

**Department of Planning & Development** D. M. Sugimura, Director

DESIGN REVIEW

# FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE SOUTHEAST DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

Project Number:	3013810
Address:	2524 16th Avenue S
Applicant:	Dean Kralios, Stickney Murphy Romine, for El Centro De La Raza
Date of Meeting:	Tuesday, August 12, 2014
Board Members Present:	Stephan Yamada-Heidner (Chair) Drew Hicks Amoreena Miller David Sauvion Julian Weber
Board Members Absent:	None
DPD Staff Present:	Lindsay King

#### SITE & VICINITY

Site Zone:	Neighborhood Commercial (NC2P-65)
Nearby Zones:	North: LR3 South: NC2P-65 East: SF5000 West: NC2P-65
Lot Area:	47,745 sq. ft.
Current Development:	Surface parking



Surrounding Development: The subject site is located on the south third of the block surrounded by 16th Avenue S to the west, 17th Avenue S to the east, and South Lander Street to the south. To the east, the zoning transitions to Single Family (SF5000) and the neighborhood transitions to single family structures. Directly north of the subject lot is the El Centro de la Raza. To the south is S Lander Street also known as the Roberto Maestas Festival Street. Across the street is the Beacon Hill Light Rail Station. To the west the uses transition to a mix of single family residences, 1-4 story commercial and multifamily structures along Beacon Ave S.

ECAs: None

Neighborhood Beacon Avenue S SW serves as a commercial corridor. The area adjacent to Character: Beacon Avenue S and the Beacon Hill Light Rail Station were recently rezoned to facilitate higher density within the Station Area Overlay District. The newly zoned commercial corridor is surrounded by single family zoning and residential uses. The neighborhood includes a number of prominent civic and cultural buildings including the Beacon Hill Station, Beacon Hill Public Library and the El Centro de la Raza Community Center.

#### **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

Two six-story structures with 112 residential units above approximately 27,000 sq. ft. of commercial, with below grade parking for 5 vehicles will be provided. A future short plat is pending.

# EARLY DESIGN GUIDANCE MEETING: February 11, 2014

#### **DESIGN PRESENTATION**

The EDG packet includes materials presented at the EDG meeting, and is available online by entering the project number (3013810) at this website: <a href="http://www.seattle.gov/dpd/Planning/Design\_Review\_Program/Project\_Reviews/Reports/default.asp">http://www.seattle.gov/dpd/Planning/Design\_Review\_Program/Project\_Reviews/Reports/default.asp</a>.

The EDG packet is also available to view in the project file (project number 3013810), by contacting the Public Resource Center at DPD:

MailingPublic Resource CenterAddress:700 Fifth Ave., Suite 2000P.O. Box 34019Seattle, WA 98124-4019

#### Email: <u>PRC@seattle.gov</u>

The applicant presented three alternatives. Each option includes a mixed use structure containing approximately 115 residential units above ground level commercial and institutional space. Ground level commercial and institutional space includes child care center, community center, office and small incubator retail spaces. Each design option also includes a ground level setback from the proposed north property line, the existing El Centro de la Raza building and the Santos Rodriquez Park. The setback is proposed with pedestrian walkways to connect 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue S to 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S and walkways to connect the existing El Centro building and the new proposed building.

Massing Scheme A includes a six story building that is designed as a rectangular O-shape with an open courtyard provided at level two in the center of the building. At ground level, the institutional child center is located along the north façade facing the existing El Centro building. Office and community center uses are located along the east façade. The primary entry to the community center and four retail spaces are located along S Lander Street south façade. The residential entry, residential leasing office and a portion of the child care center are located along the 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue S west façade. The center courtyard provided at level two contains the amenity space. Open circulation is provided around the central courtyard space. Massing Scheme A does not include parking or a public plaza. Massing Scheme A is a code compliant option.

Massing Scheme B includes a six story building that is designed as an L-shape with a ground level public plaza in the southwest corner of the site diagonally across from the Beacon Hill Light Rail Station. Massing Scheme B also includes an upper level setback at floors 2-6 at the center of the building along the east façade facing the single family zoning and uses across 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S. The upper level setback mimics the building massing of the existing El Centro building. At ground level the institutional child center is located along the north façade facing the existing El Centro building. Office and community center are located along the east façade. The primary entry to the community center and residential entry are located along S Lander Street south façade. Retail spaces and the residential leasing office surround the public plaza in the SW corner. A second residential entry and a portion of the child care center are located along the 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue S west façade. Massing Scheme B does not include parking. Massing Scheme B is a code compliant option.

Massing Scheme C (Preferred Option) includes two six story buildings separated by a north south public plaza. Massing Scheme C includes an upper level setback for the west building within the northwest corner. The upper level setback provided at floors 2-6 create an L-shaped massing for west building. An outdoor deck is provided for amenity space at level 2 within the setback. The east building maintains an L-shaped massing from the ground to roof level. An additional upper level setback is provided at level 6 for the north section of the L facing the single family zone and uses. At ground level, the child care center is located along the north façade in the west building facing the existing El Centro building. The north façade of the east building contains

live/work units. Live/work units and a community center are located along the east façade. The primary entry to the community center, residential entry and leasing office are located off the central plaza between the buildings. Retail spaces are located along the south façade of the west building diagonally across from the Beacon Hill Light Rail Station. A second residential entry and a portion of the child care center are located along the 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue S west façade. Massing Scheme C does includes 5 parking spaces accessed from a driveway off 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S. Massing Scheme C requires departures from street level development standards for blank façade and street level setback.

