



The City of Seattle

## Landmarks Preservation Board

Mailing Address: PO Box 94649, Seattle WA 98124-4649

Street Address: 600 4th Avenue, 4th Floor

LPB 754/18

### **REPORT ON DESIGNATION**

Name and Address of Property: **Donahoe Building / Bergman Luggage  
1901-1911 3rd Avenue**

Legal Description: Lots 10-11, Block 46, Addition to the Town of Seattle, as laid out by A. A. Denny (commonly known as A. A. Denny's 6th Addition to the City of Seattle), according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Volume 1 of Plats, page(s) 99, in King County, Washington; EXCEPT the Northeasterly 12 Feet thereof heretofore condemned in King County Superior Court Cause Number 52280 for widening of 3rd Avenue, as provided by Ordinance Number 13776 of the City of Seattle.

At the public meeting held on December 19, 2018 the City of Seattle's Landmarks Preservation Board voted to approve designation of the Donahoe Building / Bergman Luggage at 1901-1911 3rd Avenue as a Seattle Landmark based upon satisfaction of the following standard for designation of SMC 25.12.350:

- D. It embodies the distinctive visible characteristics of an architectural style, or period, or a method of construction.*
- F. Because of its prominence of spatial location, contrasts of siting, age, or scale, it is an easily identifiable visual feature of its neighborhood or the City and contributes to the distinctive quality or identity of such neighborhood or the City.*

### **DESCRIPTION**

#### **Site and Neighborhood context**

The subject property is located at the northwest corner of 3rd Avenue and Stewart Street in downtown Seattle, at the edge of the Belltown/Denny Regrade neighborhood. The parcel is rectangular in plan, measuring approximately 120 by 108 feet. The site is gently sloped, dropping nine feet from northwest to southeast building corner (for purposes of this report, the

3rd Avenue elevation will be considered east). The subject building fills the parcel. There is an alley along the west side or rear of the property.

To the north, sharing a property line, is a six-story steel-frame and terra-cotta-clad Belltown Self Storage building, constructed in 1928 as a parking garage and designed by Henry Bittman. Also known as the White Garage, the building is a designated Seattle landmark.

To the west, across the alley, sharing a property line, is the fourteen-story Josephinum, a reinforced concrete frame and brick clad apartment building constructed in 1907 as the New Washington Hotel. It is today owned by the Seattle Catholic Archdiocesan Housing Authority and is a designated Seattle landmark. Also, to the northwest, across the alley, is the Moore Theater and Moore Hotel, a seven-story steel-frame building constructed in 1907 and clad in white glazed terra cotta. It is also a designated Seattle city landmark. The property was developed by James Moore, developer of several Seattle neighborhoods and had been on the site of his Hotel Washington, which occupied two blocks. The Moore Theater seats 1,800 persons and is the oldest still-active theater in the city.

To the east, across the street, is the Securities Building, a ten-story steel frame and terra-cotta-clad office building constructed in 1913, with additions in 1925 and 1947. The Securities Building is a designated Seattle landmark. Adjacent to it, northeast of the subject property, is a four-story mixed-use building which houses a Bed Bath & Beyond store with sidewalk access on two floors, due to the grade. The reinforced concrete structure was originally built in 1929 as the two-story Security Public Market, with Art Deco exterior details. In 1951, two floors were added to serve as a parking garage.

To the southeast of the subject property, across the street, is the Macy's Department Store building, constructed in 1929 as the Bon Marche Department Store. Occupying an entire city block, the seven-story Art Deco style masonry building is currently being remodeled to adapt the upper six floors to office space. The building is a designated Seattle landmark.

To the south of the subject property, across the street, is the former Bon Marche parking garage, a nine-story Modern-style reinforced concrete automobile parking garage and retail building constructed in 1959-60. Designed by George Applegarth, it was reportedly only the second garage in the country to utilize a spiral ramp for self-parking, the first being a similar structure by Applegarth constructed in San Francisco in 1955.

Including those mentioned above, below are listed the Seattle designated landmarks within a two-block radius:

- Josephinum Apartments (1907-08, Eames & Young) at 2nd & Stewart.
- Moore Theater and Moore Hotel (1907, Edwin Houghton) at 2nd & Virginia.
- Palladian Hotel (1910, William P. White) at 2nd & Virginia.
- Times Square Building (1913-1915, Bebb & Gould) at 4th & Stewart.
- Terminal Sales Annex/Puget Sound News Co. (1915, Bebb & Gould) at 1931 2nd Avenue.
- Securities Building (1913, Frank Allen & John Graham Sr.) at 3rd & Stewart.
- Terminal Sales Building (1923, Henry Bittman) at 1932 1st Avenue.

- White Garage (1928, Henry Bittman) at 1915 3rd Avenue.
- Bon Marche/Macy's store (1929, John Graham Sr.) at 3rd & Stewart.

Additionally, the eastern edge of the Pike Place Market Historical District lies two blocks away, along the west side of 1st Avenue between Virginia Street and Pike Street.

For city planning purposes, the subject parcel is zoned DMC 240/290-440 (Downtown Mixed Commercial with an allowed height between 240 and 440 feet), and is located in the Belltown Urban Center Village.

### **Building description**

The subject building was constructed in 1921 by Anna Meloy Donahoe as an automobile sales showroom and service garage for the Alfred Ayerst Inc. Ford Automobile dealership (it does not appear to have been used as a storage or public parking garage). Only three years later, the tenant automobile dealership left, and the building was subdivided into separate storefronts for a variety of tenant shops and services, a condition that remains today. [See Figs. 4-35 for current images of the subject building]

### **Exterior and structure**

The building is a two-story unreinforced masonry building on a concrete foundation with terra cotta cladding on the two primary street elevations (south facing Stewart Street, and east facing 3rd Avenue), and red common brick on the alley or west elevation. Interior supports are heavy timber post and beam. The flat, nail-laminated timber built-up roof is hidden from the street by an elaborate terra cotta parapet on the street elevations, and a low parapet on the alley side with a sheet metal parapet cap (as a result of the 2001 Nisqually earthquake, the alley parapet was damaged and later patched; the terra cotta parapet was undamaged but strengthened with anchors). The subject building has no basement.

The building was designed as an enframed commercial block in the Spanish Eclectic style, originally clad entirely in terra cotta. The building structure is organized into six wide window bays along both the south and east primary elevations, measuring approximately 108 and 120 feet respectively. The four center bays of each elevation feature segmented arches at the upper floor, separated from the first-floor squared header windows by recessed decorative window panels. The first and last bays of both building corners are strongly emphasized by a raised, curving parapets having decorative finials and other projecting terra cotta details, as well as contrasting window openings as compared to the center four bays. At the end bays, the upper window is squared with projecting header and sill features, while the first-floor window features a three-point (or basket-handle) arch. The parapet emphasizes the bay structure, with red tile pent roofs separated by piers at the center four bays. The red tile pent roofs are further emphasized by raised entablature elements punctuated by a center roundel.

