

# CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE

## Task Force Meeting

**Tuesday, January 13, 2009, 2:00 pm – 5:30 pm**

City Hall, Bertha Knight Landes Room

600 4th Ave, Seattle, WA 98124

### MEETING SUMMARY

*Prepared by Triangle Associates, Inc.*

#### Attendance

Green Building Task Force				
Last	First	Organization	Committee	In Attendance?
Adelstein	Aaron	Master Builders Association/Built Green	New	✓
Anderson	Jolene	Coldwell Banker Bain, Assoc., JMR Consulting, Member, Seattle King-County Association of Realtors	Existing	✓
Awad	Ash	McKinstry	Existing	✓ (and Matt Wegworth)
Barber	Kent	Keithly Barber Associates, Inc.	Existing	✓
Bendix	Richard	Homestreet Bank	Existing	✓
Brombaugh	Rachel	ShoreBank Enterprise Cascadia	Existing	✓
Brooker	Kathleen	Historic Seattle	Existing	✓
Chase	Patricia	International Sustainable Solutions	New	<input type="checkbox"/>
Clark	Steve	Genesee Fuel & Heating, Board member, Washington Oil Marketers Association	Existing	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dinndorf	Jerry	Associated General Contractors	New	✓
Dolwick	Carrie	NW Energy Coalition	New	<input type="checkbox"/>
Drummond	Susan	Foster Pepper, PLLC	New	✓
Drury	Kim	Energy Consultant	Existing	✓
Dunn	Liz	Dunn+Hobbs	New	<input type="checkbox"/>
Elwell	Chris	Building Construction Trades Council (BCTC)	New	<input type="checkbox"/>
Fairchild	Aaron	Greenworks Realty	Existing	✓ (and Ben Kaufman)
Finley	Scott	Atmosphere IEM, Inc.	Existing	✓
Frank	Kari-Lynn	NAIOP	New	✓
Frankel	Mark	New Buildings Institute	New	<input type="checkbox"/>
Gent	Stan	Seattle Steam	Existing	✓
Gregory	Bert	Mithun	New	<input type="checkbox"/>
Gunter	Christian	Kennedy Associates	Existing	<input type="checkbox"/>
Happel	Richard	University Mechanical Contractors	Existing	<input type="checkbox"/>
Hoerler	Dusty	Sound Alliance	Existing	✓
Horn	Don	US General Services Administration	New	✓
Howe	Douglas	Touchstone Corporation	New	✓
Humphreys	Beth	King County Department of Natural Resources	Existing	✓

**CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE**  
**Meeting Summary, January 13, 2009**

<b>Green Building Task Force</b>				
<b>Last</b>	<b>First</b>	<b>Organization</b>	<b>Committee</b>	<b>In Attendance?</b>
Jhaveri	Arun	Certified Sustainable Development Professional	Existing	✓
Jonlin	Duane	NBBJ	New	✓
Kauffman	Rod	BOMA Seattle-King County	Existing	<input type="checkbox"/>
Lesley-Lloyd	Karen	Tenant's Union of Washington State	Existing	✓
Littel	John	Pacific NW Council of Carpenters	Existing	<input type="checkbox"/>
Lopez	Jim	King County Executive's Office	Existing	<input type="checkbox"/>
Lowe	Marco	Triad Development	New	✓
Mackintosh	Joanne	American Society of Home Inspectors	Existing	✓
Mann	Kelly	Urban Land Institute - Seattle	New	✓
Marseille	Tom	Stantec Consulting	New	✓
McCumber	Mary	Futurewise	New	✓
McLennan	Jason	Cascadia GBC	New	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mitra	Anindita	American Planning Association	New	✓
Powers	John	Colliers International	New	✓
Price	Stan	Northwest Energy Efficiency Council	Existing	✓
Pryde	Curt	Pryde-Johnson	New	<input type="checkbox"/>
Purcell	Paul	Beacon Development Group	New	✓
Putnam	Cynthia	Putnam Price Group, Inc.	Existing	✓
Richmond	Lisa	AIA Seattle	New	✓
Schuster	Mark	The Schuster Group	New	✓
Shirley	Cal	Puget Sound Energy	Existing	✓
Southard	Patti	King County GreenTools	New	✓
Stolarski	Bob	Puget Sound Energy	New	✓
Tierney	Tom	Seattle Housing Authority	Existing	✓
Trafton	Chuck	WA Land Title Association	Existing	✓
Vasquez	Pedro	Jones Lang LaSalle Americas Inc.	Existing	<input type="checkbox"/>

