on their assigned locations, provide basic training to the POEL liaisons on the Clear Alleys Program, including a point of contact for referring questions and concerns.
7. **SPU's Single and Multifamily Food Waste Ban Education:**
 - a. Potentially use the same POEL liaisons and other community organizations to assist with outreach to both commercial and residential communities.
 - b. Coordinate with EJSE to work with community and faith-based organizations. Help them establish successful compost collection programs, while also identifying opportunities for educating the community members who visit to their facilities.
 - c. Coordinate with Brett and the Food Waste Ban Outreach Team to establish ethnic media messaging that encompass both residential and commercial sectors.
 - d. Identify community event collaboration opportunities where it makes sense to include both residential and commercial food waste ban messaging.

Challenges

1. **Food Waste Collection Haulers:** One of the biggest challenges ethnic restaurants and grocery stores have is communicating with the food waste collection haulers. SPU's Green Business Program currently connects businesses with haulers in two ways:
 - a. *Give the business the phone numbers of all the haulers.* The problem with this method has been that the haulers don't have the language capacity to communicate with limited English-speaking customers. Also, Waste Management's call center staff often provides misinformation because they don't understand the options available in Seattle.
 - b. *Send an email to all the haulers telling them to follow up with a business that would like to start food waste collection.* The lack of language capacity continues to be an issue. In addition, while Cedar Grove is usually responsive to referrals, Waste Management and CleanScapes often don't follow up with the customer. This prevents the customer from having the opportunity to compare quotes and get the best price for their business.

Once a business has food waste collection established, language barriers continue to be a problem with the haulers. Customers have difficulty calling to change their service levels or report missed collections.

SPU will meet with the haulers to brainstorm strategies to make it easier for ethnic businesses to set up collection and communicate with the haulers. Some options may include:

- Establish a single point of contact for each hauler that will receive and follow up on referrals in a consistent and timely manner. Set up a language line account that the point of contacts can use for interpretation on phone calls.
- Get a price sheet from all the haulers so the businesses don't need to contact each hauler individually for quotes.
- Have the liaison function as an interpreter to assist the business in contacting the hauler(s) and establishing collection. We will be careful to focus on interpretation and let the business owner make the decisions, so as to minimize the City's role in the business transaction.

2. **Property Managers:** Businesses have expressed concern about their property managers potentially being unwilling to establish food waste collection service. Part of the door-to-door technical assistance will include working with property managers to make sure they understand the requirements of the law and help them as needed to establish collection service or find a space for tenant bins.

Materials

1. **Free Waste Bins and Compostable Bags:** Continue providing free bins and a sample of compostable bags for the kitchen and customer eating areas. Only deliver bins once the business has established collection service. This will alleviate the problem we have seen where some businesses have the bins set up inside, but never established collection service so put it all in the garbage anyway.
2. **Bi-lingual Signage and Stickers:** Continue providing free signage and bin stickers. Update the signage based on community input, and create bi-lingual versions for kitchen staff and customers.

After making some initial modifications, SPU will request additional input from community partners before finalizing and printing for 2015 distribution.

3. **Bi-lingual Handouts:**
 - a. Modify the existing commercial food packaging and recycling handout to include an explanation of the food waste ban requirements
 - b. Modify the existing "How much of your garbage can be recycled or composted?" handout:
 - Update the data in the flyer, including estimating in bag costs when determining savings
 - Provide information on options for diverting edible food
 - Create a version for the Clear Alleys Program
 - Create a bi-lingual version for each community that highlights one of their own businesses
 - c. Hauler price sheets (if possible)
 - d. List of compostable bag vendors

Tracking & Evaluation

- 1. Tracking List:** Develop a list of minority and immigrant and refugee-owned restaurants, grocery stores, and community and faith-based organizations. Use the following data sources: Public Health food service establishment list, surname list, curbside commercial organics customers, and Green Business Program Salesforce database. Update the list based on fact-checking during site visits. Use the list to track progress on businesses establishing food waste collection programs.
- 2. Warnings and Fines:** On a quarterly basis, request the list of businesses that have received warnings and/or fines. Compare to the ethnic restaurants and grocery stores list to determine which businesses may need additional support.