Not all of the original terra cotta remains intact. At the first-floor southeast building corner, consisting of four bays on the south elevation and two bays on the east elevation, the terra cotta was removed between 1959 and 1961 for the installation of a Modern-style façade for a bank branch. Around 1989, that façade was removed. Today, these bays are finished with cementitious stucco, scored and painted to resemble masonry, which was applied around 1989.

Windows presently are a mix of eras and materials. While not original to 1921, the wood windows at the second floor of the 3rd Avenue (east) elevation date to between 1923 and 1937 (probably installed during the 1924 alterations). They are divided into three or four large vertically-oriented panes that pivot on a central horizontal axis. Original wood multi-light transoms appear to remain intact at the first floor first and second bays along Stewart Street, and at the sixth bay on 3rd Avenue.

Non-original windows are at all other locations. The second floor Stewart Street (south) elevation windows are aluminum and appear to date to the mid-20th century, with unequally divided 3-over-3 or 4-over-4 panes, all fixed with two each operable awning-style panes on the lower portion. Storefronts at the first and second bays on Stewart Street below the transoms appear to date from the mid-20th century, although the tile bulkhead at the first bay may be original, as it appears to match the typical bulkheads visible in the 1937 tax assessor photograph. All other first floor storefronts on both street elevations date to the late 1980s, or more recent decades, and feature simple transoms somewhat echoing the original window configuration. At the third and fifth bays of the 3rd Avenue elevation are non-original decorative wooden doors or brackets which were installed in recent decades as part of a tenant restaurant's improvements.

Both street-facing elevations feature prominent neon signs for tenant Bergman Luggage, as well as a vertically-oriented corner sign with a clock, affixed between the first and second floors. These elements date to the 1990s and are not original.

The alley or west elevation is utilitarian, and features brick arch windows at both floors, many with original metal sash and fretted translucent glass. According to the original 1921 architectural drawings, the first or northernmost bay of the alley was originally a garage opening to a ramp leading to the upper floor. However, this condition was removed in the 1924 alterations, when it was replaced with a freight elevator.

### **Interior**

The first-floor interior spaces have been significantly altered over time to accommodate various tenants. Tax records indicate that ceiling heights are 15 feet at the first floor, and 12 feet 9 inches at the second floor. Original finishes were plaster walls with brick and fir trim, and a concrete floor.

Today, finishes include gypsum wall board and contemporary flooring such as vinyl or carpet. Heavy timber interior supports are boxed for fire protection and not exposed.

The second-floor interior space is in very poor condition and has not been leased for decades. It is stabilized but not in an occupiable state, following past roof repairs and partially-completed interior partition walls.

### Summary of primary alterations

Since original construction in 1921, the subject building has undergone numerous interior alterations, and significant alterations to the exterior storefronts. Permits and historic tax assessor photographs provide information regarding alterations to the building.

There are many historic building permits on file for alterations to the property; most are for minor interior partition alterations, signage, awnings, mechanical work, and the like. Below are those with more significant valuations (in excess of \$10,000):

Permit	Year	Cost	Comments
204311	1921	\$30,000	Build 2-story garage (108x120, mill, public garage)
239656	1924	\$10,000	Divide into stores per plan (loft & stores)
478819	1959	\$15,000	Alter portion of 1st floor (108x120, bank)
487708	1961	\$50,000	Alter main floor of building (bank, stores, offices)
559055	1975	\$30,000	Alter portions of 1st & 2nd floor
601109	1982	\$15,000	Alt to int of exist. bank/office/bus school bldg (office)
604332	1982	\$48,000	Alter retail store & est. use as fast-food rest. (rest)

As part of the 1924 alterations to the building to adapt it from an automobile dealership and service garage to multiple retail storefronts, changes were made to the first four bays at the first floor of the south or Stewart Street elevation (visible in 1921 and 1923 Seattle Times newspaper article images). Originally, the first three bays featured smaller window openings than are there now, supported on higher bulkheads. The fourth bay was originally a garage entrance to the rear part of the first floor. According to 1924 architectural drawings and the 1937 tax assessor photo, after 1924 most (but not all) of the bays were outfitted with recessed storefront entries.

Additionally, in 1921—as evidenced by original architectural drawings and the 1921 and 1923 Seattle Times images—all of the upper floor windows, and the first three bays of windows at the first floor on the south elevation, were multi-light. By 1937 (probably as part of the 1924 alterations), these windows were replaced with single-pane windows.

Below is a summary of the primary alterations to the building, since 1924:

- All storefronts at the first floor are non-original, although original first floor wood transoms remain at bays 1-2 along Stewart Street, and at bay 6 on 3rd Avenue. (Since 1937)
- Original terra cotta cladding was removed from the first floor level of bays 3-6 on the Stewart Street elevation, and bays 1-2 on 3rd Avenue elevation, and replaced in 1959-1961 with a red granite Modern-style façade to serve as a People’s National Bank branch. Around 1989, the present owner removed that Modern façade, and replaced it with the current painted stucco finish, scored to appear as masonry.
- Collapse of roof at two locations, and subsequent repairs (c. late 1980s).
- Roof parapet at alley collapsed and removed after Nisqually earthquake. (c.2001)
- No significant interiors remain; all have been altered to suit tenants over time.

## **SIGNIFICANCE**

### **The development of the neighborhood**

The subject building, at 3rd Avenue and Stewart Street, is located at the north end of the downtown neighborhood and the south edge of the Belltown/Denny Regrade neighborhood. Both neighborhoods have shaped the development of the site. [See Figs. 36-48 for historic images of the neighborhood]

### **Downtown**

The original downtown core of Seattle had developed around Pioneer Square, but steep hills to the east resulted in a steady expansion northwestward, primarily along the gentler grade of 1st and 2nd Avenues. Several factors drove this expansion, including the rebuilding of the downtown area following the 1889 Great Fire, and the explosive economic and population growth of the city following the 1897 Alaska Gold Rush—from 43,000 persons in 1890, to 240,000 in 1910 (part of the increased figures due to several expansions of city limits during those decades). Other factors associated with growth in this corridor included the removal of the University of Washington from downtown in 1895 and the development of the Metropolitan Tract there in the following decades; the installation of streetcars along 1st and 2nd Avenues beginning in the 1890s; and the regrading of Denny Hill to the north. 2nd Avenue around Columbia Street developed into the city's banking center around 1900, and 2nd Avenue in the blocks north around Pike Street became home to the city's major retailers and department stores. 2nd Avenue served as the primary spine through downtown and became the main route for city parades and festivals.

In the late 1800s, the subject parcel was located at the top of Denny Hill, a large and steeply-sided landmass located north of Pine Street between about First and Seventh Avenues. The parcel was part of the grounds of the enormous Denny Hotel (later known as the Washington Hotel or Hotel Washington) which dominated the hilltop. The hotel was begun in 1890, but not completed until 1903, when it was purchased by James Moore, who also developed Seattle's original Capitol Hill and University District neighborhoods. The hotel property covered two city blocks, from 2nd to 4th Avenues, and from Stewart to Virginia Street. Coming from the south, 3rd Avenue simply stopped at the hotel property and continued on the north side. Denny Hill and the blocks around the hotel were largely residential; period photographs and the 1905 Sanborn map show single family houses, two-and-three story wood-framed flats, row houses, tenements, and small shops with lodgings on upper floors.