<b>City of Seattle</b>			
<b>Last</b>	<b>First</b>	<b>Department</b>	<b>In Attendance?</b>
Antonoff	Jayson	Seattle DPD	✓
Atwood	Glenn	Seattle City Light	✓
Baker	Rebecca	Seattle DPD	✓
Calvillo	Sarah	Seattle Fleets & Facilities	✓
Dobrovolny	Peter	Seattle DPD	✓
Eichel	Amanda	Seattle OSE	✓
Gastil	Ray	Seattle DPD	✓
Houghton	Matt	Seattle Office of Economic Development	✓
Howard	Sandy	Seattle DPD	✓
Hsu	David	Seattle City Light	✓
Indig	Harry	Seattle DPD	✓
Justad	Alan	Seattle DPD	✓
Mann	Mike	Seattle OSE	✓
Nguyen	My Tam	Seattle DPD	✓
Simmons	Jill	Seattle OSE	✓
Sugimura	Diane	Seattle DPD	✓

CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE  
Meeting Summary, January 13, 2009

<b>Consultant Staff</b>			
<b>Last</b>	<b>First</b>	<b>Organization</b>	<b>In Attendance?</b>
Blair	Ellen	Triangle Associates	✓
Bonham-Carter	Claire	EDAW	✓
Erickson	Peter	Stockholm Environment Institute	✓
Grodnik	Ann	Seattle Northwest Securities	✓
Kern	Michael	Triangle Associates	✓

<b>General Public</b>			
<b>Last</b>	<b>First</b>	<b>Organization</b>	<b>In Attendance?</b>
Balderston	Tom	Conservation Services Group	✓
Bangs	David	Home Performance Washington	✓
Bell	Ronny		✓
Birkeland	Paul	Integrated Renewable Energy	✓
Byrne	Daniel	Energy Retrofit, Inc.	✓
Cole	Claire	Public Health MPH, UW	✓
Ellison	Richard	Saveseattletrees.org	✓
Gardner	Jaebadiah		✓
Granryd	Linnea	Tetra Tech – WJA	✓
Heywood	Nancy	IA Interior Architects	✓
Jordan	Aman		✓
Lai	Sam	Lai Real Estate Appraisals, Ltd.	✓
Manuel	Peg	Tetra Tech – WJA	✓
McCormick	Erin	Public Health MPH	✓
Melinkovich	Tara	Public Health Student, UW	✓
Noland	Stacy	Moontown Foundation	✓
Parsley	Kim	IA Interior Architects	✓
Quach	Cuong Henry	Tetra Tech, Inc.	✓
Ramirez	Luke	Tetra Tech, Inc.	✓
Smith	Darryl	S.C.G.I. and Windermere Real Estate	✓
Wiersma	Brent	Energy Retrofit, Inc.	✓

### Meeting Purpose

The purpose of this meeting was to review and discuss the draft recommended approaches for meeting the Mayor's energy efficiency goals.

### Agenda Review and Updates

Facilitator Michael Kern of Triangle Associates opened the meeting and noted there would be time available at the end of the meeting for public comment. Michael reviewed the agenda and meeting materials.

Jayson Antonoff, City of Seattle Department of Planning and Development (DPD), provided an update about an information request from the New Buildings Committee:

**CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE**  
**Meeting Summary, January 13, 2009**

- The New Buildings Committee has requested information about the relative level of permit activity for different sizes of projects. The City has not historically captured the size of projects and is continuing to work to find a way to tease out this information. Any references to building size in the draft recommendation to the Mayor are placeholders that could change as the City gains a better understanding of the relative level of permit activity for different sizes of projects.

