



City of Seattle

Department of Planning and Development
D. M. Sugimura, Director

**CITY OF SEATTLE
ANALYSIS AND DECISION OF THE DIRECTOR
OF THE DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT**

Application Number: 3014313
Applicant Name: Al Terry Architecture for Findlay Street Christian Church
Address of Proposal: 2421 14th Avenue South

SUMMARY OF PROPOSED ACTION

Land Use Application to allow a 3-story structure containing three residential units and one institution (Findlay Street Christian Church). Existing building to be demolished. The proposal is a major revision to MUP 3005359.

The following approvals are required:

Administrative Design Review Departures (SMC Chapter 23.41)

Development Standard Departure to allow more than the maximum amount of blank facade on the south façade (S. Bayview St). (SMC 23.47A.008.A.2)

Development Standard Departure to less than the required amount of transparency at the south façade (S. Bayview St) (SMC 23.47A.008.B.3.b)

SEPA DETERMINATION: Exempt DNS MDNS EIS

DNS with conditions

DNS involving non-exempt grading or demolition, or involving another agency with jurisdiction.

Current Development:

The existing site is occupied by a single family detached residence with a detached garage adjacent to the alley.

Access:

Stairs currently provide pedestrian access at S Bayview St, and a walkway at grade provides pedestrian access at 14th Ave S. The existing garage is accessed from a curb cut near the alley at S Bayview St.



Surrounding Development:

The surrounding development represents a variety of one to four story buildings with a variety of uses. One to 3-story early to mid-20th century multi-family structures are located to the west across the alley. Newer 3-4 story apartment buildings are located to the south. Early 20th century 1-2 story apartment buildings are located to the southeast. Early 20th century structures converted from single family residential to multi-family residential and commercial uses are located to the north. A gas station is located across the street to the west. One to four-story commercial and office development are located to the west, along Beacon Ave S.

ECAs:

There are no Environmentally Critical Areas at this site. Steep Slope and Potential Slide ECAs are located across the alley to the west, following the western slope of Beacon Hill.

Neighborhood Character:

This site is located in the northwest portion of Beacon Hill. Beacon Hill is a north-south ridge with the majority of arterials running along the top of the ridge. Nearby topography is relatively flat along the top of this ridge, with steeper slopes to the west, at the edge of Beacon Hill.

Development is clustered along the top of the ridge of Beacon Hill, with much lower density development and more vegetation at the west and east sides of the ridge. I-5 is located at the bottom of the ridge west of this site. The mature trees and vegetation on the western slope of Beacon Hill provide some sound and visual barriers from I-5.

This area has historically been occupied by lower height development with commercial and multi-family structures adjacent to the arterials, and residential structures located east and west of the main arterials. Views across the Duwamish valley are visible to the west, especially where the street ends intersect with the greenbelt at the west slope of Beacon Hill.

The site is also located in the Beacon Hill Light Rail Overlay District, with the Light Rail Station approximately two blocks to the southeast. The neighborhood is well served by transit (both light rail and bus).

PERMIT HISTORY

The proposed development is a major revision of previously issued MUP 3005359, which included design review for 12 residential units over an institution (Findlay Street Christian Church). MUP 3005359 included an Early Design Guidance meeting on February 3, 2010 and a Design Recommendation meeting on February 8, 2010.

The proposal has been revised and now proposes 3 residential units attached to the west side of an institution (Findlay Street Christian Church). The proposal is now below the threshold for mandatory Design Review as defined by SMC 23.41. The applicant has requested Design Review Departures through Administrative Design Review.

DPD determined that the site plan and context were similar to the previous proposal and therefore the Early Design Guidance from 3005359 could be considered applicable to the current proposal. Therefore, the proposal is required to complete the Design Recommendation phase for Administrative Design Review.

The Early Design Guidance from MUP 3005359 is copied below, for reference.

