



# City of Seattle

Department of Planning & Development

Diane M. Sugimura, Director



## FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE EAST DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

Project Number: 3012652

Address: 1515 14th Ave

Applicant: Stevan Johnson, Johnson Architects for Madrona Real Estate

Date of Meeting: Wednesday, April 18, 2012

Board Members Present: Wolf Saar (Chair)  
Dawn Bushnaq  
Ric Cochran  
Chip Wall  
Boting Zhang

Board Members Absent: Lisa Picard

DPD Staff Present: Colin R. Vasquez, Senior Land Use Planner

### SITE & VICINITY

Site Zone: Neighborhood Commercial 3, Pedestrian Street, 65' height (NC3P-65), Pike Pine Urban Center Village, Pike Pine Conservation Overlay District

Nearby Zones: (North) NC3P-40  
(South) NC3P-65  
(East) NC3P-65  
(West) NC3P-65

Lot Area: 20,475 sq. ft.



Current Development: Three single story commercial structures with surface parking. Two of these buildings are over 75 years old and qualify as “Character Structures” per the Pike Pine Conservation Overlay District. The 1515 14th Avenue Building (the Porch Light Building) was built in 1925 and recently renovated. Most of the street facing façade is glazed (large display windows below smaller clerestories. This structure is proposed to be preserved and integrated into the design of the proposed building. The second building, 1525 14th Avenue was built in 1933 and is proposed to be demolished.

Access: From 14th Avenue

Surrounding Development: Variety of styles on 14<sup>th</sup> Avenue between Pike and Pine Streets. The west side is bookended by two century old brick structures with surface parking and several building type in between. The east side is predominantly occupied by a church complex (Seattle Landmark) and surface parking.

ECAs: None

Neighborhood Character: The Pike Pine corridor is historically known as auto row and is characterized by turn-of-the-century loft building with tall fully glazed street level storefront, masonry and timber construction.

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

The proposed project is for the design and construction of a mixed use building with approximately 100 residential units located above 6,400 sq. ft of ground level retail use. All of the parking (approximately 111 stalls) for the proposed development is to be provided in a below grade garage that is accessed from the street. A portion of one of the two existing buildings is proposed to be retained as a character structure.

**FINAL RECOMMENDATION MEETING: April 18, 2012**

**DESIGN DEVELOPMENT**

The proposal includes the preservation of one of the character structures. The building mass above the character structure was set back 15 feet, notches inwards and then extends to the front property line, flush with the retail base. The western elevation was jagged and stepped creating an irregular form. The garage entrance was located on the north end.

*Staff Note: Preservation of one of the two character structures will allow an added ten feet in building height for the entire structure.*

## PUBLIC COMMENT

Approximately 7 members of the public attended this Recommendation meeting. The following comments, issues and concerns were raised:

- Concerned with maintenance of the lower ‘blank wall’ on the south façade.
- Felt that the trees on the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor terrace would create a maintenance problem for the southern property.
- Pleased with the retention of the façade for the Porch Light building and the new façade could be juxtaposed with the old façade. Appreciated that courtyard was located in the center of the building to break up the massing as the proposed massing is enormous compared to the existing buildings.
- Satisfied with the proposed scheme and the façade/floor plan preservation of the Porch Light Building. Supported brick base in keeping with the Capitol Hill context. Added retail is a good addition to the neighborhood. Setting back the building is preferred so that the pedestrian does not feel overwhelmed by the mass.
- Preferred the setback and access to air allowed with the proposed design that created more of a human element with the open spaces.

## PRIORITIES & BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS

After visiting the site, considering the analysis of the site and context provided by the proponents, and hearing public comment, the Design Review Board members provided the following siting and design guidance. The Board identified the Citywide Design Guidelines & Neighborhood specific guidelines (as applicable) of highest priority for this project.

The Neighborhood specific guidelines are summarized below. For the full text please visit the [Design Review website](#).

