



## City of Seattle

Edward B. Murray, Mayor

---

### Department of Planning and Development

D. M. Sugimura, Director

## CITY OF SEATTLE ANALYSIS AND DECISION OF THE DIRECTOR OF THE DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT

**Application Number:** 3014704, 3017027, 3018467, 3018468

**Applicant Name:** Mark Wierenga for Holgate Townhomes LP

**Address of Proposal:** 2407 S Holgate St  
1909 25<sup>th</sup> Avenue South  
1908 24<sup>th</sup> Avenue South  
2423 South Holgate Street

### SUMMARY OF PROPOSED ACTIONS

3014704 (2407 S Holgate St.): Land Use Application to allow two, three-story townhouse structures--- one, two-unit and one four-unit (six total units). Parking for four vehicles to be provided. Existing structures to be demolished. To be considered with project # 3018467. Associated Lot Boundary Adjustment 3017920.

3018467 (1908 24<sup>th</sup> Avenue S.): Land use application to allow two, three-story townhouse structures---one, three-unit and one, four-unit (seven units total). Parking for seven vehicles to be provided. Existing structures to be demolished. To be considered with Project # 3014704. Associated Lot Boundary Adjustment #3017920.

3017027 (1909 25<sup>th</sup> Ave. S.): Land use application to allow two, three-story townhouse structures--- one, four-unit and one, five-unit (nine total units). Parking for nine vehicles to be provided. Existing structures to be demolished. To be considered with # 3018468. Associated Lot Boundary Adjustment 3017923.

3018468 (2423 S. Holgate St.): Land use application to allow two, three-story townhouse structures---one two-unit and one, four-unit (six total units). Parking for four vehicles to be provided. Existing structures to be demolished. To be considered with project # 3017027. Associated Lot Boundary Adjustment #3017923.

The properties addressed as 2407 S Holgate St (3014704) and 1908 24<sup>th</sup> Ave S (3018467) constitute one development site. Any subdivision of these two lots will require a full unit lot subdivision if the number of unit lots created exceeds a combined total of 9.

The properties addressed as 2423 S Holgate St (3018468) and 1909 25<sup>th</sup> Ave S (3017027) constitute one development site. Any subdivision of these two lots will require a full unit lot subdivision if the number of unit lots created exceeds a combined total of 9.

The following approvals are required:

**Design Review - Seattle Municipal Code (SMC) Section 23.41**

### **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

The applicant proposes a cluster of 28 townhouses fronting S. Holgate St., 24<sup>th</sup> Ave S. and 25<sup>th</sup> Ave S., straddling a north/south alley between the two avenues. The grouping of six structures would be loosely arranged along a series of drive courts and walkways. Vehicular access would occur from the alley into the drive court, directly into garages off the alley and from a series of curb cuts on 24<sup>th</sup> and 25<sup>th</sup> Avenues leading into enclosed garages. Some townhouses have direct pedestrian access from the surrounding rights of way or on the interior pathways shared with vehicles.

### **SITE & VICINITY**

The two sites, across an alley from one another, total 12,003 square feet and 14,884 sq. ft. respectively. Five single family residences occupy the properties. There are no mapped environmental critical areas.

The subject site, located on the north half of the block bound by 24th Avenue S, 25th Avenue S, S Holgate Street and S Plum Street, consists of two developments on either side of a shared north/south alley. DPD Project numbers 3014704/3018467 are located on the west side of the alley. Project numbers 3017027/3018468 are located on the east side of the alley.

The subject lots and properties to the south, east, and west are located within the Commercial One (C1-40) zone with a height limit of 40 feet. Properties to the north, across S Holgate Street, are located in a Lowrise One (LR1) multifamily zone. The subject properties are located two blocks east of Rainier Ave S.

Rainier Avenue S serves as a primary north/south transportation corridor. This corridor contains more intensive development including larger commercial and mixed use projects. The lots to the east of Rainier Avenue S, including the subject sites, are developed with a variety of single family homes, newer townhouse units, multi-story residential apartment buildings, institutional facilities and social service uses, including the American Red Cross and Lighthouse for the Blind. The housing types include newer wood frame apartment and townhouse structures, and one to two story single family homes.

### **ANALYSIS - DESIGN REVIEW**

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

The public voiced the following concerns during the public comment portion of the Early Design Guidance meeting:

- Site design would benefit from dedicated ground level amenity space that is separated from the vehicular circulation. Suggested changing the garage location for Units 27 and 28 to provide dedicated amenity space.
- Expressed concern about the location of solid waste and recycling staging on the collection day.
- Questioned how the alley would be improved, the full length or only the portion abutting the lots proposed for development.
- Suggested a unified planting palette for street trees on 24<sup>th</sup> Avenue S to provide continuity along the back front. Noted that the surrounding lots provide cherry trees.
- The new buildings will block natural light to the live/work units to the south. Noted that live work units have a substantial amount of tall windows in the kitchen, living room and bedroom.
- Concerned about the appearance of the stair penthouse. Would like to see the stair penthouse minimized.
- Neighborhood safety and visual appearance should be a top priority.
- Full street improvements should be provided.
- Direct sun light should be maintained for adjacent properties across S Holgate Street.
- There are a number of unresolved complaints pertaining to the site's existing structures.
- Would like to see a barrier at the edges of the rooftop decks to keep people from falling off.

## **GUIDELINES**

After visiting the site, considering the analysis of the site and context provided by the proponent, and hearing public comment, the Design Review Board members provided the siting and design guidance described below and identified highest priority by letter and number from the guidelines found in the City of Seattle's "Design Review: Guidelines for Downtown" and "Design Guidelines for the Belltown Urban Center Village".