Amanda Eichel, City of Seattle Office of Sustainability and Environment (OSE), gave a brief presentation about the level of energy efficiency improvement that is expected in Seattle as a result of existing programs and market trends and how it compares to the City's energy efficiency goals. She said that current energy use for all building types is increasing over time, likely due to some combination of occupant behavior and structural efficiency. Under the new Seattle City Light conservation plan, City Light projects are expected to save roughly 19% of load through electricity efficiency by 2020, which equates to a roughly 10% savings for total energy use. This means that an additional 10 to 11% in energy savings is needed to achieve an increase of 20% in the energy efficiency of Seattle's commercial and residential buildings by 2020. Amanda's PowerPoint presentation is available on the Green Building Task Force website.

#### **Welcome & Brief Remarks**

Mayor Greg Nickels thanked Green Building Task Force members for their time and hard work over the previous six months. He noted that the country looks to Seattle for innovation and creativity on climate change. He said he wants Seattle to benefit from the economic opportunity presented by moving our reliance on energy sources away from fossil fuels, and fundamentally shifting our culture from one of conspicuous consumption to conspicuous conservation.

The Mayor answered questions from Task Force members and from members of the public about the rationale of focusing on the energy efficiency aspect of green building, the City's urban forestry program, and the Mayor's plans to organize a U.S. Conference of Mayors meeting that will focus on energy, clean technology, and related topics.

#### **Draft Recommended Approach to Meeting the City's Energy Efficiency Goals**

Jayson presented the draft package of energy efficiency policies for new buildings and major renovations to be recommended to the Mayor. He said the intent is to use the energy code to establish the lowest level of acceptable performance, with stringency increased over time to reach the City's energy efficiency goal; incentives will be used to reward those who go beyond code. Amanda presented the draft package of energy efficiency policies for existing buildings to be recommended to the Mayor. Recommended policies rely on making energy performance information available to consumers as a way to drive the market towards greater energy conservation. Jayson's and Amanda's PowerPoint presentation is available on the Green Building Task Force website.

#### **Discussion of Draft Recommended Approaches**

Jayson and Amanda posed several questions to the Task Force regarding the draft package of energy efficiency policies.

CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE  
Meeting Summary, January 13, 2009

Overall Questions

- Are we doing enough to reach the City's goals? Too much?
- Do we have "coverage" through the building "lifecycle" and across sectors (single family residential, multifamily residential, commercial/institutional)?

New Buildings

- To implement a feebate, does it make more sense to work to change Washington law or to find another mechanism?
- What would accountability look like for both parties for a priority green program? Is a performance bond appropriate? Should the City be subject to a penalty if it does not perform as promised?

Existing Buildings

- Measurement/disclosure, single family residential, small multifamily residential
  - Who should pay for an energy performance audit?
  - Who should conduct the audit?
  - How should the disclosure requirement be enforced?
  - Are there jurisdictional issues?
  - How can we incentivize increased energy conservation? Early action?
  - Would there be value in a pilot phase?
  - How might a pilot be structured?
  - How can we address equity within this policy?
- Measurement/disclosure, large multifamily residential commercial/institutional
  - How can we incentivize continued high levels of performance?
  - Should an audit requirement be triggered at a certain level of performance?
  - How can we be sure to credit good work in conservation that has already been accomplished?
- Energy Efficiency Fund
  - What is the best role for use of public dollars?
    - Loan guarantees
    - On-bill financing
    - Invest in public-private funding pool
  - Should there be a minimum level of investment required to access public financing?

**Overall Questions: Are we doing enough to reach the City's goals? Too much?**

A Task Force member asked City staff if they expect the draft recommended approach to achieve the City's energy efficiency goal for new buildings. Jayson said that tying energy codes to the City's goals is intended to ensure that the goal is met. He said that a feebate is the only other policy considered that could potentially achieve the City's energy efficiency goal for new buildings. With regard to existing buildings, staff believe that disclosure is a good first step towards identifying opportunities for energy conservation.

CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE  
Meeting Summary, January 13, 2009

Some Task Force members said the policy package needs to be bolder in order for the City to maintain a leadership role in energy efficiency. Multiple Task Force members said the City should make stronger recommendations on feebate and district energy policies, such as recommending a district energy pilot project.