### A. *Site Planning*

**A-1** ***Responding to Site Characteristics.** The siting of buildings should respond to specific site conditions and opportunities such as non-rectangular lots, location on prominent intersections, unusual topography, significant vegetation and views or other natural features.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board strongly encouraged preservation of the existing character structure. The Board supported the setting back of the building mass above the character structure. In order to emphasize the presence of the character structure, the Board also recommended setting back the new building mass at the ground level, abutting the character structure to give a more distinct expression of this historic building.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board was encouraged by façade/floor plans that preserve the appearance of the existing character structure. The Board supported the setting back of the building mass above the character structure. The new building mass at the ground level, abutting the character structure, has been separated by the residential entry for the building and the new façade presents a distinct yet complimentary structural presentation.

**A-2** **Streetscape Compatibility.** *The siting of buildings should acknowledge and reinforce the existing desirable spatial characteristics of the right-of-way.*

*Capitol Hill-specific supplemental guidance:*

- *Retain or increase the width of sidewalks.*
- *Provide street trees with tree grates or in planter strips, using appropriate species to provide summer shade, winter light and year-round visual interest.*
- *Vehicle entrances to buildings should not dominate the streetscape.*
- *Orient townhouse structures to provide pedestrian entrances to the sidewalk.*
- *For buildings that span a block and “front” on two streets, each street frontage should receive individual and detailed site planning and architectural design treatments to complement the established streetscape character.*
- *New development in commercial zones should be sensitive to neighboring residential zones. Examples include lots on Broadway that extend to streets with residential character, such as Nagle Place or 10th or Harvard Avenues East. While a design with a commercial character is appropriate along Broadway, compatibility with residential character should be emphasized along the other streets.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board emphasized the importance of this guideline and look forward to reviewing greater details at the next meeting. The Board noted that the retail height of the new structure should be 20 feet to respond to the scale of the character structure.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board was please with the applicant’s response to their guidance. The Board noted that the retail height of the new structure is in scale with the character structure.

**A-3** **Entrances Visible from the Street.** *Entries should be clearly identifiable and visible from the street.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board strongly suggested locating the residential entrance at the base of the building notch created by the joining of the existing character structure with the new building mass. The Board also strongly recommended carrying the notch to the ground plane to emphasize the Porch Light building. See also A-1.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board recommendation on the residential entrance at the base of the building notch has been provided and creates the joining of the existing character structure with the new building mass. The recommended notch carried to the ground plan has been incorporated to emphasize the Porch Light building. See also A-1.

**A-4** **Human Activity.** *New development should be sited and designed to encourage human activity on the street.*

**Capitol Hill-specific supplemental guidance:**

- *Provide for sidewalk retail opportunities and connections by allowing for the opening of the storefront to the street and displaying goods to the pedestrian.*
- *Provide for outdoor eating and drinking opportunities on the sidewalk by allowing for the opening the restaurant or café windows to the sidewalk and installing outdoor seating while maintaining pedestrian flow.*
- *Install clear glass windows along the sidewalk to provide visual access into the retail or dining activities that occur inside. Do not block views into the interior spaces with the backs of shelving units or with posters.*

See A-1 and A-2.

**A-5** **Respect for Adjacent Sites.** *Buildings should respect adjacent properties by being located on their sites to minimize disruption of the privacy and outdoor activities of residents in adjacent buildings.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board discussed the importance of sensitivity and privacy to the Chester Building to the north by locating fenestration and/or the light well off center from the fenestration and light well of the Chester Building.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board discussed the importance of sensitivity and privacy with respect to the adjacent properties. The location of the fenestration appears to minimize the disruption of privacy and outdoor activities of residents in the adjacent buildings.