Because Denny Hill presented a formidable blockade to commercial expansion northward, its removal had been proposed by civic leaders beginning around 1890. The primary advocate for the regrade was Reginald H. Thomson, who was the longtime City Engineer from the 1890s to 1911 (and again briefly in the 1930s), who sought to encourage development and to improve water and sewage systems in the city. Through regrading, the hill was removed in several phases between about 1905 and 1930, which opened up 2nd through 5th Avenues between Pine and Cedar Streets for development. The Denny/Washington Hotel was demolished by 1905-1906, and the subject site was reduced approximately one hundred feet in elevation.

Regrading dramatically increased land values in the area. Early construction in this newly-improved area resulted in the growth of a retail, shopping, and hotel hub for the city in the 1910s through the 1920s, initially centered between 2nd and 5th Avenues, and particularly along Pine and Pike Streets. There was also an increase of construction of hotels and apartment hotels near the subject site, not only because of the regrade, but also due to continued population growth, the establishment of the nearby Pike Place Market in 1907, and the anticipation of the Alaska-Yukon-Pacific Exposition in 1909. In general, these new structures were larger and constructed of masonry or concrete, rather than wood frame. Additionally, this development also coincided with the popularity of terra cotta as a building cladding element, so many buildings in the area reflect that use of that material. The seven-story Eitel Building (1904, 1906) was the earliest substantial building to be constructed as far north as Pike Street, and was used as offices. Closer to the subject site, only one or two blocks away, were other early, large buildings to be constructed after the Denny Hill regrade, including the seven-story Moore Hotel and Theater (Edwin W. Houghton, 1907), the fourteen-story New Washington Hotel / Josephinum (Eames & Young, 1907-08), the nine-story Standard Furniture Building (A. W. Gould, 1907-08), and the St. Regis Hotel (1909). However, rarely was the scale of these buildings reached on the blocks north of Virginia Street until several decades later. Behind 2nd Avenue, period photographs show newly leveled, mostly empty blocks available for development.

In 1910, the newly regraded area was proposed as a new Beaux-Arts civic center, the epicenter of which was to be at about 4th Avenue and Blanchard Street, a few blocks north of the subject site. This proposal, called the Bogue Plan, would have relocated the heart of downtown to the regrade district but was soundly defeated at the polls in 1912. Unfortunately, rather than attracting development, the regraded area instead grew slowly for many decades. [See Belltown/Denny Regrade section below].

However, to the southeast of the subject site, the retail and commercial core was closer to the center of downtown and continued to grow and expand into the late 1920s. The announcement by Frederick & Nelson in 1914 that they would construct a new flagship store at 5th Avenue and Pine Street heralded the move of the major retailers and department stores from 2nd Avenue eastward to the Fifth and Pine area. A major nearby project was the construction of the Bon Marche department store (1929, John Graham Sr., with a multistory addition in the 1950s), filling the block between Stewart and Pine Streets, and 3rd and 4th Avenues.

On 3rd Avenue, the parcels around the subject site were largely built out by 1930. The ornate Beaux-Arts style Securities Building at 3rd & Stewart was designed by Frank Allen and John Graham Sr. and constructed in 1913. Adjacent to the subject building to the north are three buildings, the White Garage (Henry Bittman, 1928, a Seattle landmark), the Kelley-Gorham Building a.k.a. Haddon Hall Apartments (1910), and the Rhodes Brothers/Heiden Building (1920, Victor Voorhees). At the north end of the block is an open, two-level parking garage, built in 1966 on the site of the demolished c.1916 one-story Mutual Film Company building. North of that building, across Virginia Avenue at the northwest corner of 3rd and Virginia, is a two-story commercial building constructed in 1919 as the Bayley Garage, now occupied by Swifty Printing. At the northeast corner of 3rd & Virginia was a modest, one-story c.1920

masonry building constructed as a bus depot (demolished in the 1960s-70s and now a parking lot).

Another major presence in the area was the Security Public Market (1929) across 3rd Avenue from the subject site and adjacent to the Securities Building, which included food stalls, small retailers, and parking on the roof. Two stories of additional parking were added in 1951. Additional parking was constructed mid-block between the market and the Securities Building in the 1960s.

#### Belltown/Denny Regrade

Immediately north of the subject site, beyond Virginia or Lenora Streets, is the Belltown/Denny Regrade neighborhood, which developed independently of the Pioneer Square area.

The term “Belltown” originally referred to the area north of downtown along 1st and 2nd Avenues, between Pine and Denny, but particularly around Bell Street. The later term “Denny Regrade” referred to a larger area cleared by the regrading of Denny Hill, extending eastward to about Fifth Avenue or Westlake.

The Belltown neighborhood north of downtown was originally part of the land claim of early Seattle settler William Nathaniel Bell and his wife Sarah. The claim stretched from Elliott Bay eastward to today’s Yale Avenue, and from Pine Street to Denny Way. Within the claim area was an existing Native American semi-permanent winter settlement around the beach at the foot of Bell Street, which included longhouses over one hundred feet in length.

Although Nathaniel Bell, his wife, and four children were among the members of the original pioneering Denny party which arrived at Alki in 1851, they left for California a few years later, in 1856, after their cabin was burned during the brief skirmish with Native American locals known as the “Battle of Seattle.” Sarah Bell died in 1856 after the move, and Bell only returned briefly to Seattle in the 1860s to plat his land. In 1870, he and his son Austin—who had been born in Seattle during the five years the family resided there—moved permanently back to encourage the development of his properties, which had lagged behind the development of the Pioneer Square area. Part of the reason for the slow development of Bell’s properties was due to the steep grade of First Avenue (then called Front Street) and 2nd Avenues over Denny Hill, which separated the area from downtown to the south.

Nevertheless, by 1880, Belltown had more than fifty houses, at least two churches, a two-room school, and a grocery store. In 1884, the neighborhood was significant enough to be included in Sanborn fire insurance maps, and the neighborhood could boast the two-story Denny School at Fifth Avenue and Battery Street, Bell’s own Bellevue Hotel at First and Battery, and many more houses and duplexes. On the waterfront below 1st Avenue were two barrel manufactories, two wharves, a shipyard, sawmill, furniture company, and additional workers’ cottages.

In 1887, Nathaniel Bell died. His son, Austin, hired architect Elmer Fisher to design the five-story Austin Bell Building, next door to the Bellevue Hotel, which was completed by his wife



after Austin Bell's death in 1889. That same year, Fisher also designed the four-story Odd Fellows Hall (now the Barnes Building) next door to the Austin Bell Building, as well as the Hull Building across the street. These buildings served as the core of a three-block long commercial area along 1st Avenue between Battery and Lenora. Fisher would go on to design numerous structures in the Pioneer Square area following the great Seattle fire, which also occurred in 1889. The cluster of these substantial, multistory, relatively ornate structures, on the other side of Denny Hill from the urban core that had developed in the Pioneer Square area, helped to give the Belltown area a distinct identity, although commercial growth remained modest. The largest other nearby structure was the Denny (later Washington) Hotel, at the top of Denny Hill around Stewart Street and 3rd Avenue.