EARLY DESIGN GUIDANCE MEETING: (MUP 3005359) February 3, 2010 DESIGN DEVELOPMENT

The packets shown at the EDG meeting includes materials presented at the meeting, and is available online by entering the project number 3005359 at this website:

http://www.seattle.gov/dpd/Planning/Design_Review_Program/Project_Reviews/Reports/default.asp.

The packet is also available to view in the 3005359 microfilm, by contacting the Public Resource Center at DPD:

Mailing Address: **Public Resource Center**
700 Fifth Ave., Suite 2000
P.O. Box 34019
Seattle, WA 98124-4019

Email: PRC@seattle.gov

PUBLIC COMMENT

The following comments, issues and concerns were raised:

- Questions about why this site was chosen for the church location.
 - Appreciation for this use at the site, and comments advocating a retail use at this site.
- Appreciation for the composition.
- Questions about the materials, parking,

- The proposed north setback is an important part of the proposal and should remain in the design.
- The project should have a corner entry, per the North Beacon Hill Design Guidelines.
- The mix of units should include space for families.
- The roof garden should include plants that can withstand the wind and difficult rooftop climate.

FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS - DESIGN DEVELOPMENT

The packet includes materials reviewed by DPD, and is available online by entering the project number at this website:

http://www.seattle.gov/dpd/Planning/Design_Review_Program/Project_Reviews/Reports/default.asp.

The packet is also available to view in the project file, by contacting the Public Resource Center at DPD:

Mailing Address: **Public Resource Center**
700 Fifth Ave., Suite 2000
P.O. Box 34019
Seattle, WA 98124-4019

Email: PRC@seattle.gov

Since the 3005359 EDG meeting, the proposal has been modified to include only the religious institution in the eastern portion of the property, with no residential units above, and 3 stacked flat residential units on the western portion of the property.

PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comment was offered in response to the notice of application for 3014313.

PRIORITIES & RECOMMENDATIONS

After visiting the site, considering the analysis of the site and context provided by the proponents, and hearing public comment, the Board identified the Citywide Design Guidelines & Neighborhood specific guidelines (as applicable) of highest priority for this project at the February 3, 2010 EDG meeting.

DPD provided recommendations based on the Board's Early Design Guidance and the applicant's proposed design.

The Neighborhood specific guidelines are summarized below. For the full text please visit the [Design Review website](#).

A-3 Entrances Visible from the Street. Entries should be clearly identifiable and visible from the street.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board asked for more detail on the entrances. The church entrance should be well detailed, visible and appropriate for the use, the site and its location on the site/building. The tower element at the entry on concept C, the preferred concept, should be designed with artistic and architectural language that helps define the entry on Bayview as well as being appropriate to the Church symbolic language and artistic expression. The residential entry should be welcoming, well landscaped, properly lit, and include appropriate signage.

A-4 Human Activity. New development should be sited and designed to encourage human activity on the street.

North Beacon Hill-specific supplemental guidance:

- A. Provide for sidewalk retail opportunities and connections by allowing for the opening of the storefront to the street and the display of goods on the sidewalks.**
- B. Provide for outdoor dining opportunities on the sidewalk by allowing for the opening of restaurant or cafe windows to the sidewalk and installing outdoor seating.**
- C. Install clear glass windows along the sidewalk to provide visual access into the retail or dining activities that occur inside.**
- D. Do not block views into the interior spaces with the backs of shelving units or posters.**
- E. Maximize window widths and heights along sidewalk face of buildings to create inviting and interactive atmosphere between indoor and outdoor activities.**

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board directed the architect to consider the small, but important spaces between the building entries and the curbs as quality gathering and entry spaces.

A-5 Respect for Adjacent Sites. Buildings should respect adjacent properties by being located on their sites to minimize disruption of the privacy and outdoor activities of residents in adjacent buildings.