# PUBLIC COMMENT

The following comments, issues and concerns were raised during the public comment portion of the Early Design Guidance meeting:

- Expressed support for the El Centro organization whose main interest is the wellbeing of families, while also providing support and help to all communities, race and ethnicities.
- Noted the new building's central plaza provides a place to for all member of the local community to celebrate history, culture and traditions.
- Noted the new public plaza will provide opportunities for local entrepreneurs to sell wares adjacent to the existing Roberto Maseatas festival street.
- Expressed support for the public plaza which provides views of the historic school building through the site to the street.
- Supported high density development adjacent to the light rail station. Expressed gratitude for the extensive community involvement in the proposed building design.
- Noted the preferred design alternative incorporates feedback resulting from multiple public meetings with the community.
- Questioned how new design guidelines would apply to the project.
- Discouraged the use of multiple colors on the main body of the building. Would like to see a restrained use of colors on the body of the structure.
- Felt the proposed building and site design would complete the El Centro campus concept, including a new community center adjacent to the public plaza.
- Expressed gratitude for new community center that will provide gathering space for 200 people.
- Felt building design would service the Beacon Hill Community for the next century.
- Excited about the extension to the award winning child care center.
- Noted building and site design supports early child development and provides safe spaces for children.
- Felt street parking is limited and suggested applicant contact SDOT about permit parking options.

# PRIORITIES & BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS

After visiting the site, considering the analysis of the site and context provided by the proponents, and hearing public comment, the Design Review Board members provided the

following siting and early design guidance. The Board's Final Recommendation follow the Early Design Guidance on page 18.

The priority Citywide and Neighborhood guidelines are summarized below. For the full text please visit the <u>Design Review website</u>.

#### **CONTEXT & SITE**

CS1 Natural Systems and Site Features: Use natural systems/features of the site and its surroundings as a starting point for project design.

#### CS1-B Sunlight and Natural Ventilation

**CS1-B-2. Daylight and Shading:** Maximize daylight for interior and exterior spaces and minimize shading on adjacent sites through the placement and/or design of structures on site.

#### Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

#### CS1-I Residential Open Space

**CS1-I-ii. Upper-Level Setbacks:** Set back upper floors to allow solar access to the sidewalk and/or neighboring properties.

**CS1-I-iv. Solar Access:** Site outdoor spaces to take advantage of as much sunlight as possible.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted preferred massing option C provided the better design solution to minimize shadow impacts on the existing playground and open spaces on the El Centro site.

CS2 Urban Pattern and Form: Strengthen the most desirable forms, characteristics, and patterns of the streets, block faces, and open spaces in the surrounding area.

#### CS2-A Location in the City and Neighborhood

CS2-A-1. Sense of Place: Emphasize attributes that give a distinctive sense of place.
Design the building and open spaces to enhance areas where a strong identity already exists, and create a sense of place where the physical context is less established.
CS2-A-2. Architectural Presence: Evaluate the degree of visibility or architectural presence that is appropriate or desired given the context, and design accordingly.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that the existing El Centro building and site plays a prominent role in the local neighborhood character. The Board felt further analysis was necessary at the Recommendation Meeting showing how the new proposed site design, open space character, paving, landscaping, artwork and building architectural character emphasize attributes of the established context.

#### CS2-B Adjacent Sites, Streets, and Open Spaces

**CS2-B-2. Connection to the Street:** Identify opportunities for the project to make a strong connection to the street and public realm.

**CS2-B-3. Character of Open Space:** Contribute to the character and proportion of surrounding open spaces.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board appreciated how the preferred massing option C provided a 32'-5" wide public midblock connection in the east/direction between the existing and proposed building. The Board noted that the midblock connection in conjunction with the 69'-7" wide north/south public plaza provided between the two structures provided a great opportunity to continue the public open spaces from the Beacon Hill Light Rail Station, to the Festival Street onto the site and into the existing parks provided adjacent to the existing school house building.

At the Recommendation Meeting the Board requested more information showing how uses abutting the ground level open spaces provided a strong connection to the public realm.

#### CS2-C Relationship to the Block

**CS2-C-1. Corner Sites:** Corner sites can serve as gateways or focal points; both require careful detailing at the first three floors due to their high visibility from two or more streets and long distances.

**CS2-C-3. Full Block Sites:** Break up long facades of full-block buildings to avoid a monolithic presence. Provide detail and human scale at street-level, and include repeating elements to add variety and rhythm to the façade and overall building design.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the project site includes multiple street corners at, 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue S and 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S, and also a full block façade abutting the Roberto Maestas Festival Street to the south. For the Recommendation Meeting, the Board requested more information on the corner and façade treatments for each elevation.

#### CS2-D Height, Bulk, and Scale

**CS2-D-1. Existing Development and Zoning:** Review the height, bulk, and scale of neighboring buildings as well as the scale of development anticipated by zoning for the area to determine an appropriate complement and/or transition.

**CS2-D-3. Zone Transitions:** For projects located at the edge of different zones, provide an appropriate transition or complement to the adjacent zone(s). Projects should create a step in perceived height, bulk and scale between the anticipated development potential of the adjacent zone and the proposed development.

**CS2-D-4. Massing Choices:** Strive for a successful transition between zones where a project abuts a less intense zone.

**CS2-D-5. Respect for Adjacent Sites:** Respect adjacent properties with design and site planning to minimize disrupting the privacy of residents in adjacent buildings.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board felt preferred massing Option C provided the better design solution. Massing option C separates the development into two separate

structures with a public plaza in the center. The two structures reduce the perceived bulk of the development on site while also providing views of the existing school structure, across the public plaza, to the festival street.

Massing Option C incorporates upper level setback at level two on the northwest facade to minimize shadow impacts to the existing children's park on the western portion of the existing El Centro site.

Massing Option C provides a 25'-28' ground level setback across from the single family zoned lots. An additional upper level setback is provided at level 6. The Board noted the ground and upper level setback facing the single family zone provides a good massing transition between the proposed six story structure and the single family uses across the street. The Board felt the ground level setback should be enhanced with substantial ground level planting.

#### Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

#### CS2-I Streetscape Compatibility

**CS2-I-i. Buildings with Multiple Street Fronts:** For buildings that span a block and face two streets, each street frontage should receive individual and detailed site planning as well as architectural design treatments to complement the established streetscape character.