In 1889, the first electric streetcar service to Belltown was installed along 2nd Avenue, extending from James Street to Denny Way. In a few years, additional lines would run down First and Fifth Avenues, connecting the neighborhood to the expanding city. By the final years of the 19th century and into the early 1900s, Belltown was a well-developed but low-density residential area, with a mix of housing types available to all income levels and social levels. Options in the neighborhood included single family homes, duplexes, triplexes, rowhouses, apartment hotels, boarding houses, worker's hotels, rooming houses, and tenements.

After the regrading of Denny Hill was completed to 5th Avenue by about 1910, the Belltown/Regrade area north of the subject site grew slowly compared to other parts of downtown. Following the economic slowdown associated with World War I, there was a flurry of two- to four-story apartment and commercial building construction in the 1920s. Affordable apartment buildings convenient to downtown were an attractive option for single women, who were increasingly entering the workforce at that time due to changing social and economic conditions. In 1923, the institution of a new city zoning code had the result that higher buildings were encouraged downtown, but not in the Belltown/Regrade area, which was designated "Commercial" and remained relatively low-density. One- and two-story commercial buildings in the neighborhood continued to cater to light industrial or heavy commercial businesses—such as printers, suppliers, garages and other services related to the growing automobile business, and even the film distribution industry—all of which benefited from proximity to downtown but without the expensive land costs or congestion. Belltown was the center of Seattle's taxicab business and touring companies. In this climate the subject building was constructed, in 1921.

Very little residential construction occurred in the neighborhood during the economic downturn of the 1930s and during the material-rationing war years of the 1940s. Much of the existing housing stock deteriorated. The parts of Belltown west of 3rd Avenue were considered comparable to Seattle's "Skid Road" in Pioneer Square. Dwelling units there were among the oldest and most crowded in the city and consisted of worker's cottages and cheap hotels often with no private toilet or bath. The area population had a high percentage of older and unemployed males. East of 3rd Avenue, conditions were better, due to the numerous relatively new brick apartment buildings that had been built there in the 1920s after the regrade, and which were more likely to be occupied by female clerical and sales force workers employed downtown. However, the local economy improved during the war years, in part due to Boeing

and other defense-related jobs, and Belltown was well situated to provide housing and entertainment for servicemen, waterfront workers, and defense workers.

In the post-war years of the 1940s and 1950s, local and national economic and housing trends emphasized the growth of the suburbs rather than city centers and accommodating the automobile. Belltown continued to be largely seen as a service area to support downtown. Between 1952 and 1954, the Battery Street tunnel was constructed in a cut-and-fill fashion in order to connect the c.1930s Highway 99/Aurora Avenue with the newly-completed Alaskan Way Viaduct along the downtown waterfront. In 1957, a new zoning ordinance designated Belltown as a “General Commercial” area, which had the effect of discouraging new housing. The waterfront area continued to be classified as a manufacturing zone, as it had long been, which encouraged continuing construction of small warehouses and additional light industrial buildings in the neighborhood.

By the 1960s, parking lots were a common feature in Belltown, driven in part by the downtown commercial core to the south, and the construction of the 1962 Century 21 Exposition (later the Seattle Center) at the north end of the neighborhood. The easternmost part of Belltown, between Fifth Avenue and Denny Way, had become characterized by numerous car lots and automobile dealerships after remaining undeveloped for many decades. Suburban-style motels with expansive parking lots also developed in this area, in anticipation of the fair. The construction of the above-grade monorail to connect downtown with the world’s fair exposition grounds further emphasized Belltown as a place to move through, rather than a destination in itself.

The perception of Belltown as a service area to support downtown was further emphasized by a proposed comprehensive plan adopted by the city council in 1963, known as the Monson Plan. To stave off the increasing possibility of businesses fleeing downtown for the suburbs, the scheme emphasized automobile access and parking. It proposed (among other things) surrounding downtown with high-speed ring roads through Belltown, and a large parking/office structure to replace a demolished Pike Place Market. Public resistance to and rejection of the plan, and to similar citywide proposals in the 1970s, led to a movement to establish the local historic preservation program in 1973 and the protection of the Pike Place Market, Pioneer Square, and other areas.

In the early 1970s, Belltown continued to be marked by deteriorating worker hotels and other housing built earlier in the century. A major fire in a Belltown apartment building called the Ozark Hotel led to stricter fire safety regulations in the city, including mandatory sprinkler systems above the ground floor. An unexpected result was that rather than upgrading, some building owners simply closed off upper floors and left them empty, resulting in increased numbers of persons left without housing they could afford. However, encouraged by new 1974 and 1985 city development plans for downtown and the regrade area, several non-profit agencies using federal and local housing funds began acquiring and restoring more than twenty buildings in the neighborhood for use by low- and moderate-income renters. New low-income housing was constructed as well, supported by social service agencies which established their facilities in Belltown and which remain to the present day. Also, in the 1970s, large construction projects of the scale intended after the regrading efforts ended around 1930 were

finally built. These included high-rise private condominiums, high-rise housing owned by the Seattle Housing Authority, and several office towers. Such major construction continued through the 1980s and to the present day.

The increase in housing activity supported an increase in commercial activity in the area in the 1970s through the 1990s. Many of the existing, lower-scale buildings of the past retained relatively inexpensive rents, which attracted artists, musicians, restaurants, clubs, galleries, cafes, and small shops to the area. In 1994, the Belltown/Regrade neighborhood was designated an urban center to encourage increased density.

### **The development of the subject building, and building owners**

The subject building was constructed in 1921 as a an automobile sales showroom and service garage at the northwest corner of Stewart Street and 3rd Avenue, for Anna Meloy Donahoe.

Prior to that time, from 1890 to 1905, the entire two blocks from Virginia to Stewart Streets, and from 2nd Avenue to 4th Avenue (including the subject site) was a single site atop Denny Hill, occupied by the enormous Washington (a.k.a. Denny) Hotel. The hotel had originally been developed by a group of owners which included Arthur Denny (who donated the land), but construction on the partly-completed hotel stalled until it was purchased by major Seattle developer James A. Moore in 1903. The hotel was finally completed later that year, but it and Denny Hill ultimately succumbed to ongoing efforts by political and business forces to remove the hill to facilitate the expansion of the central business district northward.