North Beacon Hill-specific supplemental guidance:

- A. Redirect the number of windows and decks on proposed buildings that overlook neighboring residences.**
- B. Step back upper floors or increase side and rear setbacks to pull windows farther away from neighboring residences.**
- C. Stagger windows to not align with adjacent windows and minimize the impact of windows in living spaces that may infringe on the privacy of adjacent residents.**

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board agreed that option C presented a good start in easing the pressure on the north property line, the adjacent site. The Board directed the architect to take special care in developing the residential entry and upper level open space along this edge to minimize impacts to that site.

A-7 Residential Open Space. Residential projects should be sited to maximize opportunities for creating usable, attractive, well-integrated open space.

North Beacon Hill-specific supplemental guidance:

- A. Incorporate quasi-public open space into new residential development or redevelopment with special focus on corner landscape treatments and courtyard entries.**
- B. Create substantial courtyard-style open space that is visually accessible to the public view.**
- C. Set-back development where appropriate to preserve view corridors, particularly to mountains, water and skyline.**
- D. Set back upper floors to allow solar access to the sidewalk and/or neighboring properties.**
- E. Protect existing, healthy street trees.**
- F. Site outdoor spaces to take advantage of as much sunlight as possible.**

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board affirmed the importance of creating quality gathering spaces in this development proposal. All landscaping should be full and striving and designed to have a long design life. That is, the landscaping should include many kinds of plants best suited to its location, the proposed water regime, sun exposure and foot traffic exposure. The planting plan should be fully designed and planted using planting quantity guidelines outlined by the City. The project proposed a substantive “green” presence thus proposing to expand the typical urban planting palette to include more edible plants, native plants, low water usage plants and attention to variety in plant habit or form.

B-1 Height, Bulk, and Scale Compatibility. Projects should be compatible with the scale of development anticipated by the applicable Land Use Policies for the surrounding area and should be sited and designed to provide a sensitive transition to near-by, less intensive zones. Projects on zone edges should be developed in a manner that creates a step in perceived height, bulk, and scale between anticipated development potential of the adjacent zones.

North Beacon Hill-specific supplemental guidance:

Much of the North Beacon Hill business district is zoned for 40-foot tall mixed-use buildings. Most of the existing commercial structures in the area are one- and two-stories adjacent to single-family houses. Large, monolithic buildings are discouraged. Proper consideration of the scale, massing and detail of individual buildings will contribute to a project’s compatibility with surrounding residential areas and a satisfying public environment.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board directed the applicant to design a building that is compatible with the anticipated development of the nearby sites.

C-2 Architectural Concept and Consistency. Building design elements, details and massing should create a well-proportioned and unified building form and exhibit an overall architectural concept. Buildings should exhibit form and features identifying the functions within the building. In general, the roofline or top of the structure should be clearly distinguished from its facade walls.

North Beacon Hill-specific supplemental guidance:

- A. New multi-story developments are encouraged to consider methods to integrate a building's upper and lower levels. This is especially important in NC-40'-zoned areas. Mixed-use buildings are encouraged to create a building base that orients to the street and/or defines public space. This can be achieved by building the ground floor commercial level, and possibly one more level out to the front property line.**
- B. Establish a building's overall appearance on a clear and pleasing set of proportions. A building should exhibit a sense of order. The use and repetition of architectural features and building materials, textures and colors can help create unity in a structure. Consider how the following can contribute to a building that exhibits a cohesive architectural concept: Facade modulation and articulation; Windows and fenestration patterns; Trim and moldings; Grilles and railings; Lighting and signage**

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board advised that a strong and clearly articulated concept should inform the design on this site. Architectural design and materials cues from the new library should be studied for appropriateness to this site. The tower element should undergo a series of design trials to study appropriate bulk, height, connectedness to the building and architectural language. The Board asked the architect to bring the studies to show at the next meeting. The Board commented that the windows as shown are well proportioned for the building and the site.