**CS1-I-ii. Relationship to Sidewalks:** Build at or near the edge of the sidewalk and restrict grade separations where commercial uses occupy the ground floor.

#### CS2-II Corner Lots

CS2-II-ii. Retail Entry: Provide for a prominent retail corner entry.

CS2-II-iii. Corner Characteristics: Typical corner developments should provide:

a. a main building entrance located at the corner;

b. an entrance set back to soften the corner and enhance pedestrian environment; and

c. use of a hinge, bevel, notch, open bay or setback in the massing to reflect the special nature of the corner and draw attention to it.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board requested more information showing how the project and site design incorporates this guideline at the next Meeting.

#### CS2-III Height, Bulk and Scale Compatibility

CS2-III-v. Upper-Level Setbacks: Step back elevation at upper levels of large-scale development to take advantage of views and increase sunlight at street level.
CS2-III-vi. Articulate Building Facades: Either vertically or horizontally in intervals that relate to the existing structures or existing pattern of development in the vicinity.
CS2-III-vii. Visual Mass Reduction: Employ architectural measures to reduce building scale such as: landscaping, trellises, complementary materials, detailing and accent trim.
CS2-III-viii. Landscaping: Soften commercial facades with dense landscaping, where appropriate.

**CS2-III-ix. Domestic Features:** Repeat domestic architectural elements of surrounding buildings (roof lines, window styles, proportions).

**CS2-III-x. Reference Nearby Design:** Use architectural styles and details (such as roof lines or fenestration), color or materials derived from surrounding, less intensive structures.

**CS2-III-xi. Zone Buffer:** Locate features, such as required open space, on the zone edge to create further separation and buffering of lower intensive structures.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board requested that more information be presented about how the project and site design incorporates this guideline.

**CS3 Architectural Context and Character:** Contribute to the architectural character of the neighborhood.

## CS3-A Emphasizing Positive Neighborhood Attributes

**CS3-A-1. Fitting Old and New Together:** Create compatibility between new projects, and existing architectural context, including historic and modern designs, through building articulation, scale and proportion, roof forms, detailing, fenestration, and/or the use of complementary materials.

**CS3-A-4. Evolving Neighborhoods:** In neighborhoods where architectural character is evolving or otherwise in transition, explore ways for new development to establish a positive and desirable context for others to build upon in the future.

# CS3-B Local History and Culture

**CS3-B-1. Placemaking:** Explore the history of the site and neighborhood as a potential placemaking opportunity. Look for historical and cultural significance, using neighborhood groups and archives as resources.

**CS3-B-2. Historical/Cultural References:** Reuse existing structures on the site where feasible as a means of incorporating historical or cultural elements into the new project.

# Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

# CS3-I Architectural Context

**CS3-I-i. Facade Articulation:** To make new, larger development compatible with the surrounding architectural context, facade articulation and architectural detail are important considerations in mixed-use and multifamily residential buildings. When larger buildings replace several small buildings, facade articulation should reflect the original platting pattern and reinforce the architectural rhythm established in the commercial core.

**CS3-I-ii. Respond to Local Design:** New development should respond to several architectural features common in the North Beacon Hill business district to preserve and enhance pedestrian orientation and maintain an acceptable level of consistency with the existing architecture. To create cohesiveness on Beacon Hill, identifiable and exemplary architectural patterns should be reinforced. New elements can be introduced but a strong design connection should accompany it.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board felt the architectural relationship between the existing school building and the proposed building should be explored. The Board also noted the new building will be significantly higher than the existing structure. The Board felt the proposed building should be sensitive to the existing school building's architectural character but not duplicate the existing building's architecture. At Recommendation, the Board requested to review information on how architectural details have been used in the project to express the relationship between the two buildings.

#### PUBLIC LIFE

# PL1 Connectivity: Complement and contribute to the network of open spaces around the site and the connections among them.

#### PL1-A Network of Open Spaces

PL1-A-1. Enhancing Open Space: Design the building and open spaces to positively contribute to a broader network of open spaces throughout the neighborhood.
PL1-A-2. Adding to Public Life: Seek opportunities to foster human interaction through an increase in the size and quality of project-related open space available for public life.

## PL1-B Walkways and Connections

**PL1-B-1. Pedestrian Infrastructure:** Connect on-site pedestrian walkways with existing public and private pedestrian infrastructure, thereby supporting pedestrian connections within and outside the project.

**PL1-B-2. Pedestrian Volumes:** Provide ample space for pedestrian flow and circulation, particularly in areas where there is already heavy pedestrian traffic or where the project is expected to add or attract pedestrians to the area.

**PL1-B-3. Pedestrian Amenities:** Opportunities for creating lively, pedestrian oriented open spaces to enliven the area and attract interest and interaction with the site and building should be considered.

# PL1-C Outdoor Uses and Activities

**PL1-C-1. Selecting Activity Areas:** Concentrate activity areas in places with sunny exposure, views across spaces, and in direct line with pedestrian routes.

**PL1-C-2. Informal Community Uses:** In addition to places for walking and sitting, consider including space for informal community use such as performances, farmer's markets, kiosks and community bulletin boards, cafes, or street vending.

**PL1-C-3. Year-Round Activity:** Where possible, include features in open spaces for activities beyond daylight hours and throughout the seasons of the year, especially in neighborhood centers where active open space will contribute vibrancy, economic health, and public safety.

#### Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

#### PL1-I Residential Open Space

**PL1-I-i. Quasi-public Open Space:** Incorporate quasi-public open space into new residential development or redevelopment with special focus on corner landscape treatments and courtyard entries.

**PL1-I-ii. Courtyard:** Create substantial courtyard-style open space that is visually accessible to the public view.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board was excited to see further development of the public plaza space. The Board requested more information about how the project and site design incorporates this guideline at the Recommendation Meeting.