Timeline

COORDINATION & PLANNING	2014 Q3	2015 Q1	2015 Q2	2015 Q3	2015 Q4	2016+
1. Work within the Food Waste Ban Outreach Team to develop an ethnic media plan and identify coordination opportunities between sectors						
2. Work with the haulers to resolve communication challenges experienced by ethnic businesses						
3. Work with OED restaurant liaison to plan cross training and begin establishing support for new restaurants and grocery stores						
4. Continue meetings with City and community stakeholders for additional input (DON District Coordinators, Food Lifeline, etc.)						
MATERIALS	2014 Q3	2015 Q1	2015 Q2	2015 Q3	2015 Q4	2016+
5. Create, translate and mail a multilingual direct mail piece	Dec		May			
6. Purchase bins and compostable bags						
7. Revise, translate and print signage and bin stickers						
8. Revise, translate and print handouts						
9. Create signage for event bins						
CONSULTANTS & PARTNERS	2014 Q3	2015 Q1	2015 Q2	2015 Q3	2015 Q4	2016+
10. Amend GBP contract with Cascadia						
11. Develop MOAs with DON/POEL liaisons and 2-4 community organizations serving neighborhoods with a high number of ethnic restaurants and grocery stores		By Jan 30				
CONSULTANTS & PARTNERS	2014 Q3	2015 Q1	2015 Q2	2015 Q3	2015 Q4	2016+
12. Train Cascadia outreach staff to begin door-to-door technical assistance						
13. Train POEL liaisons and other community outreach staff and partners		By Feb 13				
14. Work with consultants to develop in-language training for restaurant and grocery store staff		By Mar 13				
DATA & TRACKING	2014 Q3	2015 Q1	2015 Q2	2015 Q3	2015 Q4	2016+
15. Compile list of ethnically owned restaurants and grocery stores (updates ongoing)						

DATA & TRACKING	2014 Q3	2015 Q1	2015 Q2	2015 Q3	2015 Q4	2016+
16. Compile list of community and faith-based orgs that serve minority and immigrant and refugee communities; request service levels from Liz Kain to help prioritize sites with higher food waste potential						
17. Compile contact list of ethnic and neighborhood business organizations						
18. Update SalesForce to include ethnicity and expand the language options						
19. Develop a tracking form for door-to-door outreach						
20. Track progress on businesses establishing food waste collection programs						
21. Monitor warnings and fines to identify additional outreach focus areas						
OUTREACH	2014 Q3	2015 Q1	2015 Q2	2015 Q3	2015 Q4	2016+
22. Implement ethnic media plan	Dec	Jan	May/Jun			
23. Send information about the ban to business organizations to share with their members	Dec		May/Jun			
24. Assist community and faith-based orgs with establishing food waste collection programs						
25. Provide door-to-door technical assistance to businesses	Cascadia only	All partners ->				
26. Collect input from businesses on compostable product exemptions as part of regular outreach						
27. Identify and attend existing community meetings and events to present or table						
28. Work with partners to identify opportunities to recognize businesses in their communities						
29. Provide technical assistance to help with bin setup at ethnic community events						

Staffing

PM = the Customer Programs Division Program Manager that will be assigned to lead the ethnic restaurant and grocery store project

Tasks	Nov/Dec 2014			2015		
	PM	Pat/Tom	Jake	PM	Pat/Tom	Jake
Program management	16			100		
Planning and coordination	48	20		100	48	
Data and tracking	48	3		70		
Contract administration	80	10		288	12	
Training consultants	8	5		50	10	
Supply management	4	10	20	5	10	100
Ethnic media input	4	4		8	4	
Direct mail	8	8		8	8	
Signage and bin stickers	8	15				
Event bin signage		1	5			3
2 printed handouts	16	19				
Community and faith-orgs support	25	6		60	6	
Door-to-door tech assistance				150		
Community meetings/events	6	3		40	6	
Business recognition				40		
Event bin technical assistance						30
TOTAL HOURS	271	104	25	919	104	133
FTE	0.85	0.33	0.08	0.44	0.05	0.06

Budget

Consultant Contracts	2014	2015	TOTAL
Cascadia (including Subs)	\$16,917	\$14,500	\$31,417
DON's POEL Liaisons		\$64,360	\$64,360
2-4 Neighborhood Organizations		\$14,820	\$14,820
Materials			
Printed Materials (direct mail, signage, handouts)	\$11,438	\$3,938	\$15,376
Supplies (bins, lids, compostable bags)	\$45,500		\$45,500
TOTAL	\$73,855	\$97,618	\$171,473