- C-3 Human Scale. The design of new buildings should incorporate architectural features, elements, and details to achieve a good human scale.**

North Beacon Hill-specific supplemental guidance:

- A. Brick and Stone are the most common surface treatment in the commercial areas and are strongly encouraged.**
- B. Signs should add interest to the street level environment. They can unify the overall architectural concept of the building, or provide unique identity for a commercial space within a larger mixed-use structure. Design signage that is appropriate for the scale, character and use of the project and surrounding area. Signs should be oriented and scaled for both pedestrians on sidewalks and vehicles on streets.**

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board stressed that good human scale is important at this site as the urban fabric becomes more residential in nature away from Beacon Avenue. The Board suggested that the concrete wall have some reveal details or banding to create a sense of scale and detail.

- C-4 Exterior Finish Materials. Building exteriors should be constructed of durable and maintainable materials that are attractive even when viewed up close. Materials that have texture, pattern, or lend themselves to a high quality of detailing are encouraged.**

North Beacon Hill-specific supplemental guidance:

- A. Brick and Stone are the most common surface treatment in the commercial areas and are strongly encouraged. Below are some examples of bricks and stone used on Beacon Hill.**

- B. Signs should add interest to the street level environment. They can unify the overall architectural concept of the building, or provide unique identity for a commercial space within a larger mixed-use structure. Design signage that is appropriate for the scale, character and use of the project and surrounding area. Signs should be oriented and scaled for both pedestrians on sidewalks and vehicles on streets.**

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that this was an important guideline for the proposal, and looked forward to more detail showing a high level of quality materials.

- D-1 Pedestrian Open Spaces and Entrances. Convenient and attractive access to the building's entry should be provided. To ensure comfort and security, paths and entry areas should be sufficiently lighted and entry areas should be protected from the weather. Opportunities for creating lively, pedestrian-oriented open space should be considered.**

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, there was not sufficient detail about the building entries for the Board to comment on.

- D-2 Blank Walls. Buildings should avoid large blank walls facing the street, especially near sidewalks. Where blank walls are unavoidable they should receive design treatment to increase pedestrian comfort and interest.**

- D-7 Personal Safety and Security. Project design should consider opportunities for enhancing personal safety and security in the environment under review.**

North Beacon Hill-specific supplemental guidance:

- A. Defensible Space**
- B. Access Control**
- C. Surveillance**

- D-10 Commercial Lighting. Appropriate levels of lighting should be provided in order to promote visual interest and a sense of security for people in commercial districts during evening hours. Lighting may be provided by incorporation into the building façade, the underside of overhead weather protection, on and around street furniture, in merchandising display windows, in landscaped areas, and/or on signage.**

- D-12 Residential Entries and Transitions. For residential projects in commercial zones, the space between the residential entry and the sidewalk should provide security and privacy for residents and a visually interesting street front for pedestrians. Residential buildings should enhance the character of the streetscape with small gardens, stoops and other elements that work to create a transition between the public sidewalk and private entry.**

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board advised that the pedestrian environment in its many facets, constraints and opportunities should be especially well-designed with an eye for future maintenance ease, survivability and beauty. The priority guidelines listed above should drive the design development and create a positive presence at this corner.

E-2 Landscaping to Enhance the Building and/or Site. Landscaping, including living plant material, special pavements, trellises, screen walls, planters, site furniture, and similar features should be appropriately incorporated into the design to enhance the project.

North Beacon Hill-specific supplemental guidance:

- A. Give purpose to plantings by incorporating multiple functions of the plantings, i.e., a planting can be a bioretention cell, provide shelter, shade and habitat while enhancing the overall aesthetic of Beacon Hill.**
- B. Native plants to the Pacific Northwest are encouraged because of their proven ability to perform well in our climate and their regional cultural significance.**
- C. Consider adding a focal element, for instance, an art piece to outdoor space.**
- D. Retain significant trees whenever possible.**

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, The Board directed the applicant to consider landscaping in its broadest definition when designing this site.