## **PRIORITIES**

<b>CONTEXT &amp; SITE</b>
---------------------------

**CS1 Natural Systems and Site Features: Use natural systems/features of the site and its surroundings as a starting point for project design.**

### **CS1-B Sunlight and Natural Ventilation**

**CS1-B-2. Daylight and Shading:** Maximize daylight for interior and exterior spaces and minimize shading on adjacent sites through the placement and/or design of structures on site.

### **CS1-C Topography**

**CS1-C-2. Elevation Changes:** Use the existing site topography when locating structures and open spaces on the site.

### **CS1-D Plants and Habitat**

**CS1-D-1. On-Site Features:** Incorporate on-site natural habitats and landscape elements into project design and connect those features to existing networks of open spaces and natural habitats wherever possible. Consider relocating significant trees and vegetation if retention is not feasible.

**CS2 Urban Pattern and Form: Strengthen the most desirable forms, characteristics, and patterns of the streets, block faces, and open spaces in the surrounding area.**

**CS2-B Adjacent Sites, Streets, and Open Spaces**

**CS2-B-2. Connection to the Street:** Identify opportunities for the project to make a strong connection to the street and public realm.

*The Board directed the applicant to maximize ground level amenity spaces at the perimeter and corners of the site (Other applicable guidelines CS2-C1, DC3-A, B and C, DC4-D).*

**CS2-B-3. Character of Open Space:** Contribute to the character and proportion of surrounding open spaces.

**CS2-C Relationship to the Block**

**CS2-C-1. Corner Sites:** Corner sites can serve as gateways or focal points; both require careful detailing at the first three floors due to their high visibility from two or more streets and long distances.

**CS2-D Height, Bulk, and Scale**

**CS2-D-1. Existing Development and Zoning:** Review the height, bulk, and scale of neighboring buildings as well as the scale of development anticipated by zoning for the area to determine an appropriate complement and/or transition.

**CS2-D-2. Existing Site Features:** Use changes in topography, site shape, and vegetation or structures to help make a successful fit with adjacent properties.

**CS2-D-3. Zone Transitions:** For projects located at the edge of different zones, provide an appropriate transition or complement to the adjacent zone(s). Projects should create a step in perceived height, bulk and scale between the anticipated development potential of the adjacent zone and the proposed development.

**CS2-D-4. Massing Choices:** Strive for a successful transition between zones where a project abuts a less intense zone.

**CS2-D-5. Respect for Adjacent Sites:** Respect adjacent properties with design and site planning to minimize disrupting the privacy of residents in adjacent buildings.

*The Board felt the site design and massing must address the relationship to the live work units directly south, addressed at 1909 25<sup>th</sup> Avenue S. For the Recommendation Meeting, the Board requested a privacy study including a site plan, floor plans, a section and a window overlay study showing how the proposed building will relate to the existing units to the south.*

*The Board noted the site design and building massing in the southeast corner must explore the interrelationship of the existing and proposed structure. The Board noted the massing should evolve to maximize natural light between the structures. The Board felt a complementary relationship could be achieved in a variety of ways including an upper level setback, modulation, material application, fenestration, window location, and maintaining existing mature vegetation (Other applicable guideline DC2).*

**CS3 Architectural Context and Character: Contribute to the architectural character of the neighborhood.**

**CS3-A Emphasizing Positive Neighborhood Attributes**

**CS3-A-4. Evolving Neighborhoods:** In neighborhoods where architectural character is evolving or otherwise in transition, explore ways for new development to establish a positive and desirable context for others to build upon in the future.

## PUBLIC LIFE

### **PL1 Connectivity: Complement and contribute to the network of open spaces around the site and the connections among them.**

#### **PL1-B Walkways and Connections**

**PL1-B-1. Pedestrian Infrastructure:** Connect on-site pedestrian walkways with existing public and private pedestrian infrastructure, thereby supporting pedestrian connections within and outside the project.

**PL1-B-3. Pedestrian Amenities:** Opportunities for creating lively, pedestrian oriented open spaces to enliven the area and attract interest and interaction with the site and building should be considered.

#### **PL1-C Outdoor Uses and Activities**

**PL1-C-1. Selecting Activity Areas:** Concentrate activity areas in places with sunny exposure, views across spaces, and in direct line with pedestrian routes.

**PL1-C-2. Informal Community Uses:** In addition to places for walking and sitting, consider including space for informal community use such as performances, farmer's markets, kiosks and community bulletin boards, cafes, or street vending.

**PL1-C-3. Year-Round Activity:** Where possible, include features in open spaces for activities beyond daylight hours and throughout the seasons of the year, especially in neighborhood centers where active open space will contribute vibrancy, economic health, and public safety.

### **PL2 Walkability: Create a safe and comfortable walking environment that is easy to navigate and well-connected to existing pedestrian walkways and features.**

#### **PL2-B Safety and Security**

**PL2-B-1. Eyes on the Street:** Create a safe environment by providing lines of sight and encouraging natural surveillance.

**PL2-B-2. Lighting for Safety:** Provide lighting at sufficient lumen intensities and scales, including pathway illumination, pedestrian and entry lighting, and/or security lights.

**PL2-B-3. Street-Level Transparency:** Ensure transparency of street-level uses (for uses such as nonresidential uses or residential lobbies), where appropriate, by keeping views open into spaces behind walls or plantings, at corners, or along narrow passageways.

### **PL3 Street-Level Interaction: Encourage human interaction and activity at the street-level with clear connections to building entries and edges.**

#### **PL3-A Entries**

**PL3-A-3. Individual Entries:** Ground-related housing should be scaled and detailed appropriately to provide for a more intimate type of entry.