# PL2 Walkability: Create a safe and comfortable walking environment that is easy to navigate and well-connected to existing pedestrian walkways and features.

# PL2-B Safety and Security

**PL2-B-1. Eyes on the Street:** Create a safe environment by providing lines of sight and encouraging natural surveillance.

**PL2-B-2. Lighting for Safety:** Provide lighting at sufficient lumen intensities and scales, including pathway illumination, pedestrian and entry lighting, and/or security lights. **PL2-B-3. Street-Level Transparency:** Ensure transparency of street-level uses (for uses such as nonresidential uses or residential lobbies), where appropriate, by keeping views open into spaces behind walls or plantings, at corners, or along narrow passageways.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board requested more information about how the project and site design incorporates this guideline for the Recommendation Meeting.

## PL2-C Weather Protection

**PL2-C-1. Locations and Coverage:** Overhead weather protection is encouraged and should be located at or near uses that generate pedestrian activity such as entries, retail uses, and transit stops.

**PL2-C-2. Design Integration:** Integrate weather protection, gutters and downspouts into the design of the structure as a whole, and ensure that it also relates well to neighboring buildings in design, coverage, or other features.

**PL2-C-3. People-Friendly Spaces:** Create an artful and people-friendly space beneath building.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board felt overhead weather protection should be incorporated at ground level where possible. The Board requested more information about how the project and site design incorporates this guideline for the Recommendation Meeting.

# PL2-D Wayfinding

**PL2-D-1. Design as Wayfinding:** Use design features as a means of wayfinding wherever possible.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board requested more information about how the project and site design incorporates this guideline at the Recommendation Meeting. Staff note: wayfinding and signage will be important for users of the site to understand which area of the site are public, semi-public and private spaces.

#### Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

#### PL2-I Personal Safety and Security

## PL2-I-i. Defensible Space:

a. Create awareness of the boundary between public and private space.

b. Allow for clear lines of sight.

c. Prevent spaces of entrapment.

d. Maximize visibility of people, parking areas and building entrances with doors and windows that look out on to streets and parking areas; this encourages pedestrian-friendly sidewalks and streets while avoiding blank, windowless walls that attract graffiti and prevent "eyes on the street."

e. Clearly indicate public routes and discouraging access to private areas with structural elements.

#### PL2-I-ii. Access Control:

a. Providing safe routes with clearly visible spaces into and through entrances.

b. Prevent hiding places and scaffolding that may be used to climb into structures.

c. Prevent confusion between public and private pathways while reducing "mazelike" pathways.

**PL2-I-iii. Surveillance:** Provide lighting on buildings and in open spaces, paying particular attention to exterior lighting fixtures above entries, lighting in parking areas and open spaces, and pedestrian street lights near sidewalks.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board requested more information be presented about how the project and site design incorporates this guideline at the Recommendation Meeting.

PL3 Street-Level Interaction: Encourage human interaction and activity at the street-level with clear connections to building entries and edges.

#### **PL3-A Entries**

**PL3-A-1. Design Objectives:** Design primary entries to be obvious, identifiable, and distinctive with clear lines of sight and lobbies visually connected to the street. **PL3-A-4. Ensemble of Elements:** Design the entry as a collection of coordinated elements including the door(s), overhead features, ground surface, landscaping, lighting, and other features.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that the nonresidential and residential entries at ground level need further development. The Board felt the primary residential entries should be developed so that they are visually prominent on each façade. Each of the eight project elevations includes a variety of uses and entries. At the Recommendation Meeting, the Board would like to see further consideration on how the ensemble of elements are used to visually identify the various uses and entries.

#### PL3-B Retail Edges

**PL3-B-3. Buildings with Live/Work Uses:** Maintain active and transparent facades in the design of live/work residences. Design the first floor so it can be adapted to other commercial use as needed in the future.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted the live/work nonresidential space is located along the interior public plaza and not the abutting street, 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S. The Board felt the intended programming of the public plaza would support the nonresidential function of the live work space. The Board noted that the residential portion of the live work space is across from single family zoning. The Board felt the substantial ground level setback provided between the building and the street property line should be developed to soften the transition between the six-story building and low density residential uses across the street. The Board also requested the applicant investigate ways in which the residential function of the live/work spaces could engage with the 17<sup>th</sup> Ave S street setback.

## PL3-C Retail Edges

**PL3-C-1. Porous Edge:** Engage passersby with opportunities to interact visually with the building interior using glazing and transparency. Create multiple entries where possible and make a physical and visual connection between people on the sidewalk and retail activities in the building.

**PL3-C-2. Visibility:** Maximize visibility into the building interior and merchandise displays. Consider fully operational glazed wall-sized doors that can be completely opened to the street, increased height in lobbies, and/or special lighting for displays.

**PL3-C-3. Ancillary Activities:** Allow space for activities such as sidewalk vending, seating, and restaurant dining to occur. Consider setting structures back from the street or incorporating space in the project design into which retail uses can extend.

#### **Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:**

#### PL3-I Human Activity

**PL3-I-i. Sidewalk Retail:** Provide for sidewalk retail opportunities and connections by allowing for the opening of the storefront to the street and the display of goods on the sidewalks.

**PL3-I-iii. Visual Access:** Install clear glass windows along the sidewalk to provide visual access into the retail or dining activities that occur inside.

**PL3-I-iv. Transparent Facades:** Do not block views into the interior spaces with the backs of shelving units or posters.

**PL3-I-v. Window Size:** Maximize window widths and heights along sidewalk face of buildings to create an inviting and interactive atmosphere between indoor and outdoor activities.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board felt the location of the small-scale incubator retail spaces was appropriate. The five spaces begin at the corner of 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue S, continue along the festival street, across from the light rails station, and wrap into the public plaza at the center of the site. The Board felt the design and treatment of the retail spaces was a key component of the ground level design. The Board noted that each commercial space should be

visually distinct, but all the retail spaces must be architecturally unified. At the Recommendation Meeting, the Board requested street level vignettes of the pedestrian experience along each façade, a site signage plan, details and location of overhead weather protection, and a complete lighting plan.