DPD RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. **Entries:** The Church entry is designed to be distinct from the residential entry. The building has been modified so the Church occupies the western portion of the building. The Church entry is sufficiently identified.
 - a. The residential entry is located near the southwest corner, with a secondary entry from the alley. The residential entry is set back from the sidewalk at S. Bayview St, with a landscaped buffer between the sidewalk and the residential units. The entry consists of fir doors with large areas of glazing and an overhead canopy for weather protection.
 - i. It is not clear from the plans whether this entry includes lighting or signage identifying the residential entry. A condition of design review approval will be added to require lighting and signage to enhance and identify the residential entry, distinct from the Church entry. (A-3, D-1, D-7, D-10, D-12)
 - ii. The overhead weather protection at this entry appears to be very shallow from the plans. 6' depth is considered the minimum for overhead weather protection. The entry faces south, the direction of prevailing wind in the winter, making weather protection particularly important at this location. In order to identify the residential entry and provide adequate weather protection for residents, a condition of design review approval will be added to require that the residential canopy shall be at least 6' deep and extend the width of the entry doors. (A-3, D-1, D-12)
2. **Human Activity:** The southeast corner entry and the west side of the site have been designed to provide gathering spaces. The residential entry has been relocated to the south façade since EDG, which will add human activity to this street frontage. The location of the residential entry near the p-patch planters in the public right of way on S. Bayview Street will further enhance human activity on this street frontage. At EDG, the Board noted the importance of human activity on this street frontage, given the proposed departures for blank wall and transparency on this façade. The revised design meets the

Early Design Guidance and provides a design to encourage human activity on the south street frontage. (A-4, E-2)

3. **Respect for Adjacent Sites; Height, Bulk, and Scale:** At EDG, the Board gave direction about setting back from the site to the north and designing the northeast residential entry to transition to the residential development to the north. Since EDG, the proposal has been revised to be approximately half the height of the building proposed at EDG. The proposed development is now equal to or less than the scale of the adjacent residential development, making setbacks less crucial at the north property line. The north side of the Church also includes a one-story element which further serves to transition to the residential uses to the north. The proposed development responds to the scale of adjacent residential development and responds sufficiently to Early Design Guidance. (A-5, B-1)
4. **Residential Open Space:** The west side of the site includes bicycle parking (approximately 16' away from the residential entry), with paved areas and residential open space adjacent to the alley. The alley includes other nearby residential units that face the alley. Residential development on the west side of the alley uses the alley as a 'front' entry, due to the steep slopes to the west. The proposed open space responds to the residential context of the alley. The residential open space provides landscaping and pervious paving. The setbacks at the residential façade include landscaping to complement the extensive landscaping in the S. Bayview St right of way. (A-7, E-2)
 - a. The lighting plan is unclear. The exit door at the alley, as well as the residential open space and bicycle racks could be compromised by insufficient lighting. A condition of design review will be added to require that lighting shall be added at the west exit door, the residential open space at the alley, and the bicycle racks to provide sufficient security and safety for residents. (D-1, D-7, D-10)
5. **Architectural Concept, Materials:** Since EDG, the proposal has been revised to include two distinct forms for the Church and the residential expression. The previous design included residential units above the Church use, resulting in a challenging design concept that needed to express different uses in a cohesive overall design. The proposed revised design includes Church use in the eastern portion of the building and residential uses in the western portion of the building. The Church use includes an interesting building form with a curved roof, tall windows, and clerestory windows above. The residential use includes a rectilinear form with a flat roof. Church materials include sandstone tile and fiber cement panels. Residential materials include hot rolled sheet steel panel siding and fiber cement rainscreen.
 - a. The individual forms are clearly expressed, strongly articulated, and relate well to the new design parti. (C-2)
 - b. The materials in each portion of the building are highly durable and respond well to nearby context. These materials are important in the design conforming to human scale and architectural concept requirements, and serve to meet the requirements for the proposed departures. A reduction in the quality of the proposed materials would require additional design recommendation review. (C-2, C-3, C-4, D-2)

- c. The shape and size of the proposed windows on the south façade provides visual interest and serves to meet the requirements for the proposed departures from transparency and blank facades. A substantial change to the shape or size of the windows on this façade would require additional design recommendation review. (C-2, C-4, D-2)
- d. The west façade includes a variety of materials to provide human scale and visual interest. (C-3, D-2)

DEVELOPMENT STANDARD DEPARTURES

Approval of the requested departures is based upon the departure's potential to help the project better meet these design guideline priorities and achieve a better overall design than could be achieved without the departures.