*The Board would like the applicant to investigate use of more regular stoop, as provided on S Holgate Street, on the 24<sup>th</sup> Ave S and 25<sup>th</sup> Avenue S facades. The Board noted each entry must be treated to be distinguishable.*

**PL3-A-4. Ensemble of Elements:** Design the entry as a collection of coordinated elements including the door(s), overhead features, ground surface, landscaping, lighting, and other features.

**PL3-B Residential Edges**

**PL3-B-1. Security and Privacy:** Provide security and privacy for residential buildings through the use of a buffer or semi-private space between the development and the street or neighboring buildings.

**PL3-B-2. Ground-level Residential:** Privacy and security issues are particularly important in buildings with ground-level housing, both at entries and where windows are located overlooking the street.

**PL3-B-4. Interaction:** Provide opportunities for interaction among residents and neighbors.

*The Board noted the setbacks between the building and the street property line should provide a transitional experience from the public sidewalk to the private residential entry. The transition should include an ensemble of elements including but not limited to overhead features, ground surface, landscaping and lighting (Other applicable guideline PL2-B).*

**PL4 Active Transportation: Incorporate design features that facilitate active forms of transportation such as walking, bicycling, and use of transit.**

**PL4-B Planning Ahead for Bicyclists**

**PL4-B-2. Bike Facilities:** Facilities such as bike racks and storage, bike share stations, shower facilities and lockers for bicyclists should be located to maximize convenience, security, and safety.

*For the Recommendation Meeting, the Board would like to see more information about the location of private and shared bike facilities.*

**DESIGN CONCEPT**

**DC1 Project Uses and Activities: Optimize the arrangement of uses and activities on site.**

**DC1-A Arrangement of Interior Uses**

**DC1-A-4. Views and Connections:** Locate interior uses and activities to take advantage of views and physical connections to exterior spaces and uses.

*The Board expressed concern about the location of the bedroom at street-level, street-facing facade. The Board felt the success of the ground level design required an active use at street level to provide a connection between the unit, sidewalk and ground level amenity spaces (Other applicable guidelines PL2-B, PL3-B1 and B2).*

**DC1-B Vehicular Access and Circulation**

**DC1-B-1. Access Location and Design:** Choose locations for vehicular access, service uses, and delivery areas that minimize conflict between vehicles and non-motorists wherever possible. Emphasize use of the sidewalk for pedestrians, and create safe and attractive conditions for pedestrians, bicyclists, and drivers.

*The Board applauded the use of a woonerf to provide residential amenity spaces, pedestrian circulation, car access and landscaping. At the Recommendation Meeting the Board requested additional details for the programming of the space, paving, lighting and landscaping. The Board noted that the space must be designed to function for all users. The Board also requested vignettes demonstrating the experience of different sections of the woonerf space. (Guidelines also applicable: PL2-B, DC1-C, DC3-B, DC3-C, DC3-D).*

*The Board noted the requested street access departure was directly linked to providing dedicated amenity spaces, without cars, within the woonerf. For the Recommendation Meeting the Board requested a woonerf design with dedicated ground level amenity spaces. (Applicable guidelines DC1-C3, DC3)*

*The Board requested additional information about the treatment of the alley including a section of the finished alley elevation.*

### **DC1-C Parking and Service Uses**

**DC1-C-2. Visual Impacts:** Reduce the visual impacts of parking lots, parking structures, entrances, and related signs and equipment as much as possible.

*The Board noted dedicated amenity space could be achieved by flipping units 27/28 with 25/26. Locating access and parking along the street for the two most southern units provides an opportunity for a dedicated amenity space in the SE corner of the site. The Board also felt additional variety in unit orientation from an east/west orientation to a north south orientation would provide additional opportunities to activate the street façade, adds variety in massing and garage location, and provides more dedicated amenity space areas.*

**DC1-C-3. Multiple Uses:** Design parking areas to serve multiple uses such as children's play space, outdoor gathering areas, sports courts, woonerf, or common space in multifamily projects.

**DC1-C-4. Service Uses:** Locate and design service entries, loading docks, and trash receptacles away from pedestrian areas or to a less visible portion of the site to reduce possible impacts of these facilities on building aesthetics and pedestrian circulation.

*The Board was concerned about the location for solid waste and recycling storage spaces. The Board directed the applicant to work with Liz Kain at Seattle Public Utilities to determine location of solid waste pick up. At the Recommendation Meeting the Board requested more information about the location of long term storage and staging on pick up day. The Board felt storage and staging areas should be consolidated to minimize impacts on the use of the site and neighbors.*

### **DC2 Architectural Concept: Develop an architectural concept that will result in a unified and functional design that fits well on the site and within its surroundings.**

*The Board supported the architectural concept presented but wished to see a sense of variety within common group of materials. The Board felt the architectural concept should evolve to provide diversity in the building expression, which may include a range of colors and textures*

## **DC2-A Massing**

**DC2-A-1. Site Characteristics and Uses:** Arrange the mass of the building taking into consideration the characteristics of the site and the proposed uses of the building and its open space.

**DC2-A-2. Reducing Perceived Mass:** Use secondary architectural elements to reduce the perceived mass of larger projects.

*The Board directed the applicant to investigate a variety of unit layouts. The Board noted the resulting changes in massing would help define individual units while also reducing the perceived mass of the long street façades (DC2-A and B).*

## **DC2-B Architectural and Facade Composition**

**DC2-B-1. Façade Composition:** Design all building facades—including alleys and visible roofs—considering the composition and architectural expression of the building as a whole. Ensure that all facades are attractive and well-proportioned.