By 1906, the hotel was demolished, and the site including the subject parcel had been lowered approximately 100 feet as part of the Denny Regrade work. At the same time, the 3rd Avenue right of way, which abuts the subject site, and the alley at the rear, were cut through to connect to the street grid north of Virginia Street. After the regrade, the parcels across the alley facing 2nd Avenue were more quickly developed, as early as 1906 and into the 1910s. In an atmosphere of frenetic real estate activity city-wide, Moore began to sell off portions of the former hotel property. In January 1906, it was announced in the Seattle Times with a banner headline that Moore had sold the double corner lot at 2nd & Stewart to a St. Louis concern led by J. E. Chilberg and J. C. Marmaduke for \$200,000, for the construction of the New Washington Hotel (today known as the Josephinum Apartments). Work began immediately on the luxury building, which initially was modeled after the recently-constructed Hotel St. Francis (Bliss & Faville, 1904) in San Francisco, California. The architects of the New Washington Hotel were Eames & Young of St. Louis, who had just completed the design and construction of the Alaska Building (1904) at 2nd Avenue and Cherry Street in Seattle, which was also developed by Chilberg and Marmaduke. While the New Washington was under construction, titanic regrading efforts continued just behind the site, including the subject parcel. Despite a four-month delay due to insufficient availability of building materials, the hotel was completed and opened to the public in October 1908.

At the same time, Moore was building his Moore Theater and Hotel (Edwin Houghton, 1907) on 2nd Avenue adjacent to the New Washington Hotel, and the Benjamin Franklin Hotel

(Edwin Houghton, 1908, also known as the Washington Hotel Annex, destroyed) near the southeast corner of 2nd and Stewart.

In April 1907, in the middle of this surrounding building activity, the subject parcel was sold by James Moore to Michael Donahoe for \$165,000.

### **Original owners, Michael and Anna Donahoe**

Michael Donahoe was a wealthy real estate investor who had just moved to Seattle with his wife Anna Meloy Donahoe in late 1906, a few months after leaving their former home San Francisco, California, following the devastating earthquake which struck there on April 18, 1906.

Michael Donahoe was born in Marathon, New York, thirty miles north of Binghamton at the southeast edge of the Finger Lakes district, in 1861. His parents, Thomas S. and Catherine McMahan Donahoe provided a comfortable upbringing, and Michael attended public schools there. As a young man in Marathon, he became interested in railroad work. In 1886, at age 25, he moved to Butte, Montana, to work as the joint agent of the Northern Pacific, Union Pacific, and Montana Union railways. Impressed with his work, Marcus Daly—the multimillionaire owner and developer of the Anaconda copper mines near Butte—hired Donahoe in 1888 to serve directly under him as his assistant general manager for the huge mining company. Donahoe served in this capacity until Daly’s death in 1900, during which time he “made a fortune.” In the 1890s, Donahoe also became vice president and general manager of the Butte, Anaconda, and Pacific railway, and helped establish two banks in Butte and Anaconda. While living in Montana, Donahoe married Anna Meloy, a native of Shulsberg, Wisconsin (a village in the lead-mining region of southwest Wisconsin, near Galena, Illinois) in 1892, and began to raise four children.

After Daly’s death in 1900, Michael and Anna Donahoe moved to San Francisco in the early 1900s, where Donahoe pursued investments and real estate projects. In 1905, Donahoe was listed in a San Francisco city directory as a “capitalist,” with an office in the Claus Spreckles Building on Market Street (a.k.a. Call Building, built in 1898 as one of the first skyscrapers in that city, at 20 stories). The Donahoe family resided at 3311 Jackson Street, in the Presidio Heights neighborhood.

The great San Francisco earthquake in April 1906 did not topple the Claus Spreckles Building, but the structure was gutted by fire, and Donahoe presumably lost everything in his office. Most of the business district of the city was in ruins, and Donahoe’s four young children (Henry, Charles, Kathleen, and Walter) were aged between 5 and 12. Within a few months, the Donahoe family moved to Seattle. No obvious reason for the Donahoes choosing Seattle could be identified for this report (such as joining family members already there); however, the city at that time was booming, and would have offered ample opportunities for Donahoe’s real estate interests. In Seattle, they resided at 911 17th Avenue E., in James Moore’s newly developed Capitol Hill neighborhood. Donahoe retained an office in the Central Building, at 3rd Avenue and Columbia Street.

As previously described, Donahoe purchased the subject property in April 1907. In June 1908, a newspaper article stated that Donahoe was waiting to assess the speed of regrading work to determine how to improve the property: "If it [the regrading] is to be put through promptly, said Mr. Donahoe, a structure will be erected to cost considerably more than a quarter of a million dollars. If the regrade is to be dragged over a long period it will not be expedient to put up the same class of building nor for the same purposes." As of mid-November 1908, 3rd Avenue between Pine and Stewart Streets was still being graded. Donahoe's intent for the site or type of building is unknown, but the proposed \$250,000 construction cost at the time would have reflected a substantial expenditure. Little additional useful information could be found about the site or the Donahoes until 1910.

On June 28, 1910, Michael Donahoe died suddenly at age 49 while visiting Rochester, Minnesota. Donahoe's will appointed Anna as the executor of his estate, and left everything to her and their children. The estate involved California property alone valued at \$700,000 (about \$18,000,000 in today's dollars), including an unimproved commercial lot and residential lot in San Francisco, and 253 unimproved acres in Kern County near Bakersfield. In Seattle, additional estate properties included the subject parcel, as well as presumably their house, and may have included other unknown property. After her husband's death, she was described as "one of Seattle's richest and most charitable women." (Anna Donahoe acted as manager or trustee of the estate her entire life, later assisted by her children. After her husband's death, she resided in the Madison Park neighborhood at 824 36th Avenue East. She was active in the numerous local social welfare and arts philanthropies, and was one of the ten founders of the Seattle Catholic Women's' Child Welfare League, today known as Advocacy and Caring for Children. She died in Seattle in 1936 at age 72).

By the early 1910s, substantial but spotty construction continued to be built around the subject site. The six-story Kelly-Gorham /Haddon Hall Building on the same block was completed in 1910, and the ornate, ten-story Securities Building was constructed in 1913 across the street, but the subject site remained undeveloped.

Nine years after Michael Donahoe's death, movement to improve the subject property finally began. In 1919, a building permit was issued for the erection of a billboard on the empty lot. Later that year, a permit was issued for the construction of a small service station (probably a small building with fueling canopy), and another in 1920 for the addition of a small office measuring 10 by 20 feet in plan; but these may not have actually been built. At the time, there were numerous automobile-related buildings and services in the vicinity, particularly in the 2000 block of 3rd Avenue immediately to the north.

In June 1921, building permits were issued for the construction of the subject building, a two-story terra-cotta clad automobile sales and garage building measuring 108 by 120 feet, valued at between \$30,000 and \$55,000 (according to permits and news accounts), for Anna Meloy Donahoe. Permits listed the architect as Charles Haynes, but the builder is unknown. A news article stated that the work was to start July 1, with occupancy by October 1.

The tenant was to be Alfred Ayerst Inc., Ford automobile dealers, which secured a ten-year lease. Architectural drawings show that the first floor was to be used as a sales floor, with

offices and a stock room along 3rd Avenue, and a sales room occupying two bays each of storefront at the corner of 3rd and Stewart Street. The rear two-thirds of the first floor was used as a work shop and service area, with automobile access through the fourth bay on the Stewart Street elevation. The upper floor was used as an automobile storage garage (presumably used primarily by the dealership) and was accessed from the alley by ramp to the second floor from the first (northernmost) bay on the alley elevation.