1. **Blank Facades (SMC 23.47A.008.A.2.c):** The Code requires blank facades to be limited to a maximum of 40% of the width of the façade of the structure along the street. The applicant proposes blank facades for 55% of the width of the S. Bayview St façade, due to grade changes that don't count transparency in part of the lower levels of the building. The applicant has proposed landscaping, interesting fenestration and high quality façades to increase visual interest in those areas.

This departure would provide a building design that would better meet the intent of Design Review Guidelines C-3, C-4 and D-2, as conditioned below, by providing high quality materials and fenestration for visual interest and building entries and open space to activate the areas of blank facades. The departure is granted, subject to the conditions listed below.

2. **Transparency (SMC 23.47A.008.B.2.a):** The Code requires a minimum of 60% of the street-facing facade between 2 feet and 8 feet above the sidewalk to be transparent. The applicant proposes 29.5% transparency at the S. Bayview St façade. The applicant has proposed landscaping, interesting fenestration and high quality façades to increase visual interest in those areas.

This departure would provide a building design that would better meet the intent of Design Review Guidelines C-3, C-4 and D-2, as conditioned below, by providing high quality materials and fenestration for visual interest and building entries and open space to activate the areas of reduced transparency. The departure is granted, subject to the conditions listed below.

DECISION – DESIGN REVIEW

The proposed design and Development Standard Departures are **CONDITIONALLY GRANTED**, subject to the conditions listed below.

DESIGN REVIEW - CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Prior to Issuance of a Master Use Permit

1. The plans shall be updated to include lighting and signage to enhance and identify the residential entry, distinct from the Church entry. (A-3, D-1, D-7, D-10, D-12)
2. The plans shall be modified to show a residential canopy at least 6' deep, that extends to at least the width of the entry doors. (A-3, D-1, D-7, D-10, D-12)
3. The plans shall be modified to show lighting at the west exit door, the residential open space at the alley, and the bicycle racks. Lighting shall be designed to provide sufficient security and safety for residents. (D-1, D-7, D-10, D-12)

Prior to Certificate of Occupancy

4. The Land Use Planner shall inspect materials, colors, and design of the constructed project. All items shall be constructed and finished as shown at the design recommendation meeting and the subsequently updated Master Use Plan set. Any change to the proposed design, materials, or colors shall require prior approval by the Land Use Planner (Shelley Bolser 206-733-9067 or shelley.bolser@seattle.gov).
5. The applicant shall provide a landscape certificate from Director's Rule 10-2011, indicating that all vegetation has been installed per approved landscape plans. Any change to the landscape plans approved with this Master Use Permit shall be approved by the Land Use Planner (Shelley Bolser (206) 733-9067 or shelley.bolser@seattle.gov).

For the Life of the Project

6. The building and landscape design shall be substantially consistent with the materials represented at the Recommendation meeting and in the materials submitted after the Recommendation meeting, before the MUP issuance. Any change to the proposed design, including materials or colors, shall require prior approval by the Land Use Planner (Shelley Bolser 206-733-9067 or shelley.bolser@seattle.gov).

Signature: _____ (signature on file) Date: February 28, 2013
Shelley Bolser, AICP, LEED AP
Senior Land Use Planner
Department of Planning and Development

SB:drm

I:\BolserS\Doc\Design\3014313.Terry.Findlay Street Church.docx