**A-7** **Residential Open Space.** *Residential projects should be sited to maximize opportunities for creating usable, attractive, well-integrated open space.*

**Capitol Hill-specific supplemental guidance:**

- Incorporate quasi-public open space with new residential development or redevelopment, with special focus on corner landscape treatments and courtyard entries.
- Create substantial courtyard-style open space that is visually accessible to the public view.
- Set back development where appropriate to preserve a view corridor.
- Set back upper floors to provide solar access to the sidewalk and/or neighboring properties.
- Mature street trees have a high value to the neighborhood and departures from development standards that an arborist determines would impair the health of a mature tree are discouraged.
- Use landscape materials that are sustainable, requiring minimal irrigation or fertilizer.
- Use porous paving materials to minimize stormwater run-off.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board stated that they look forward to reviewing the details of the second level terrace plans at the next meeting.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board stated that they were pleased the second level and upper level terrace plans.

**A-8** ***Parking and Vehicle Access.** Siting should minimize the impact of automobile parking and driveways on the pedestrian environment, adjacent properties, and pedestrian safety.*

**Capitol Hill-specific supplemental guidance:**

- *Preserve and enhance the pedestrian environment in residential and commercial areas by providing for continuous sidewalks that are unencumbered by parked vehicles and are minimally broken within a block by vehicular access.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board stated that the quality of the building should not be compromised by the provision of parking and locating the driveway access from the street. The presence of the driveway should be minimized and strive to enhance the streetscape, rather than create an intrusion.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board stated that the location of the parking driveway access from the street does not compromise the quality of the building. However, the garage entry door must match the finish colors of the storefront.

**B. Height, Bulk and Scale**

**B-1** ***Height, Bulk, and Scale Compatibility.** Projects should be compatible with the scale of development anticipated by the applicable Land Use Policies for the surrounding area and should be sited and designed to provide a sensitive transition to near-by, less intensive*

zones. Projects on zone edges should be developed in a manner that creates a step in perceived height, bulk, and scale between anticipated development potential of the adjacent zones.

**Capitol Hill-specific supplemental guidance:**

- Break up building mass by incorporating different façade treatments to give the impression of multiple, small-scale buildings, in keeping with the established development pattern.
- Consider existing views to downtown Seattle, the Space Needle, Elliott Bay and the Olympic Mountains, and incorporate site and building design features that may help to preserve those views from public rights-of-way.
- Design new buildings to maximize the amount of sunshine on adjacent sidewalks throughout the year.

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board expressed concern about the building massing and how it relates to the preservation of the character structure. The proportion of the character structure appears diminutive compared the building mass proposed to envelope it; thus the new building should be modulated to shift away from and consequently highlight the character structure. The architectural cues of the character structure should also inform the design of the new building. The Board suggested setting back the massing above 40 feet to minimize the height, bulk and scale of the new structure and relate better to the scale of the preserved character structure. The other option would be to set back the building above 20 feet to distinguish the retail base and respond to the datum line established by the Porch Light structure.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board satisfied by the building massing and how it relates to the preservation of the character structure. The proportion of the character structure appears diminutive compared the building mass proposed to envelope it; thus the new building has been modulated to shift away from and consequently highlight the character structure. The architectural cues of the character structure have been informed in the design of the new building. The Board suggestions of setting back the upper massing, minimizes the height, bulk and scale of the new structure and results in a better scale relationship with the replicated character structure.

**C. Architectural Elements and Materials**

- C-1 Architectural Context.** *New buildings proposed for existing neighborhoods with a well-defined and desirable character should be compatible with or complement the architectural character and siting pattern of neighboring buildings.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board strongly supported preservation of the character structure. The specified that if the character structure is proposed to be demolished, then a Second EDG meeting is needed.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board strongly supported preservation of the façade of the character structure. The floor plan layout that currently is found in the character structure has been carried forward in the new portion of the structure.

**C-2 Architectural Concept and Consistency.** *Building design elements, details and massing should create a well-proportioned and unified building form and exhibit an overall architectural concept. Buildings should exhibit form and features identifying the functions within the building. In general, the roofline or top of the structure should be clearly distinguished from its facade walls.*

**Capitol Hill-specific supplemental guidance:**

- *Incorporate signage that is consistent with the existing or intended character of the building and the neighborhood.*
- *Solid canopies or fabric awnings over the sidewalk are preferred.*
- *Avoid using vinyl awnings that also serve as big, illuminated signs.*
- *Use materials and design that is compatible with the structures in the vicinity if those represent the desired neighborhood character.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that the architectural concept for the upper floors along the south and west elevation include jagged, irregular massing that is out of sync with the architecture presented at the front (east) elevation. The Board agreed that all of the building elevations should relate to each other and avoid creating irregular forms that are not well integrated into the overall building concept. The building concept and architecture should be clearly established along the front façade and then inform side and rear elevations.