Other Task Force members cautioned the City to be realistic about the costs that the market can bear.

**Overall Questions: Do we have “coverage” through the building “lifecycle” and across sectors (single family residential, multifamily residential, commercial/institutional)?**

There were no comments on this topic.

**New Buildings: To implement a feebate, does it make more sense to work to change Washington law or to find another mechanism?**

A Task Force member suggested that one alternative might be to design a combined fee incentive in cooperation with the utilities.

**New Buildings: What would accountability look like for both parties for a priority green program? Is a performance bond appropriate? Should the City be subject to a penalty if it does not perform as promised?**

In response to a question, Jayson explained that under the City's current density bonus program for the downtown area, project proponents must commit to receiving Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) Silver certification in order to participate. Project proponents are penalized if LEED Silver is not achieved, with penalties based on the number of points the project falls short. A Task Force member expressed support for this system of accountability.

Multiple Task Force members said that the City should be liable for a cash penalty if priority permitting is delayed. A cash penalty that offsets the additional time on the market was suggested.

**Existing Buildings: Measurement/disclosure, single family residential, small multifamily residential**

- **Who should pay for an energy performance audit?**
- **Who should conduct the audit?**
- **How should the disclosure requirement be enforced?**
- **Are there jurisdictional issues?**
- **How can we incentivize increased energy conservation? Early action?**
- **Would there be value in a pilot phase?**
- **How might a pilot be structured?**
- **How can we address equity within this policy?**

Task Force members debated whether audits and disclosure should be mandatory at time of sale, or voluntary with an emphasis on homeowner education. One Task Force member said that voluntary early action should be incentivized. Some Task Force members said that mandatory disclosure at time of sale would improve the transaction by providing more information, would help homeowners

CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE  
Meeting Summary, January 13, 2009

identify ways to save money on energy, and would be an important way to target relatively easy efficiency improvements that are available in the residential market.

Some Task Force members expressed support for City financing for energy efficiency improvements, though they disagreed as to whether the financing should be associated with a mandate or a voluntary incentive. A Task Force member suggested that the utilities should finance energy efficiency improvements based on the anticipated cost savings to the homeowner, with the homeowner responsible to pay back the investment.

A Task Force member calculated that paying for audits at time of sale would be a manageable cost for the City and could be accomplished by a small number of auditors. Another Task Force member suggested disclosure of monthly energy bills at point of sale, at least until an audit policy is finalized.

To incent early action, Task Force members said homeowners need to be made aware of existing programs, such as an existing realtor program that uses a portion of the commission on real estate transactions to fund an audit.

**Existing Buildings: Measurement/disclosure, large multifamily residential commercial/institutional**

- **How can we incentivize continued high levels of performance?**
- **Should an audit requirement be triggered at a certain level of performance?**
- **How can we be sure to credit good work in conservation that has already been accomplished?**

A Task Force member commented that if energy performance scores are required at some point, early work in conservation will be reflected in a better score.

**Existing Buildings: Energy Efficiency Fund**

- **What is the best role for use of public dollars?**
  - **Loan guarantees**
  - **On-bill financing**
  - **Invest in public-private funding pool**
- **Should there be a minimum level of investment required to access public financing?**

A Task Force member expressed support for loan guarantees to enhance credit, saying that on-bill financing will not enhance credit as effectively unless the utility is willing to shut off a customer's energy supply.

A Task Force member said that the solution to funding and financing, particularly for non-residential buildings, is to use third-party energy services companies and energy savings performance contracts, which can be used to fund simple upgrades as well as more complex measures like on-site generation and district heating.

CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE  
Meeting Summary, January 13, 2009

## **General Comments**

### Feebate

A Task Force member emphasized that a feebate program featuring strong incentives tied to predictable performance levels or standards would be attractive to developers. The member said that any post-occupancy evaluation for new buildings should be informational only and not tied to developer incentives. In response to a question, Jayson said that no decision has been made about what performance level or standard would earn an incentive.

### Energy Code

A Task Force member stressed that uniformity and equity are important in the commercial market and asked where an update to the commercial energy code ranked in the City of Seattle's overall list of state legislative priorities.