**DC2-B-2. Blank Walls:** Avoid large blank walls along visible façades wherever possible. Where expanses of blank walls, retaining walls, or garage facades are unavoidable, include uses or design treatments at the street level that have human scale and are designed for pedestrians.

## **DC2-C Secondary Architectural Features**

**DC2-C-1. Visual Depth and Interest:** Add depth to facades where appropriate by incorporating balconies, canopies, awnings, decks, or other secondary elements into the façade design. Add detailing at the street level in order to create interest for the pedestrian and encourage active street life and window shopping (in retail areas).

**DC2-C-2. Dual Purpose Elements:** Consider architectural features that can be dual purpose—adding depth, texture, and scale as well as serving other project functions.

**DC2-C-3. Fit With Neighboring Buildings:** Use design elements to achieve a successful fit between a building and its neighbors.

## **DC2-D Scale and Texture**

**DC2-D-1. Human Scale:** Incorporate architectural features, elements, and details that are of human scale into the building facades, entries, retaining walls, courtyards, and exterior spaces in a manner that is consistent with the overall architectural concept

**DC2-D-2. Texture:** Design the character of the building, as expressed in the form, scale, and materials, to strive for a fine-grained scale, or “texture,” particularly at the street level and other areas where pedestrians predominate.

## **DC2-E Form and Function**

**DC2-E-1. Legibility and Flexibility:** Strive for a balance between building use legibility and flexibility. Design buildings such that their primary functions and uses can be readily determined from the exterior, making the building easy to access and understand. At the same time, design flexibility into the building so that it may remain useful over time even as specific programmatic needs evolve.

**DC3 Open Space Concept: Integrate open space design with the building design so that they complement each other.**

## **DC3-A Building-Open Space Relationship**

**DC3-A-1. Interior/Exterior Fit:** Develop an open space concept in conjunction with the architectural concept to ensure that interior and exterior spaces relate well to each other and support the functions of the development.

## **DC3-B Open Space Uses and Activities**

**DC3-B-1. Meeting User Needs:** Plan the size, uses, activities, and features of each open space to meet the needs of expected users, ensuring each space has a purpose and function.

**DC3-B-2. Matching Uses to Conditions:** Respond to changing environmental conditions such as seasonal and daily light and weather shifts through open space design and/or programming of open space activities.

**DC3-B-3. Connections to Other Open Space:** Site and design project-related open spaces to connect with, or enhance, the uses and activities of other nearby public open space where appropriate.

**DC3-B-4. Multifamily Open Space:** Design common and private open spaces in multifamily projects for use by all residents to encourage physical activity and social interaction.

### **DC3-C Design**

**DC3-C-1. Reinforce Existing Open Space:** Where a strong open space concept exists in the neighborhood, reinforce existing character and patterns of street tree planting, buffers or treatment of topographic changes. Where no strong patterns exist, initiate a strong open space concept that other projects can build upon in the future.

**DC3-C-2. Amenities/Features:** Create attractive outdoor spaces suited to the uses envisioned for the project.

**DC3-C-3. Support Natural Areas:** Create an open space design that retains and enhances onsite natural areas and connects to natural areas that may exist off-site and may provide habitat for wildlife.

## **DC4 Exterior Elements and Finishes: Use appropriate and high quality elements and finishes for the building and its open spaces.**

### **DC4-A Exterior Elements and Finishes**

**DC4-A-1. Exterior Finish Materials:** Building exteriors should be constructed of durable and maintainable materials that are attractive even when viewed up close. Materials that have texture, pattern, or lend themselves to a high quality of detailing are encouraged.

**DC4-A-2. Climate Appropriateness:** Select durable and attractive materials that will age well in Seattle's climate, taking special care to detail corners, edges, and transitions.

### **DC4-C Lighting**

**DC4-C-1. Functions:** Use lighting both to increase site safety in all locations used by pedestrians and to highlight architectural or landscape details and features such as entries, signs, canopies, plantings, and art.

**DC4-C-2. Avoiding Glare:** Design project lighting based upon the uses on and off site, taking care to provide illumination to serve building needs while avoiding off-site night glare and light pollution.

### **DC4-D Trees, Landscape, and Hardscape Materials**

**DC4-D-1. Choice of Plant Materials:** Reinforce the overall architectural and open space design concepts through the selection of landscape materials.

*The Board would like to see the site design maintain as many existing trees on the south property line remain as possible. The Board noted the existing trees provide privacy and also help mitigate height, bulk and scale impacts for the units to the south (Other applicable guideline CS2-D).*

**DC4-D-2. Hardscape Materials:** Use exterior courtyards, plazas, and other hard surfaced areas as an opportunity to add color, texture, and/or pattern and enliven public areas through the use of distinctive and durable paving materials. Use permeable materials wherever possible.

**DC4-D-3. Long Range Planning:** Select plants that upon maturity will be of appropriate size, scale, and shape to contribute to the site as intended.

**DC4-D-4. Place Making:** Create a landscape design that helps define spaces with significant elements such as trees.

## **MASTER USE PERMIT APPLICATION**

The applicant revised the design and applied for a Master Use Permit with a Design Review component on October 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2014.

## **DESIGN REVIEW BOARD RECOMMENDATION**

The Design Review Board conducted a Final Recommendation Meeting on February 10, 2015 to review the applicant's formal project proposal developed in response to the previously identified priorities. At the public meetings, site plans, elevations, floor plans, landscaping plans, and computer renderings of the proposed exterior materials were presented for the Board members' consideration.

### **Public Comments**

No public comments were offered at the Recommendation Meeting.