The Board suggested including the 20-foot retail height (with mezzanine) in the northern half of the building to respond to the same condition of the character structure. The Board would like to see more details of the character structure and the mezzanine typology. This examination should inform the design of the proposed building.

The Board recommended that the northern portion of the building relate to the 20-foot base either in plane or set back as a way of acknowledging the unique conditions associated with each half of the development.

The Board supported maintaining light and air to the building wherever possible. The light slot along the north side should be strengthened to emphasize the access to light and air.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board noted that the architectural concept for the upper floors along the south and west elevation is now in sync with the structures presentation. All of the buildings elevations relate to each other and create regulate forms that result in a well-integrated building concept.

The Board suggested that the retail height (with mezzanine) in the northern half of the building responds to the same condition found in the character structure.

The Board recommendation that the northern portion of the building relate to the base either in plane acknowledges the unique conditions associated with each half of the development.

The structure maintains light and air to the building wherever possible.

**C-3** **Human Scale.** *The design of new buildings should incorporate architectural features, elements, and details to achieve a good human scale.*

**Capitol Hill-specific supplemental guidance:**

- *Incorporate building entry treatments that are arched or framed in a manner that welcomes people and protects them from the elements and emphasizes the building's architecture.*
- *Improve and support pedestrian-orientation by using components such as: non-reflective storefront windows and transoms; pedestrian-scaled awnings; architectural detailing on the first floor; and detailing at the roof line.*

See discussion of the retail base and character structure under A-1, A-2 and A-3.

**C-4** **Exterior Finish Materials.** *Building exteriors should be constructed of durable and maintainable materials that are attractive even when viewed up close. Materials that have texture, pattern, or lend themselves to a high quality of detailing are encouraged.*

**Capitol Hill-specific supplemental guidance:**

- *Use wood shingles or board and batten siding on residential structures.*
- *Avoid wood or metal siding materials on commercial structures.*
- *Provide operable windows, especially on storefronts.*
- *Use materials that are consistent with the existing or intended neighborhood character, including brick, cast stone, architectural stone, terracotta details, and concrete that incorporates texture and color.*

- *Consider each building as a high-quality, long-term addition to the neighborhood; exterior design and materials should exhibit permanence and quality appropriate to the Capitol Hill neighborhood.*
- *The use of applied foam ornamentation and EIFS (Exterior Insulation & Finish System) is discouraged, especially on ground level locations.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board discussed that the materials should be very high quality and that brick is highly desired. Stucco would not be considered an appropriate material. Use of brick, particularly at the base for a strong street presence is recommended.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board discussed that the materials appear to be of a very high quality and that brick has been incorporated at the base for a strong street presence as recommended.

**C-5** **Structured Parking Entrances.** *The presence and appearance of garage entrances should be minimized so that they do not dominate the street frontage of a building.*

See also A-8.

<b>D. Pedestrian Environment</b>
----------------------------------

**D-2** **Blank Walls.** *Buildings should avoid large blank walls facing the street, especially near sidewalks. Where blank walls are unavoidable they should receive design treatment to increase pedestrian comfort and interest.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board stressed that the blank wall condition of the north elevation needs design treatment and/or articulation to provide visual relief of the blank facade. The design of the elevation should respect and respond to the Chester Building. The Board suggested expanding the light well configuration.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board stressed that the blank wall condition of the north elevation has received a design treatment that provides a visual relief.