PL4 Active Transportation: Incorporate design features that facilitate active forms of transportation such as walking, bicycling, and use of transit.

#### PL4-A Entry Locations and Relationships

**PL4-A-2. Connections to All Modes:** Site the primary entry in a location that logically relates to building uses and clearly connects all major points of access.

PL4-C Planning Ahead For Transit PL4-C-1. Influence on Project Design: Identify how a transit stop (planned or built) adjacent to or near the site may influence project design, provide opportunities for placemaking.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the site proposed for development is located across the street from the Beacon Hill Light Rail Station. At the Recommendation Meeting, the Board requested more information on how the site design, open spaces, building uses, location and visibility of entries have been designed to respond to the transit hub across the street.

#### **DESIGN CONCEPT**

## DC1 Project Uses and Activities: Optimize the arrangement of uses and activities on site. DC1-A Arrangement of Interior Uses

**DC1-A-1. Visibility:** Locate uses and services frequently used by the public in visible or prominent areas, such as at entries or along the street front.

**DC1-A-2. Gathering Places:** Maximize the use of any interior or exterior gathering spaces. **DC1-A-4. Views and Connections:** Locate interior uses and activities to take advantage of views and physical connections to exterior spaces and uses.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that the interior arrangement of uses: childcare center, community center, 2<sup>nd</sup> floor office, live work units and ground level commercial spaces were given careful consideration. At the Recommendation Meeting, the Board requested more information demonstrating how the interior uses connect to the public spaces at the exterior of the building. The Board requested street level vignettes of the pedestrian experience along each façade.

#### **DC1-B** Vehicular Access and Circulation

**DC1-B-1. Access Location and Design:** Choose locations for vehicular access, service uses, and delivery areas that minimize conflict between vehicles and non-motorists wherever possible. Emphasize use of the sidewalk for pedestrians, and create safe and attractive conditions for pedestrians, bicyclists, and drivers.

#### Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

#### DC1-I Parking and Vehicular Access

**DC1-I-i. Continuous Sidewalks:** Preserve and enhance the pedestrian environment in residential and commercial areas by providing for continuous sidewalks that are unencumbered by parked vehicles and are minimally interrupted by vehicular access within a block.

DC1-I-ii. Curb Cuts: Minimize the number and width of driveways and curb cuts.

At Early Design Guidance, the Board supported a driveway access point along 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S. However, the Board agreed the driveway and curbcut width should be reduced to the minimum necessary to provide safe access. The Board stated they would support a departure request for the reduced driveway width in order to minimize impacts to the adjacent pedestrian sidewalk.

#### DC1-C Parking and Service Uses

**DC1-C-4. Service Uses:** Locate and design service entries, loading docks, and trash receptacles away from pedestrian areas or to a less visible portion of the site to reduce possible impacts of these facilities on building aesthetics and pedestrian circulation.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board was concerned about the solid waste and recycling storage space and entrance adjacent to the residential entry on 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue S. At the Recommendation Meeting, the Board requested details for the treatment of the trashing and recycling entry, and the staging location for pickup. The Board felt the storage space should recede into the background and not detract from the prominence of the residential entry. The Board felt any interim staging area should be provided off of the adjacent sidewalks.

# DC2 Architectural Concept: Develop an architectural concept that will result in a unified and functional design that fits well on the site and within its surroundings.

#### **DC2-A Massing**

**DC2-A-1. Site Characteristics and Uses:** Arrange the mass of the building taking into consideration the characteristics of the site and the proposed uses of the building and its open space.

**DC2-A-2. Reducing Perceived Mass:** Use secondary architectural elements to reduce the perceived mass of larger projects.

#### **DC2-B** Architectural and Facade Composition

**DC2-B-1. Façade Composition:** Design all building facades—including alleys and visible roofs— considering the composition and architectural expression of the building as a whole. Ensure that all facades are attractive and well-proportioned.

**DC2-B-2. Blank Walls:** Avoid large blank walls along visible façades wherever possible. Where expanses of blank walls, retaining walls, or garage facades are unavoidable, include uses or design treatments at the street level that have human scale and are designed for pedestrians.

#### **DC2-C** Secondary Architectural Features

**DC2-C-1. Visual Depth and Interest:** Add depth to facades where appropriate by incorporating balconies, canopies, awnings, decks, or other secondary elements into the

façade design. Add detailing at the street level in order to create interest for the pedestrian and encourage active street life and window shopping (in retail areas). **DC2-C-2. Dual Purpose Elements:** Consider architectural features that can be dual purpose— adding depth, texture, and scale as well as serving other project functions. **DC2-C-3. Fit With Neighboring Buildings:** Use design elements to achieve a successful fit between a building and its neighbors.

#### DC2-D Scale and Texture

**DC2-D-1. Human Scale:** Incorporate architectural features, elements, and details that are of human scale into the building facades, entries, retaining walls, courtyards, and exterior spaces in a manner that is consistent with the overall architectural concept **DC2-D-2. Texture:** Design the character of the building, as expressed in the form, scale, and materials, to strive for a fine-grained scale, or "texture," particularly at the street level and other areas where pedestrians predominate.

## DC2-E Form and Function

**DC2-E-1. Legibility and Flexibility:** Strive for a balance between building use legibility and flexibility. Design buildings such that their primary functions and uses can be readily determined from the exterior, making the building easy to access and understand. At the same time, design flexibility into the building so that it may remain useful over time even as specific programmatic needs evolve.

#### Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

#### DC2-I Respect for Adjacent Sites

**DC2-I-i. Windows/Decks:** Redirect the number of windows and decks on proposed buildings that overlook neighboring residences.

**DC2-I-ii. Upper-Floor Setbacks:** Step back upper floors or increase side and rear setbacks to pull windows farther away from neighboring residences.