## **CONTEXT & SITE**

**CS1 Natural Systems and Site Features: Use natural systems/features of the site and its surroundings as a starting point for project design.**

### **CS1-B Sunlight and Natural Ventilation**

**CS1-B-2. Daylight and Shading:** Maximize daylight for interior and exterior spaces and minimize shading on adjacent sites through the placement and/or design of structures on site.

### **CS1-C Topography**

**CS1-C-2. Elevation Changes:** Use the existing site topography when locating structures and open spaces on the site.

### **CS1-D Plants and Habitat**

**CS1-D-1. On-Site Features:** Incorporate on-site natural habitats and landscape elements into project design and connect those features to existing networks of open spaces and natural habitats wherever possible. Consider relocating significant trees and vegetation if retention is not feasible.

**CS2 Urban Pattern and Form: Strengthen the most desirable forms, characteristics, and patterns of the streets, block faces, and open spaces in the surrounding area.**

### **CS2-B Adjacent Sites, Streets, and Open Spaces**

**CS2-B-2. Connection to the Street:** Identify opportunities for the project to make a strong connection to the street and public realm.

**CS2-B-3. Character of Open Space:** Contribute to the character and proportion of surrounding open spaces.

**CS2-C Relationship to the Block**

**CS2-C-1. Corner Sites:** Corner sites can serve as gateways or focal points; both require careful detailing at the first three floors due to their high visibility from two or more streets and long distances.

**CS2-D Height, Bulk, and Scale**

**CS2-D-1. Existing Development and Zoning:** Review the height, bulk, and scale of neighboring buildings as well as the scale of development anticipated by zoning for the area to determine an appropriate complement and/or transition.

**CS2-D-2. Existing Site Features:** Use changes in topography, site shape, and vegetation or structures to help make a successful fit with adjacent properties.

**CS2-D-3. Zone Transitions:** For projects located at the edge of different zones, provide an appropriate transition or complement to the adjacent zone(s). Projects should create a step in perceived height, bulk and scale between the anticipated development potential of the adjacent zone and the proposed development.

**CS2-D-4. Massing Choices:** Strive for a successful transition between zones where a project abuts a less intense zone.

**CS2-D-5. Respect for Adjacent Sites:** Respect adjacent properties with design and site planning to minimize disrupting the privacy of residents in adjacent buildings.

**CS3 Architectural Context and Character: Contribute to the architectural character of the neighborhood.**

**CS3-A Emphasizing Positive Neighborhood Attributes**

**CS3-A-4. Evolving Neighborhoods:** In neighborhoods where architectural character is evolving or otherwise in transition, explore ways for new development to establish a positive and desirable context for others to build upon in the future.

**PUBLIC LIFE**

**PL1 Connectivity: Complement and contribute to the network of open spaces around the site and the connections among them.**

**PL1-B Walkways and Connections**

**PL1-B-1. Pedestrian Infrastructure:** Connect on-site pedestrian walkways with existing public and private pedestrian infrastructure, thereby supporting pedestrian connections within and outside the project.

**PL1-B-3. Pedestrian Amenities:** Opportunities for creating lively, pedestrian oriented open spaces to enliven the area and attract interest and interaction with the site and building should be considered.

**PL1-C Outdoor Uses and Activities**

**PL1-C-1. Selecting Activity Areas:** Concentrate activity areas in places with sunny exposure, views across spaces, and in direct line with pedestrian routes.

**PL1-C-2. Informal Community Uses:** In addition to places for walking and sitting, consider including space for informal community use such as performances, farmer's markets, kiosks and community bulletin boards, cafes, or street vending.

**PL1-C-3. Year-Round Activity:** Where possible, include features in open spaces for activities beyond daylight hours and throughout the seasons of the year, especially in neighborhood centers where active open space will contribute vibrancy, economic health, and public safety.

**PL2 Walkability: Create a safe and comfortable walking environment that is easy to navigate and well-connected to existing pedestrian walkways and features.**

**PL2-A Accessibility**

**PL2-A-1. Access for All:** Provide access for people of all abilities in a manner that is fully integrated into the project design. Design entries and other primary access points such that all visitors can be greeted and welcomed through the front door.

**PL2-A-2. Access Challenges:** Add features to assist pedestrians in navigating sloped sites, long blocks, or other challenges.

**PL2-B Safety and Security**

**PL2-B-1. Eyes on the Street:** Create a safe environment by providing lines of sight and encouraging natural surveillance.

**PL2-B-2. Lighting for Safety:** Provide lighting at sufficient lumen intensities and scales, including pathway illumination, pedestrian and entry lighting, and/or security lights.

**PL2-B-3. Street-Level Transparency:** Ensure transparency of street-level uses (for uses such as nonresidential uses or residential lobbies), where appropriate, by keeping views open into spaces behind walls or plantings, at corners, or along narrow passageways.

**PL3 Street-Level Interaction: Encourage human interaction and activity at the street-level with clear connections to building entries and edges.**

**PL3-A Entries**

**PL3-A-3. Individual Entries:** Ground-related housing should be scaled and detailed appropriately to provide for a more intimate type of entry.

**PL3-A-4. Ensemble of Elements:** Design the entry as a collection of coordinated elements including the door(s), overhead features, ground surface, landscaping, lighting, and other features.

**PL3-B Residential Edges**

**PL3-B-1. Security and Privacy:** Provide security and privacy for residential buildings through the use of a buffer or semi-private space between the development and the street or neighboring buildings.

**PL3-B-2. Ground-level Residential:** Privacy and security issues are particularly important in buildings with ground-level housing, both at entries and where windows are located overlooking the street.