**D-6** **Screening of Dumpsters, Utilities, and Service Areas.** *Building sites should locate service elements like trash dumpsters, loading docks and mechanical equipment away from the street front where possible. When elements such as dumpsters, utility meters, mechanical units and service areas cannot be located away from the street front, they should be situated and screened from view and should not be located in the pedestrian right-of-way.*

**Capitol Hill-specific supplemental guidance:**

- *Consolidate and screen dumpsters to preserve and enhance the pedestrian environment.*

***Broadway-specific supplemental guidance:***

- *For new development along Broadway that extends to streets with residential character—such as Nagle Place or 10th or Harvard Avenues East—any vehicle access, loading or service activities should be screened and designed with features appropriate for a residential context.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that they will want to see more information at the next meeting regarding the garbage and recycling service access and program.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board reviewed the garbage/recycling service access and program. No comments were required by the Board.

**D-9 Commercial Signage.** *Signs should add interest to the street front environment and should be appropriate for the scale and character desired in the area.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that the next meeting should include information responding to this guideline.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board noted that a condition should be included in the Master Use Permit to insure that signage shall be of a scale and character desired in the area.

**D-10 Commercial Lighting.** *Appropriate levels of lighting should be provided in order to promote visual interest and a sense of security for people in commercial districts during evening hours. Lighting may be provided by incorporation into the building façade, the underside of overhead weather protection, on and around street furniture, in merchandising display windows, in landscaped areas, and/or on signage.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that the next meeting should include information responding to this guideline.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board noted that the lighting plan appear to promote an appropriate level of lighting, visual interest and a sense of security during evening hours.

**D-11 Commercial Transparency.** *Commercial storefronts should be transparent, allowing for a direct visual connection between pedestrians on the sidewalk and the activities occurring on the interior of a building. Blank walls should be avoided.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board noted that the next meeting should include information responding to this guideline. The Board noted they expect to see full transparency for the length of the building.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board noted that the commercial storefronts are transparent, allowing for a visual connections between pedestrians on the sidewalk and the activities occurring on the interior of the building. Blank walls have been minimized.

## **E. Landscaping**

**E-2 Landscaping to Enhance the Building and/or Site.** *Landscaping, including living plant material, special pavements, trellises, screen walls, planters, site furniture, and similar features should be appropriately incorporated into the design to enhance the project.*

At the Early Design Guidance Meeting, the Board discussed the opportunities for landscape and hardscape features and programming of the wide sidewalk right-of-way, as well as the two second level terrace areas. At the next meeting, the Board looks forward to reviewing a well designed landscape plan for all three of the unique spaces.

At the Final Recommendation Meeting, the Board discussed the landscaping and hardscape features and programing; at the sidewalk level, second and upper terrace areas. The designs are appropriately incorporated into the design and enhance the project.

## **DEVELOPMENT STANDARD DEPARTURES**

At the time of the Early Design Guidance meeting, no departures were requested.

## **BOARD DIRECTION**

**At the conclusion of the Recommendation meeting, the Board recommended that:**

1. Sidewalk/storefront- Existing width to continue (Board cannot affect); posts @ canopy to be kept out of main walking surface (aligned with planters).
2. Porch Light — OK to be preserved as ‘Character Structure’.
3. A Flat of Curved Storefront will work for the design.

4. Blank Walls — A number of comments from public; developer has right to build to property line and this project is sensitive; not a huge portion of the structure and materials are consistent.
5. Garage Entry — 10' brick to go into garage opening and door to match other building appendages (balconies, lighting, metal canopies) and windows.
6. Material and Details- Metal (low reflective); cornice, should extend in on south part at entry and on north wall depth should be reflected on brick portion even if it cannot extend out as it does on the eastern face.
7. Planting- Trees OK in the ROW and terrace Character Structure Bonus- OK, allows 10' height bonus thru preserving façade, maintaining 3-D aspect (reclaimed brick to wrap at northern wall of Character Structure), maintaining ceiling height, accommodating/ encouraging similar existing uses, north portion (new) has high retail with mezzanines are exceptional.
8. Departure Sight Triangle- OK, work with DPD staff to ensure proper warning system

**Result:**

Unanimous Approval from the Board

**No additional meetings are required with the Board.**