The building was completed by October 23, 1921—a period of only four months. Also completed by that date were a row of one-story terra-cotta-clad store buildings (no longer extant) adjacent to the Securities Building, across the street from the subject site, reflecting the lower-scale kinds of investments being made in the vicinity compared to the more expensive highrise buildings to a decade before.

**Original tenant, Alfred G. Ayerst Inc.**

Little information was available regarding Alfred Godfrey Ayerst. Census records show that he was born in 1880 in Iowa, the youngest of six children to Edward and Eugenie Ayerst, both Canadian by birth. The family appears to have moved to Seattle in the 1890s; Alfred appears in Polk's Seattle city directory in 1898 listed as a high school student, and in 1899 as a clerk for the Pacific Postal Telegraph Cable Company. In 1907, he is listed as a partner with his father in Ayerst & Ayerst, a real estate loan and insurance company. In 1910, he is listed as a salesman for the Polson Implement Company, and 1910 census records show that by that time he was married to his wife Lucy, with a son Alfred Jr.

Around 1910 or 1911, Ayerst began working in the automobile business, a relatively new field (automobiles began to make an appearance in Seattle around 1905). In 1912, Ayerst was a sales manager for the F. H. Bardshar company, the western Washington distributor for Stevens-Duryea, Cole, and Maxwell brand automobiles. The company was located at 1107 East Pike Street, and Ayerst and his family resided at 2834 Boylston Avenue North. In 1913, Ayerst began a career as a salesman for the Ford Motor Company. By 1918, he had his own Ford dealership, located at 1830 Broadway at the southeast corner of East Denny Way in the Capitol Hill neighborhood.

In 1921, the subject building appears to have been constructed specifically for Ayerst's new dealership "as probably the most modern and completely equipped Ford establishment in the Northwest," and Ayerst occupied the building in December of that year.

However, Ayerst occupied the building only a few months and was bought out in February 1922 by William L. Hughson, "one of the biggest automobile dealers in America," whose firm was originally established in San Francisco in 1903 as the very first Ford dealership in the nation.<sup>21F</sup> Hughson already had Ford agencies in Portland, Oregon, and California locations in San Francisco, Oakland, Los Angeles, and San Diego, with over nine million dollars in gross sales for 1921.<sup>22F</sup> Hughson's first Seattle location was established in 1917 at 500 East Pike Street, at the northeast corner of Summit Avenue, which they vacated in April 1922 when they moved to the subject building.

After the buy-out, Ayerst entered into a partnership in October 1922 with another Seattle automobile businessman, L. M. Cline, to establish a Rickenbacker Automobile dealership at 1830 Broadway, which operated there until about 1927. Census records and city directories indicate that Ayerst moved to San Francisco by 1930, where he established a company as a manufacturer's agent with his son. Ayerst was living in Alameda, California by 1940, and died there in 1948 at age 68.

Hughson's Ford dealership occupied the subject building for less than two years, leaving for reasons which could not be discovered for this report. The firm had apparently vacated the subject building around late December 1923.

### **Later owners and occupants**

In 1924, the subject building was remodeled into a loft-and-stores occupancy, divided into smaller, separate storefronts to accommodate multiple tenants, as evidenced by building permits, architectural drawings, and related news accounts. The architect of the remodel was again Charles L. Haynes, architect of the original building.

Storefronts were addressed 214-218 Stewart Street and 1901-1911 3rd Avenue; the second floor was addressed as 1905-1/2 or 1905. Occupants between 1924 and 1938 are difficult to identify, but beginning in 1938, reverse listings in Polk's city directories show a wide range of tenants over the years, including retail shops or services, a restaurant, and grittier "heavy commercial" trades such as plumbing suppliers or printers. By at least 1935, architectural drawings and permits show that the second floor was subdivided for use as a church meeting room and larger classroom or office spaces.

Tenants for the following years beginning in 1938 (when reverse listings become available in Polk's Seattle directories) through 1996 (the last year of Polk's Seattle directory publication) are listed below, as an example of the occupants over time. Some tenants may have occupied multiple storefronts, and for some years there were no listings for the address:

1938: 214 – Appliance Parts & Service, electrical supplies  
216 – Postal Telegraph-Cable Company  
218 – J. D. Day & Co., notary  
1901 – Doner Piano Company  
1903 – U-Paint-M Furniture, furniture dealers  
1905 – Vacant  
1905-1/2 - Puget Sound Tent & Duck Company  
Business & Professional Women's Club  
Unity Society of the Northwest  
Paul M. Rigby (Unity Society)  
1907 – Kohler Company, wholesale plumbing supplies  
1911 – Drew & Tomlinson, printers

1948: 214-216 – [No listing]  
1901 – Doner Piano Company  
1903 – Kerns Music Center, instruments

1905 – G. R. Davis, chiropodist  
1905-½ - Western Electric Company (auditing department)  
1907 – Kohler Company, plumbing supplies  
1911 – Seattle Artificial Limb Company

1958: 214-216 – Appliance Parts & Service, electrical supplies  
1901 – Doner Piano Company  
1903 – Oriental Bazaar, gifts  
1905 – Peterson Business School  
Nancy Taylor Charm School  
1907 – Kohler Company, plumbing supplies  
1911 – Stam Leo Company orthopedic supports

1968: 214 – Vacant  
1903 – People’s National Bank of Washington  
1905 – Automation Institute  
Peterson School of Business  
Nancy Taylor Charm School  
1907 – The Bon Marche sales audit department

1978: 216 – Copy Mart  
1903 – People’s National Bank of Washington  
1905 – ITT Peterson School of Business  
1907 – ITT Computer Institute (sub ofc)

1988: 214 – Plumage hair styling  
216 – Vacant  
1901 – Magazine City retail magazine store  
1905 – Vacant  
1907 – Vacant  
1909 – Michi Tempura & Teriyaki restaurant

1996: 214 – Mirmaluz  
216 – Café Moscow  
1901 – Bergman Luggage  
1907 – U-Frame-It  
1909 – Isabella Ristorante

In 1959 and again in 1961, permits were issued for alterations to the subject building to accommodate a People’s National Bank branch at the corner of 3rd and Stewart. Four window bays along Stewart and two along 3rd Avenue at the first-floor level were significantly altered with the installation of a Modern-style red granite storefront, designed by Seattle architects McClelland & Osterman. The work involved the removal of the original terra cotta cladding and original windows, although the window openings do not appear to have been altered.