Task Force members debated whether a more stringent energy code would pose an undue burden to property owners conducting major renovations. One Task Force member cautioned that, since utility incentives are provided only for performance that exceeds code requirements, if the energy code requirements are raised too much the City might unintentionally undermine existing utility incentives to go beyond code. Another noted that property owners already have to meet new code during major renovations, so this would be no different.

### Cost/Benefit Analysis

In response to a question, Jayson said that no decision has been made about whether to base cost/benefit decisions on lifecycle costs or simple payback. Task Force members stressed that a standard cost-benefit analysis process must be applied uniformly.

### Performance Standards

Task Force members asked what performance standards are being considered for residential and non-residential policies. Jayson said that specific performance standards have not yet been identified. A Task Force member encouraged the City to accept multiple performance standards. Another Task Force member said that higher quality, performance-based standards will be necessary to achieve the City's energy efficiency goals. Amanda said that City staff would likely communicate with members of the Task Force individually about appropriate performance standards as energy efficiency policy moves toward implementation.

### Incentives

Task Force members said that utilities offer good incentives, some of which may be underutilized. They urged City staff to thoroughly inventory all existing utility incentives, look at which incentives are being used and how much money is available to invest, and identify programs that need to be better promoted.

CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE  
Meeting Summary, January 13, 2009

Existing Buildings - Other

A Task Force member asked the City to consider how enforcement will work for non-electricity energy conservation measures and suggested that existing commercial buildings be subject to retro-commissioning every few years.

**Public Comment**

Michael invited members of the public to comment:

- **Stacy Noland, Moontown Foundation**, said that government agencies and businesses around the country look to Seattle for leadership in energy efficiency work, and he encouraged the City to continue to lead the nation.
- **Aman Jordan, landlord and prospective property buyer, and Ronny Bell** expressed support for measurement and disclosure at point of sale.
- **Paul Birkeland, Integrated Renewable Energy**, expressed support for mandating an energy performance score as a consumer rights issue.
- **Sam Lai, Lai Real Estate Appraisals, Ltd.**, expressed support for measurement and disclosure as a way to provide necessary data to property owners as the culture increasingly values energy conservation.
- **Darrel Smith, Realtor**, expressed support for mandatory residential energy audits with funding assistance made available.
- **Tom Balderston, Conservation Services Group**, also expressed support for mandatory energy audits at point of sale with financing made available. Mr. Balderston said the key is to make sure the information is provided to the parties early in the transaction process.

**Wrap-Up**

Mike Mann, Acting Director of OSE, thanked the Task Force members for their input. He noted that there had been little discussion of, or opposition to, mandated energy performance for large multifamily residential or commercial buildings, but that the City has noted the concern about mandates for single family residential and small multifamily residential. He also noted that several Task Force members had expressed interest in bolder action on district energy.

Diane Sugimura, Director of DPD, thanked the Task Force members for their participation. She said that the City of Seattle wants to continue to provide leadership in energy efficiency and the Task Force's input will help the City understand how to do so while benefitting the economy.

In response to Task Force member comments, Mike proposed that the Task Force be allowed the opportunity to review the more specific recommendations to the Mayor that will be developed. City staff will develop more specific recommendations for both new and existing buildings and provide them to Task Force members by January 30 for review and comment. Task Force members may provide comments on the specific recommendations through February 6 by the following means:

1. Online comment boards on the Task Force website
2. [GBTF\\_public@seattle.gov](mailto:GBTF_public@seattle.gov) email address

CITY OF SEATTLE MAYOR'S GREEN BUILDING TASK FORCE  
Meeting Summary, January 13, 2009

3. Email directly to Jayson Antonoff ([jayson.antonoff@seattle.gov](mailto:jayson.antonoff@seattle.gov)) or Amanda Eichel ([Amanda.eichel@seattle.gov](mailto:Amanda.eichel@seattle.gov))
4. Formal comment letter to Jayson or Amanda.

City staff will present their recommendations to the Mayor on February 13 and will distribute a “Final Draft Staff Recommendation” to Task Force members in early March.