**DC2-I-iii. Window Location:** Stagger windows to not align with adjacent windows and minimize the impact of windows in living spaces that may infringe on the privacy of adjacent residents.

#### DC2-II Architectural Concept and Consistency

**DC2-II-i. Floor Integration:** New multi-story developments are encouraged to consider methods to integrate a building's upper and lower levels.

**DC2-II-ii. Proportioned Design:** Establish a building's overall appearance on a clear and pleasing set of proportions. A building should exhibit a sense of order. The use and repetition of architectural features and building materials, textures and colors can help create unity in a structure. Consider how the following can contribute to a building that exhibits a cohesive architectural concept:

- a. Facade modulation and articulation
- b. Windows and fenestration patterns
- c. Trim and moldings
- d. Grilles and railings
- e. Lighting and signage

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that the proposed project has eight building elevations that are visible. The Board wished to see the treatment of all eight elevations in response to guidelines DC2 A-E and Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance at the Recommendation Meeting.

# DC3 Open Space Concept: Integrate open space design with the building design so that they complement each other.

#### Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

## DC3-A Building-Open Space Relationship

**DC3-A-1. Interior/Exterior Fit:** Develop an open space concept in conjunction with the architectural concept to ensure that interior and exterior spaces relate well to each other and support the functions of the development.

# **DC3-B** Open Space Uses and Activities

**DC3-B-1. Meeting User Needs:** Plan the size, uses, activities, and features of each open space to meet the needs of expected users, ensuring each space has a purpose and function.

**DC3-B-2. Matching Uses to Conditions:** Respond to changing environmental conditions such as seasonal and daily light and weather shifts through open space design and/or programming of open space activities.

**DC3-B-3.** Connections to Other Open Space: Site and design project-related open spaces to connect with, or enhance, the uses and activities of other nearby public open space where appropriate.

**DC3-B-4. Multifamily Open Space:** Design common and private open spaces in multifamily projects for use by all residents to encourage physical activity and social interaction.

# DC3-C Design

**DC3-C-1. Reinforce Existing Open Space:** Where a strong open space concept exists in the neighborhood, reinforce existing character and patterns of street tree planting, buffers or treatment of topographic changes. Where no strong patterns exist, initiate a strong open space concept that other projects can build upon in the future.

**DC3-C-2. Amenities/Features:** Create attractive outdoor spaces suited to the uses envisioned for the project.

**DC3-C-3. Support Natural Areas:** Create an open space design that retains and enhances onsite natural areas and connects to natural areas that may exist off-site and may provide habitat for wildlife.

#### Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

# DC3-I Landscaping to Enhance the Building and/or Site

**DC3-I-i. Planting Function:** Give purpose to plantings by incorporating multiple functions of the plantings, i.e., a planting can be a bioretention cell, provide shelter, shade and habitat while enhancing the overall aesthetic of Beacon Hill

**DC3-I-ii. Native Plants:** Native plants to the Pacific Northwest are encouraged because of their proven ability to perform well in our climate and their regional cultural significance.

**DC3-I-iii. Focal Element:** Consider adding a focal element, for instance, an art piece to outdoor space.

## **DC3-II Streetscape Compatibility**

**DC3-II-i. Planting Strips:** Place planting strips smartly to incorporate a more pleasing environment for all modes of transportation and incorporate Low Impact Development (LID) interventions in the same space.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted the provided open spaces: an east/west midblock connection, the central public plaza, and the upper-level amenity decks, all play a prominent role in the overall site/building design. The Board felt the conceptual and inspirational images provided within the Early Design Guidance packet were headed in the right direction. The Board also noted the inspirational images incorporate variety in programming, paving textures, landscaping, integrated artwork and a significant amount of transparency between interior uses and exterior spaces. At the Recommendation Meeting, the Board requested additional details for the open space programming, hardscape/landscape design, lighting, signage and artwork plans.

# DC4 Exterior Elements and Finishes: Use appropriate and high quality elements and finishes for the building and its open spaces.

## **DC4-A Exterior Elements and Finishes**

**DC4-A-1. Exterior Finish Materials:** Building exteriors should be constructed of durable and maintainable materials that are attractive even when viewed up close. Materials that have texture, pattern, or lend themselves to a high quality of detailing are encouraged. **DC4-A-2. Climate Appropriateness:** Select durable and attractive materials that will age well in Seattle's climate, taking special care to detail corners, edges, and transitions.

#### DC4-B Signage

**DC4-B-1. Scale and Character:** Add interest to the streetscape with exterior signs and attachments that are appropriate in scale and character to the project and its environs. **DC4-B-2. Coordination with Project Design:** Develop a signage plan within the context of architectural and open space concepts, and coordinate the details with façade design, lighting, and other project features to complement the project as a whole, in addition to the surrounding context.

#### Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance:

#### **DC4-I** Exterior Finish Materials

**DC4-I-i. Brick and Stone:** Brick and stone are the most common surface treatment in the commercial areas and are strongly encouraged.

**DC4-I-ii. Signage:** Signs should add interest to the street level environment. They can unify the overall architectural concept of the building, or provide unique identity for a commercial space within a larger mixed-use structure. Design signage that is appropriate for the scale, character and use of the project and surrounding area. Signs should be oriented and scaled for both pedestrians on sidewalks and vehicles on streets.

**DC4-I-iii. Preferred Sign Types:** The following sign types are encouraged:

a. Pedestrian-oriented blade and window signs

- b. Marquee signs and signs on overhead weather protection
- c. Appropriately sized neon signs
- d. Multilingual signs that reflect the neighborhood's diverse population
- e. Sandwich board signs placed outside of pedestrian pathways

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board requested a complete materials board and signage plan responding to adopted City Design Guidelines at the Recommendation Meeting.

#### DC4-C Lighting

**DC4-C-1. Functions:** Use lighting both to increase site safety in all locations used by pedestrians and to highlight architectural or landscape details and features such as entries, signs, canopies, plantings, and art.