**PL3-B-4. Interaction:** Provide opportunities for interaction among residents and neighbors.

**PL4 Active Transportation: Incorporate design features that facilitate active forms of transportation such as walking, bicycling, and use of transit.**

**PL4-B Planning Ahead for Bicyclists**

**PL4-B-2. Bike Facilities:** Facilities such as bike racks and storage, bike share stations, shower facilities and lockers for bicyclists should be located to maximize convenience, security, and safety.

**DESIGN CONCEPT**

**DC1 Project Uses and Activities: Optimize the arrangement of uses and activities on site.**

**DC1-A Arrangement of Interior Uses**

**DC1-A-4. Views and Connections:** Locate interior uses and activities to take advantage of views and physical connections to exterior spaces and uses.

*The Board was concerned that units lacked ground level living space to activate the street. The Board recommended a condition to locate the primary living space, including living room and kitchen, at ground level, for the two corner units #1 and 22.*

*The Board also noted that there were very few units accessible from the street given the topography changes. The Board recommended a condition that the two corner units, #1 and 22, be rolling accessible from Holgate Street (Other applicable guidelines CS2- B, PL2-A1).*

#### **DC1-B Vehicular Access and Circulation**

**DC1-B-1. Access Location and Design:** Choose locations for vehicular access, service uses, and delivery areas that minimize conflict between vehicles and non-motorists wherever possible. Emphasize use of the sidewalk for pedestrians, and create safe and attractive conditions for pedestrians, bicyclists, and drivers.

*The Board was pleased with the design of the woonerf space which included a variety of traffic calming devices such as paving, landscaping, boulders and raised residential entries.*

- a) *The Board expressed concern about the paver design which delineated a pedestrian walkway through the space. The Board agreed that a less rigid paver design would help the entire woonerf space read as a pedestrian walkway*
- b) *The Board recommended a condition to modify the paver color to provide more contrast with the concrete.*
- c) *The Board recommended a condition to modify the paver pattern with the woonerf space to remove defined walkways, create a pedestrian oriented pattern across the entire woonerf space, add visual interest, and eliminate areas that appear as informal concrete parking spaces.*
- d) *The Board suggested the pavers could be designed as a geometric or organic pattern that reinforces the landscape design within the woonerf space. (Other applicable guidelines PL1- B, PL2-B, DC1-B, DC1-C, DC3-C, DC3-D, and DC1-C)*

#### **DC1-C Parking and Service Uses**

**DC1-C-2. Visual Impacts:** Reduce the visual impacts of parking lots, parking structures, entrances, and related signs and equipment as much as possible.

*The Board was pleased with the retention of the existing tree and increased landscaping in the southeast corner of the site. The landscape buffer provides privacy for the development to the south. The Board noted the amenity space in the southeast corner of the site appeared inadequate. In order to facilitate a larger space, the garage locations for multiple units should be modified. The Board recommended a condition to provide a combined curb cut, with separate street-facing garages, along 25<sup>th</sup> Avenue S, for Unit 27 and 28. Remove the single curb cut for Unit 25 along 25<sup>th</sup> Avenue S (Other applicable guidelines DC1-B, DC3-A).*

**DC1-C-3. Multiple Uses:** Design parking areas to serve multiple uses such as children’s play space, outdoor gathering areas, sports courts, woonerf, or common space in multifamily projects.

**DC1-C-4. Service Uses:** Locate and design service entries, loading docks, and trash receptacles away from pedestrian areas or to a less visible portion of the site to reduce possible impacts of these facilities on building aesthetics and pedestrian circulation.

*The Board was satisfied with the proposed solid waste staging locations along the alley and in dedicated areas along the street.*

**DC2 Architectural Concept: Develop an architectural concept that will result in a unified and functional design that fits well on the site and within its surroundings.**

**DC2-AMassing**

**DC2-A-1. Site Characteristics and Uses:** Arrange the mass of the building taking into consideration the characteristics of the site and the proposed uses of the building and its open space.

*The Board was pleased with the response to the Early Design Guidance. The Board felt the massing location, with the reduced street setback, provided a strong street wall consistent with the commercial zoning. The provided setbacks, with individual stoops and landscape buffers, create a residential street experience consistent with lowrise zoning to the north. The Board agreed the reduced massing at the corners and the second level decks adjacent to the pedestrian pathways along Holgate Street were very successful for the overall composition.*

**DC2-A-2. Reducing Perceived Mass:** Use secondary architectural elements to reduce the perceived mass of larger projects.

**DC2-B Architectural and Facade Composition**

**DC2-B-1. Façade Composition:** Design all building facades—including alleys and visible roofs— considering the composition and architectural expression of the building as a whole. Ensure that all facades are attractive and well-proportioned.

**DC2-B-2. Blank Walls:** Avoid large blank walls along visible façades wherever possible. Where expanses of blank walls, retaining walls, or garage facades are unavoidable, include uses or design treatments at the street level that have human scale and are designed for pedestrians.

**DC2-C Secondary Architectural Features**

**DC2-C-1. Visual Depth and Interest:** Add depth to facades where appropriate by incorporating balconies, canopies, awnings, decks, or other secondary elements into the façade design. Add detailing at the street level in order to create interest for the pedestrian and encourage active street life and window shopping (in retail areas).

**DC2-C-2. Dual Purpose Elements:** Consider architectural features that can be dual purpose— adding depth, texture, and scale as well as serving other project functions.

**DC2-C-3. Fit With Neighboring Buildings:** Use design elements to achieve a successful fit between a building and its neighbors.

**DC2-D Scale and Texture**

**DC2-D-1. Human Scale:** Incorporate architectural features, elements, and details that are of human scale into the building facades, entries, retaining walls, courtyards, and exterior spaces in a manner that is consistent with the overall architectural concept

**DC2-D-2. Texture:** Design the character of the building, as expressed in the form, scale, and materials, to strive for a fine-grained scale, or “texture,” particularly at the street level and other areas where pedestrians predominate.