The property remained in the Donahoe family until 1984, when it was sold to Brooke A. Barnes, the present owner. At that time, the building was in poor condition and the entire upper floor had not been occupied for years. According to Barnes, part of the roof at the alley had fallen in and had to be rebuilt before the property sale could close. Shortly thereafter, a portion of the roof at the southwest building corner also fell in, during permitted demolition and framing work to improve and make occupiable the upper floor. Structural beam ends were found to be rotten, resulting in the city requiring a complete seismic renovation. Unable to perform that work at the time, Barnes instead closed off the upper floor, and it remains unoccupied at present. At street level, Barnes removed the People's National Bank storefronts (the branch closed around 1989), and stuccoed the locations where terra cotta had been removed for the People's National Bank storefront, scoring lines to create the appearance of masonry.

Today, the building is occupied by a bar/restaurant at the first and second bays on the Stewart Avenue side, and Bergman Luggage at the corner of 3rd and Stewart. A vacant former restaurant space is located on the north end of the 3rd Avenue side. The prominent Bergman Luggage exterior neon signage dates to the early 1990s, when Bergman moved into the space.

### **Comparable buildings**

Automobile-related buildings in Seattle

The subject building was constructed in 1921 as an automobile sales showroom and service garage for the Alfred Ayerst Inc. Ford Automobile dealership. It does not appear to have been used as a storage or public parking garage.

The first automobile sold in Seattle in 1905, but at that time automobiles were primarily owned by the wealthy, whose homes were centered around the affluent First Hill and Capitol Hill neighborhoods. Most people still relied on walking, streetcars, or horse-drawn vehicles for transportation. But Seattle's population in the early 20th century was growing exponentially, and automobile purchases grew with it, due to increased familiarity with the new technology and increasingly moderate prices. In 1900 the Seattle population was 80,761. By 1910 the population had nearly tripled to 237,194 (in part due to several 1907 annexations, as well as new arrivals to the city) and to approximately 327,000 in 1920. The period from 1910 to 1920 was also marked by significant economic growth in the area and commercial development downtown. Delivery trucks began to replace horses and wagons as an important part of commerce.

After 1905, the Pike-Pine-Broadway area, uphill from downtown between First Hill and Capitol Hill, began to develop into an early "Auto Row." The area was characterized by numerous dealerships, auto repair shops, parts suppliers, paint shops, parking garages, used car dealers, and the like; often several of these uses were combined within single buildings.

Dealerships would have been the most prominent buildings in the Auto Row area, usually located at the most visible locations and in ornate, architect-designed buildings. The building type housing these dealerships were generally fire-resistive construction of concrete or brick, two to four stories tall, with large high-ceiling showroom or garage spaces on the first floor along the street elevation, and parking on upper floors accessed by ramps or large elevators.

These buildings were often built from lot line to lot line to enclose as much space as was economical, with heavy timber interior framing, concrete beams, or steel trusses for roof support, in regular repeatable bays. Support spaces were generally at the back, or on upper floors. Where constructed, basements were often used for storage and warehousing.

As with the subject building, architects often employed architectural glazed terra cotta, or brick with terra cotta ornament, as exterior cladding. Examples in the Pike-Pine area include the three-story White Motor Company (Julian Everett, 1918) sales and service building at 11th Avenue and Pine Street, today a designated Seattle landmark; the Packard Automobile dealership (Louis Svarz, 1920, altered) at Pike Street and Melrose Avenue, which today houses a Starbucks coffee roastery; and the Boone & Company Pontiac dealership (1925, altered) at Pine and Broadway, now a retail/office building.

At the beginning of the 20th century in Seattle, automobiles were purchased from local distributors after selecting a model from an auto show, a showroom, or from literature. The vehicle would be delivered months later. Unlike today, there were a wide range of manufacturers competing for market share—not only Ford and Chrysler, but now-departed brands like Paige, Federal, Menominee, Chalmers, Saxon, Bauch-Lang Electric, Seldon, Mitchell, Hupmobile, Pierce-Arrow, Case, REO, Willys-Overbrand, Peerless, Packard, Studebaker, and others.

By the 1920s, nearby Westlake Avenue between downtown and Lake Union had become the second “Auto Row” in the city, following the first one which developed along Pike and Pine Streets on Capitol Hill in the years after 1905. Westlake Avenue had attracted a number of automobile-related buildings, including the O. M. Gaudy Company dealership (1925), the Durant Motor Building (1928), and the Firestone Tire Building (1929). While automobile dealer showrooms were often ornate buildings, automotive service buildings were often low-key. The most elaborate in that area were the terra cotta Ford McKay building (1922, altered) and the adjacent Pacific McKay dealership (1925, altered), which are today Seattle designated landmarks. By 1939, there were approximately forty automobile-related businesses (sales or service) on the twelve blocks of Westlake Avenue between Stewart Street and Lake Union.

Although the subject building does not appear to have been used as a public parking garage, by the 1920s, the automobile was common enough that parking was an issue downtown. During that period, surface lots and garages began to be seen as a necessity, and began to appear in or near downtown, often with a small gas station building on site. Larger parking garages holding hundreds of automobiles, following the model of multi-story automobile-related structures already developed in the prior decade, began to be built downtown as single-purpose structures, often near high-density office or retail areas. Some built in the 1920s were located in the newly-available and less expensive Belltown land cleared by the several phases of the Denny Hill regrades. An ornate example of this kind of garage is the six-story White Garage (Henry Bittman, 1928), today known as Downtown Mini Storage, next door to the subject site at 1915 3rd Avenue. (By the 1950s, new buildings downtown began to be designed with integral parking within the structure, to accommodate the now-ubiquitous automobile and the growing trend of automobile commuting to the downtown core from suburban neighborhoods).

In the Depression years of the 1930s, many auto sales and service businesses in the city closed. In the postwar years of the late 1940s and 1950s, dealerships moved to expansive outdoor lots and new buildings at the edges of Seattle's city limits as they followed suburban development. In the old Auto Row areas of Pike-Pine and Westlake, many former automotive-related concrete, masonry, and heavy-timber structures were adapted after the 1970s to residential, retail, entertainment, and institutional uses.

### **Small terra cotta store-and-office buildings downtown**

The subject building was constructed in 1921 as an automobile showroom and service garage downtown, although that use did not last, and the building was remodeled into a store-and-office building in 1924. During the 1910s and 1920s, numerous low-scale, terra cotta clad, store-and-office buildings were constructed in downtown Seattle. Generally, two stories, these structures had retail at the first floor and offices or other uses at the upper floor. Although low-scale, the development model for these structures was apparently lucrative. Terra cotta was used because it was fireproof, was relatively lightweight for the building structure to support, and offered a highly ornamental building façade for the price.

Examples of these downtown buildings include the Ames Building (Charles Bebb, 1914, demolished), a block from the subject building at 2nd Avenue and Stewart Street; the highly elaborate 1119 4th Avenue (1922) closer to the central business district; and the Tyee Building (1925), a block from the subject building at 4th Avenue and Stewart Street.

Other examples include the Broderick Building (John Graham, Sr., 1922), Liberty Building (Nevins and Horrocks, 1924), Mann Building/Embassy Theater (Henry Bittman, 1926) and the Pande Cameron Building (Henry Bittman, 1928, demolished). Similar extant two-story, commercial block buildings that are partially decorated with terra cotta ornament include the S.J. Holmes Building (J. Lister Holmes, 1924); Jordan Building (Lawton & Moldenhour, 1920) and the Colony Club (John Creutzer, 1928).