**DC4-C-2.** Avoiding Glare: Design project lighting based upon the uses on and off site, taking care to provide illumination to serve building needs while avoiding off-site night glare and light pollution.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board requested a complete lighting plan responding to adopted City Design Guidelines at the Recommendation Meeting.

#### DC4-D Trees, Landscape, and Hardscape Materials

**DC4-D-1. Choice of Plant Materials:** Reinforce the overall architectural and open space design concepts through the selection of landscape materials.

**DC4-D-2. Hardscape Materials:** Use exterior courtyards, plazas, and other hard surfaced areas as an opportunity to add color, texture, and/or pattern and enliven public areas through the use of distinctive and durable paving materials. Use permeable materials wherever possible.

**DC4-D-3. Long Range Planning:** Select plants that upon maturity will be of appropriate size, scale, and shape to contribute to the site as intended.

**DC4-D-4. Place Making:** Create a landscape design that helps define spaces with significant elements such as trees.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board requested a complete planting plan responding to adopted City Design Guidelines at the Recommendation Meeting.

#### FINAL RECOMMENDATION MEETING: August 12, 2014

The packet includes materials presented at the Recommendation meeting, and is available online by entering the project number at this website: <a href="http://www.seattle.gov/dpd/Planning/Design\_Review\_Program/Project\_Reviews/Reports/default.asp">http://www.seattle.gov/dpd/Planning/Design\_Review\_Program/Project\_Reviews/Reports/default.asp</a>

or contacting the Public Resource Center at DPD:

#### Address: Public Resource Center

700 Fifth Ave., Suite 2000 Seattle, WA 98124

Email: <u>PRC@seattle.gov</u>

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Several members of the public were in attendance at the Recommendation meeting held on August 12, 2014. The following comments, issues and concerns were raised:

- Would like to see common restrooms for the retail spaces rather than individual restrooms.
- Would like to see the plaza paving design flow into the adjacent sidewalk paving.
- Noted the south elevation is tje most visible and most boring of all the facades. Would like to see more energy on the south façade.
- Felt separate public meeting ideas should be addressed within the Recommendation Packet or a written statement should be provided to all meeting attendee stating why items had not been addressed.
- Would like to see different colors used for materials.
- Impressed with importance of the artistic aspirational elements. Noted importance of community efforts to help the artistic work be realized on the site.
- Felt railing upgrade is particularly important.
- Expressed appreciation for the evolved design of the project.
- Felt the front retail spaces should be activated with operable window systems so that people can interact between the interior and exterior of the building.
- Expressed appreciation for the color palette, but also noted the new building on the next block is the same color which may make the combination monotonous.
- Felt the two buildings should not look exactly the same.
- Would like plaza and through block connection to be open 24 hours.

#### **PRIORITIES & BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS: August 12, 2014**

At the Recommendation meeting, the Board discussed the response to the EDG and offered the following recommendations for the proposal to meet the applicable Design Review Guidelines identified at the EDG meeting.

- 1. Site Design and Massing. The Board felt the revised design provided within the Recommendation Packet provided a successful response to the provided EDG guidance. Lighting fixtures have been provided along the perimeter of the site, at each entry, within the central plaza and the through block connection. The site includes landscaping focused within the central courtyard and through block connection and within the 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S setback. The Board noted that the revised design locates entrances to the live/work entrances along 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S consistent with the EDG guidance. However, the Board felt the setback space on 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S remained unresolved and unsuccessful.
  - a) The Board felt that the substantial grade transition on 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S provided a hardship in meeting code required transparency at the required 2-8 feet above

sidewalk grade. The Board recommended a condition that transparency requirements be satisfied from a measurement between 2-8 feet above the finished first floor elevation (PL2-B, PL3-I).

- b) The Board felt the space between the building and the sidewalk must be more sensitive to the single family zone across the street. The Board recommended a condition that the setback should be treated to:
  - i) Incorporate stoops for the live/work units (PL2-B1, PL3-A).
  - ii) Clearly delineate and minimize the back of house commercial uses (DC1-C).
  - iii) Minimize hardscape structures and maximize use of landscaping (PL3-A).
  - iv) Minimize landscape height to provide clear visibility between the sidewalk and live work entries (PL2-B1, PL2-I).
  - v) Enclose or relocate solid waste and recycling staging along the right-ofway (DC1-C).
- 2. Architectural and Material Composition. The Board felt the materiality and composition of each façade provided successful response to the design guidance provided at the EDG meeting. The exterior building materials consist of a concrete base at ground level, aluminum storefront windows, fiber cement panel and lap siding, metal siding, vinyl windows and metal railings. During the Recommendation Meeting, the applicant provided an alternative design for the southeast corner of the building. The revised design provided a defined upper level consistent with the southwest corner.
  - a) The Board recommended a condition to revise the southeast corner of the building to be consistent with the alternative design provided during the presentation (CS2-C1, DC2, CS2-D3).
  - b) The Board recommended a condition that the north façade of the revised southeast corner be treated to be consistent with the window grouping pattern used on the north section of the building in response to the historic school building (DC2-B).
  - a) The Board felt the angular paving pattern within the public plaza should continue into the Roberto Maestas Festival Street to blur the line between private property and the public right-of-way. The Board recommended a condition to coordinate with SDOT to achieve an integrated paving treatment between the plaza and the sidewalk (CS2-B, DC2-D).
  - b) The Board felt the integration of the aspirational artwork represented on pages 86-95 of the Recommendation Packet was very important to the overall success of the culturally significant site. The Board recommended a condition that the applicant report on the status of the artwork integration both at the building permit stage and prior to final Certificate of Occupancy (CS2-A, DC2-D).

#### **DEVELOPMENT STANDARD DEPARTURES**

The following departures were requested:

1. Blank Facades (SMC 23.47A.008 A2): The Code requires blank facades to be limited to 20 feet. The applicant proposes a 43'-6 ½" blank façade.