### **DC2-E Form and Function**

**DC2-E-1. Legibility and Flexibility:** Strive for a balance between building use legibility and flexibility. Design buildings such that their primary functions and uses can be readily determined from the exterior, making the building easy to access and understand. At the same time, design flexibility into the building so that it may remain useful over time even as specific programmatic needs evolve.

## **DC3 Open Space Concept: Integrate open space design with the building design so that they complement each other.**

### **DC3-A Building-Open Space Relationship**

**DC3-A-1. Interior/Exterior Fit:** Develop an open space concept in conjunction with the architectural concept to ensure that interior and exterior spaces relate well to each other and support the functions of the development.

### **DC3-B Open Space Uses and Activities**

**DC3-B-1. Meeting User Needs:** Plan the size, uses, activities, and features of each open space to meet the needs of expected users, ensuring each space has a purpose and function.

**DC3-B-2. Matching Uses to Conditions:** Respond to changing environmental conditions such as seasonal and daily light and weather shifts through open space design and/or programming of open space activities.

**DC3-B-3. Connections to Other Open Space:** Site and design project-related open spaces to connect with, or enhance, the uses and activities of other nearby public open space where appropriate.

**DC3-B-4. Multifamily Open Space:** Design common and private open spaces in multifamily projects for use by all residents to encourage physical activity and social interaction.

### **DC3-C Design**

**DC3-C-1. Reinforce Existing Open Space:** Where a strong open space concept exists in the neighborhood, reinforce existing character and patterns of street tree planting, buffers or treatment of topographic changes. Where no strong patterns exist, initiate a strong open space concept that other projects can build upon in the future.

**DC3-C-2. Amenities/Features:** Create attractive outdoor spaces suited to the uses envisioned for the project.

**DC3-C-3. Support Natural Areas:** Create an open space design that retains and enhances onsite natural areas and connects to natural areas that may exist off-site and may provide habitat for wildlife.

## **DC4 Exterior Elements and Finishes: Use appropriate and high quality elements and finishes for the building and its open spaces.**

### **DC4-A Exterior Elements and Finishes**

**DC4-A-1. Exterior Finish Materials:** Building exteriors should be constructed of durable and maintainable materials that are attractive even when viewed up close. Materials that have texture, pattern, or lend themselves to a high quality of detailing are encouraged.

*The Board was satisfied with the choice of materials and the variation in material application among buildings. The material palette featured metal cladding, small lap tan siding, dark, medium and light grey panels. Accent panels of green, blue, orange, red and stained cedar are added to each building to provide an individual character.*

**DC4-A-2. Climate Appropriateness:** Select durable and attractive materials that will age well in Seattle's climate, taking special care to detail corners, edges, and transitions.

#### **DC4-CLighting**

**DC4-C-1. Functions:** Use lighting both to increase site safety in all locations used by pedestrians and to highlight architectural or landscape details and features such as entries, signs, canopies, plantings, and art.

*The Board noted that the woonerf should be easily identified from the alley at night. The Board recommended a condition to locate 4 bollard lights, 2 on either side of the alley, near the location of the proposed trees, to define the vehicular entry from the alley (Other applicable guideline DC1-B).*

**DC4-C-2. Avoiding Glare:** Design project lighting based upon the uses on and off site, taking care to provide illumination to serve building needs while avoiding off-site night glare and light pollution.

#### **DC4-DTrees, Landscape, and Hardscape Materials**

**DC4-D-1. Choice of Plant Materials:** Reinforce the overall architectural and open space design concepts through the selection of landscape materials.

**DC4-D-2. Hardscape Materials:** Use exterior courtyards, plazas, and other hard surfaced areas as an opportunity to add color, texture, and/or pattern and enliven public areas through the use of distinctive and durable paving materials. Use permeable materials wherever possible.

**DC4-D-3. Long Range Planning:** Select plants that upon maturity will be of appropriate size, scale, and shape to contribute to the site as intended.

**DC4-D-4. Place Making:** Create a landscape design that helps define spaces with significant elements such as trees.

**Board Recommendations:** The recommendations summarized below were based on the plans submitted at the February 10th, 2015 meeting. Design, siting or architectural details not specifically identified or altered in these recommendations are expected to remain as presented in the plans and other drawings available at the February 10th public meeting. After considering the site and context, hearing public comment, reconsidering the previously identified design priorities, and reviewing the plans and renderings, the five Design Review Board members present unanimously recommended approval of the subject design and one of the two requested development standard departures from the requirements of the Land Use Code (listed below).

STANDARD	REQUIREMENT	REQUEST	JUSTIFICATION	RECOMMENDATION
1. Street Level Development Standards SMC 23.47A.008D.2	Residential use at ground level to be located a minimum of 4' above or below sidewalk grade or provide a 10' setback.	The applicant proposes a residential use located between 0'-2' above sidewalk elevation with a minimum setback of 6'.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Site and unit design provide a successful transition between the unit and the sidewalk by incorporating stoops, layered landscaping, and patios where possible.</li> <li>▪ The Board conditioned that Units 1 and 22 provide ground level living space to create a more active residential street frontage along S Holgate Street.</li> </ul>	Approved
2. Street Access and Garage Doors. SMC 23.47A.032A.1.a, A.1.d	Access from an alley when the Director determines that the alley access is feasible and desirable to mitigate parking access impacts.	Two driveway access points from the street. 1-20' access will be provided from 24 <sup>th</sup> Avenue S and 2-10' driveways accessed from 25 <sup>th</sup> Avenue S in addition to alley access. Two 9' garage doors are proposed on each street.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The combined access points on 25<sup>th</sup> Avenue S will create a larger amenity space in the southeast corner of the site better meeting the intent of Design Guideline DC1-C3.</li> </ul>	Approved. Street access must create dedicated amenity space within the woonerf. A condition is created to provide a combined curb cut for unit 27 and 28 off 25th Avenue S and remove the single curb cut for unit 25.