The Board felt that the substantial grade transition on 17th Avenue S provided a hardship in meeting code required transparency at the required 2-8 feet above sidewalk grade. The Board recommended a condition that transparency requirements be satisfied from a measurement between 2-8 feet above the finished first floor elevation. The Board was not supportive of the singular blank façade located at the sidewalk at the location of the commercial kitchen. The Board felt the building façade should include sufficient transparency to meet the blank façade limitations at this location. Board voted unanimously that the requested blank façade departure along with the suggested treatment of the façade and revisions to the measurement technique better met Design Guideline DC2 Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance- Respect for Adjacent Sites.

 Blank Facades (SMC 23.47A.008 A2): The Code requires blank facades to be no more 40% of the total façade. The applicant proposes a blank façade which is 72% of the total façade along 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S.

The Board felt that the substantial grade transition on 17th Avenue S provided a hardship in meeting code required transparency at the required 2-8 feet above sidewalk grade. The Board recommended a condition that transparency requirements be satisfied from a measurement between 2-8 feet above the finished first floor elevation. The Board was not supportive of the singular blank façade located at the sidewalk at the location of the commercial kitchen. The Board felt the building façade should include sufficient transparency to meet the blank façade limitations at this location. The Board voted unanimously that the requested blank façade departure along with the suggested treatment of the façade and revisions to the measurement technique better met Design Guideline DC2 Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance- Respect for Adjacent Sites and PL2-B Safety and Security.

3. Street Level Setback (SMC 23.47A.008 A3): The Code requires street-level, street-facing facades to be located within 10 feet of the street lot line. The applicant proposes a setback ranging from 25'-5 3/8" to 28'-3".

The Board voted unanimously in support of the departure request, but provided conditions of approval. The Board felt the space between the building and the sidewalk must be treated to be sensitive to the single family zone across the street. The Board recommended a condition that the setback should be treated to incorporate stoops for the live work units, clearly delineate and minimize the back of house commercial uses, minimize hardscape structures and maximize use of landscaping, minimize landscape height to provide clear visibility between the sidewalk and live work entries and enclose or relocate solid waste and recycling staging along the right-of-way. The Board felt the revised setback space should include a quality landscape and hardscape design so that the substantial setback provides an additional buffer between the new six story structure and the single family homes across the street to better meeting Design Guideline CS2-III Height, Bulk and Scale Compatibility.

4. **Transparency (SMC 23.47.008 B2):** The code requires a minimum of 60% of the street facing façade between 2-8 feet be transparent. The applicant proposes a façade transparency of 28% along 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S.

The Board felt that the substantial grade transition on 17th Avenue S provided a hardship in meeting code required transparency at the required 2-8 feet above sidewalk grade. The Board recommended a condition that transparency requirements be satisfied from a measurement between 2-8 feet above the finished first floor elevation. The Board voted unanimously the revised transparency calculation would better meet the intent of design guideline DC2 Beacon Hill Supplemental Guidance- Respect for Adjacent Sites.

5. **Minimum Driveway Width (SMC 23.54.030 F2b2):** The code requires the minimum driveway width for two way non-residential traffic to be 22 feet. The applicant proposes a driveway 14'-3" wide.

The Board unanimously supported the request to minimize the driveway width. The Board noted that the driveway accesses only 5 parking stalls. The Board felt the reduced with of the driveway and curbcut would limit the vehicular impacts on the adjacent pedestrian sidewalk to better meet Design Guideline DC1- B Vehicular Access and Circulation to choose locations for vehicular access, service uses, and delivery areas that minimize conflict between vehicles and non-motorists wherever possible. Emphasize use of the sidewalk for pedestrians, and create safe and attractive conditions for pedestrians, bicyclists, and drivers.

 Transparency (SMC 23.47.008 B2): The code requires a minimum of 60% of the street facing façade between 2-8 feet be transparent. The applicant proposes a façade transparency of 58% along 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue S.

The Board unanimously supported the transparency departure request along 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue S. The Board felt the request was minimal and that substantial transparency had been maintained along the length of the façade and better meet the intent of Design Guideline PL3-C Retail Edges which provides opportunities for a porous edge to engage passersby with opportunities to interact visually with the building interior using glazing and transparency.

#### **BOARD RECOMMENDATION**

The recommendation summarized below was based on the design review packet dated August 12, 2014, and the materials shown and verbally described by the applicant at the August 12, 2014 Design Recommendation meeting. After considering the site and context, hearing public comment, reconsidering the previously identified design priorities and reviewing the materials, the three of the five Design Review Board members recommended APPROVAL of the subject design. The Board recommends the following CONDITIONS (Authority referred in the letter and number in parenthesis):

- 1. Transparency for 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S shall be provided as measured from the area between 2-8 feet above the finished first floor elevation (PL2-B, PL3-I).
- Revise the provided setback on 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue S to incorporate stoops for the live work units, clearly delineate and minimize the back of house commercial uses, minimize hardscape structures and maximize use of landscaping, minimize landscape height to provide clear visibility between the sidewalk and live work entries and enclose or relocate solid waste and recycling staging along the right-of-way (PL2-B1, PL3-A, DC1-C, PL2-I, DC1-C).
- 3. Revise the southeast corner of the building to be consistent with the alternative design provided during the presentation (CS2-C1, DC2, CS2-D3).
- 4. Revise the north façade of southeast corner treatment to be consistent with the window grouping pattern used on the north section of the building in response to the historic school building (DC2-B).
- 5. Coordinate with SDOT to achieve an integrated paving treatment between the plaza and the sidewalk (CS2-B, DC2-D).
- 6. At building permit stage of review and prior to the final Certificate of Occupancy report on the status of funding and integrating the aspirational artwork represented on pages 86-95 of the final recommendation packet (CS2-A, DC2-D).