The Board recommended the following **CONDITIONS** for the project. (Authority referenced in the letter and number in parenthesis):

- 1) Modify the paver color to provide more contrast with the concrete (DC1-C).
- 2) Modify the paver pattern with the woonerf space to remove defined walkways, create a pedestrian oriented pattern across the entire woonerf space, add visual interest, and eliminate areas that appear as informal concrete parking spaces (PL1- B, DC1-C).
- 3) Provide a combined curb cut, with separate street-facing garages, along 25th Avenue S, for Unit 27 and 28. Remove the single curb cut for Unit 25 along 25th Avenue S (DC1-B, DC3-A).
- 4) Locate 4 bollard lights, 2 on either side of the alley, near the location of the proposed trees, to define the vehicular entry from the alley (DC1-B).
- 5) Locate the primary living space, including living room and kitchen, at ground level, for the two corner units 1 and 22 (CS2- B, DC1-A).
- 6) Modify the two corner units # 1 and 22, to be rolling accessible from Holgate Street (PL2-A1).

## **DIRECTOR'S ANALYSIS - DESIGN REVIEW**

The Director finds no conflicts with state or federal laws, and has reviewed the City-wide Design Guidelines and finds that the Board neither exceeded its authority nor applied the guidelines inconsistently in the approval of this design. The Director agrees with the conditions recommended by the four Board members and the recommendation to approve the design, as stated above.

## **DECISION - DESIGN REVIEW**

The proposed design is **CONDITIONALLY GRANTED**.

## **CONDITIONS – DESIGN REVIEW**

### *Prior to MUP Issuance*

Revise plans sets to show:

1. Modify the paver color to provide more contrast with the concrete.
2. Modify the paver pattern with the woonerf space to remove defined walkways, create a pedestrian oriented pattern across the entire woonerf space, add visual interest, and eliminate areas that appear as informal concrete parking spaces.
3. Provide a combined curb cut, with separate street-facing garages, along 25th Avenue S, for Unit 27 and 28. Remove the single curb cut for Unit 25 along 25th Avenue S.
4. Locate 4 bollard lights, 2 on either side of the alley, near the location of the proposed trees, to define the vehicular entry from the alley.
5. Locate the primary living space, including living room and kitchen, at ground level, for the two corner units #1 and 22.
6. Modify the two corner units # 1 and 22 to be rolling accessible from Holgate Street.

### *Prior to Building Application*

7. Include the departure matrix in the zoning summary section on all subsequent building permit plans. Add call-out notes on appropriate plan and elevation drawings in the updated MUP plans and on all subsequent building permit plans.

### *Prior to Commencement of Construction*

8. Arrange a pre-construction meeting with the building contractor, building inspector, and land use planner to discuss expectations and details of the Design Review component of the project.

Prior to Issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy

9. Compliance with all images and text on the MUP drawings, design review meeting guidelines and approved design features and elements (including exterior materials, landscaping and ROW improvements) shall be verified by the DPD planner assigned to this project (Lindsay King, 206.684.9218). An appointment with the assigned Land Use Planner must be made at least one week in advance of field inspection. The Land Use Planner will determine whether submission of revised plans is required to ensure that compliance has been achieved.

For the Life of the Project

10. Any proposed changes to the exterior of the building or the site or must be submitted to DPD for review and approval by the Land Use Planner (Lindsay King, 206.684.9218). Any proposed changes to the improvements in the public right-of-way must be submitted to DPD and SDOT for review and for final approval by SDOT.

Compliance with all applicable conditions must be verified and approved by the Land Use Planner, Lindsay King, (206-684-9218) at the specified development stage, as required by the Director's decision. The Land Use Planner shall determine whether the condition requires submission of additional documentation or field verification to assure that compliance has been achieved.

Signature: Denise R. Minnerly for Date: June 1, 2015  
Bruce P. Rips, Land Use Planning Supervisor  
Department of Planning and Development

BPR: drm

K:\Decisions-Signed\3014704, 3017027, 3018467 & 3018468.docx

**IMPORTANT INFORMATION FOR ISSUANCE OF YOUR MASTER USE PERMIT**

Master Use Permit Expiration and Issuance

The appealable land use decision on your Master Use Permit (MUP) application has now been published. At the conclusion of the appeal period, your permit will be considered "approved for issuance". (If your decision is appealed, your permit will be considered "approved for issuance" on the fourth day following the City Hearing Examiner's decision.) Projects requiring a Council land use action shall be considered "approved for issuance" following the Council's decision.

The "approved for issuance" date marks the beginning of the **three year life** of the MUP approval, whether or not there are outstanding corrections to be made or pre-issuance conditions to be met. The permit must be issued by DPD within that three years or it will expire and be cancelled. (SMC 23-76-028) (Projects with a shoreline component have a **two year life**. Additional information regarding the effective date of shoreline permits may be found at 23.60.074.)

All outstanding corrections must be made, any pre-issuance conditions met and all outstanding fees paid before the permit is issued. You will be notified when your permit has issued.

Questions regarding the issuance and expiration of your permit may be addressed to the Public Resource Center at [prc@seattle.gov](mailto:prc@seattle.gov) or to our message line at 206-684-8467.