### **The architect, Charles Lyman Haynes**

The designer of the subject building's original 1921 construction, and its 1924 renovation, was Charles L. Haynes, a prolific architect during a period of economic expansion in Seattle from 1910 to 1930. Typical of many architects at the time, he designed a wide variety of building types (including other automobile-related structures, like the subject building), in a wide variety of eclectic styles. He was best known for his projects during the 1920s; the subject building would have been a mid-career commission. Haynes is sometimes confused with Charles A. Haynes, an architect practicing at about the same time in Aberdeen, Washington.

Charles L. Haynes was born in Santa Cruz, California, in 1870, but there is little available information about his early years or his education. He was practicing architecture in San Francisco by 1900 and worked there for San Francisco architect Alexander A. Cantin (1874-1964) for a time.

In 1907, he moved to Seattle to establish the Seattle office of Haynes & Cantin with his former employer, but this partnership did not last, and by 1908 was in private practice. He appears to have immediately received work upon his arrival in Seattle, in a range of commercial and

residential building types. A newspaper article from April 1908 noted nine houses, a three-story apartment building, and a hotel/store building by Haynes already under construction, valued at \$84,000 in total. Some of his work was related to adapting buildings to new grades during extensive regrading of downtown streets at that time. Other early work by Haynes includes a factory and wharf for the Pacific Ammonia and Chemical Company (1908, demolished) at Northlake Way and Blewett Street, and a home near Volunteer Park for Robert P. Greer (1910), the director of that company, at 1052 E. Galer; the Hotel Hudson (1909, altered) at 515 7th Avenue South; and the Reliance Hospital (1910)—originally commissioned as a store and apartment building for a Mrs. M. Fitzpatrick—at 416 12th Avenue South.

By 1911, Haynes's commissions expanded to other commercial and institutional building types. On Capitol Hill, he designed the Packard Automotive Showroom (1911, altered) at 1205 East Pine Street and the Tyson Oldsmobile Company / Lozier Building (1912) at 905 East Pike. He submitted a design in 1912 for the competition for the Masonic Temple at the corner of East Pine and Harvard Avenue. While he lost the winning design to the architecture firm of Saunders & Lawton, his second-prize-winning proposal placed higher than the other entrants in the competition, which included some of Seattle's most well-established and best-regarded architects: Bebb & Mendel, Julian Everett, Daniel Huntington, Harlan Thomas, and Theodore Buchinger.

Haynes was capable of designing competently in a number of historicist styles, a skill which was to serve him well when he was hired as the official architect of the Hunter Tract Improvement Company, the developer of the Madison Park neighborhood. The seventy-block area was platted in 1907, and Haynes first designs for that neighborhood appear to have occurred around 1912. Many prominent Seattle architects designed homes there, but Haynes is estimated to have designed over one hundred, including the Robert B. Kellogg house (1912) at 2701 Mt. St. Helens Place, the Hunter Improvement Company house (1913) at 2855 Mt. Rainier Drive, and the Frank Buty house (1915) at 3704 South Ridgeway Place.

Another residential design, a Prairie-style house (1913) for Margaret Calvert at 1809 10th Avenue East on Capitol Hill, was widely published and increased Haynes' commissions for additional residential work. A semi-residential work from this period was the Tudor-style Kappa Sigma house (1914) at 5004 17th Avenue NE, for one of the oldest fraternities affiliated with the University of Washington. An example of a wood-clad Colonial Revival style home from this period is the Frank and Ora Helt house (1918, altered) at 2712 Broadway Avenue East in the National Register's Roanoke Park historic district.

In 1919, when Washington State began requiring architectural licensure, Haynes received license no. 73 under the grandfather clause. During the 1920s, Haynes designed several significant commercial buildings and apartment buildings, including the subject building in 1921. These projects included the new home for the Butterworth Mortuary (1922) at the prominent corner of Melrose Avenue and Pine Street; and the Farmer's Public Market building (1923, demolished), at Seventh and Westlake Avenues and Virginia Street, not far from the subject building. Another prominent market building by Haynes, the Broadway Market (1928, altered) on Capitol Hill, occupies frontage along an entire city block and features extensive glazing and ornate terra cotta details. Notable apartment buildings by Haynes during the 1920s

include the RoyVue (1924) at 615 Bellevue Avenue East and the Dunlap (1929) at 1741 Belmont Avenue East, both on Capitol Hill; the Narada (1925) at 25 West Highland Avenue on Queen Anne Hill; and the Bonair (1925, altered) on the northeast edge of downtown. The RoyVue in particular is notable for an unusually long, brick and terra cotta Gothic Revival elevation extending two-thirds of a block along Bellevue Avenue, and a gracious landscaped interior courtyard accessed through the center entrance breezeway.

Examples of Haynes' work in the 1930s are more difficult to trace. One large commercial project dating to 1930, just at the beginning of the Great Depression, was the eight-story Brooklyn Building in the University District, home to the General Insurance Company (later Safeco).

Haynes resided at 4303 37th Avenue NE with his wife Alma and two daughters. Haynes retired around 1940 and died in 1947 in Seattle at age 77.

Below is a non-comprehensive list of Charles L. Haynes primary built works, based on works listed in available biographies:

- 1909 Hotel Hudson
- 1910 Reliance Hospital
- 1910 Robert P. Greer House
- 1910 Wayne Apartments first floor addition
- 1911 Packard Automotive Showroom
- 1911 South Bend Commercial Club in South Bend, Washington
- 1912 Tyson Oldsmobile Company / Lozier Bldg
- 1912 Robert B. Kellogg House (Hunter Improvement Tract)
- 1914 Kappa Sigma Fraternity
- 1915 Frank Buty House (Hunter Improvement Tract)
- 1921 Donohoe Building / Bergman Luggage (also 1924 alterations)
- 1922 Butterworth Mortuary
- 1923 Farmer's Public Market
- 1923 Amelia Hemrich House (Hunter Improvement Tract)
- 1924 Russell Building
- 1924 Roy Vue Apartments
- 1925 Narada Apartments
- 1925 Bonair Apartments
- 1925 T.A. Davies House
- 1927 RexLand Company Garage/Champion Building
- 1928 Broadway Market
- 1929 Dunlap Apartments
- 1930 Brooklyn Building

## **Terra Cotta**

Glazed architectural terra cotta is a clay masonry product which was popularized in the late 1800s as a versatile, lightweight, economical, and adaptable alternative to stone. Through the 1930s, the highly sculptural properties of terra cotta allowed designers a wide range of stylistic expressions in building ornament. Weighing a tenth as much as stone, architectural terra cotta is composed of kiln-baked clay which is finished with a protective glaze. Like brick, terra cotta can be molded and fired at high temperatures to achieve hardness and a high durability. Readily shaped into sculptural forms, it offered designers color and textures at a much lower cost than quarried stone.

The product was popularized after the 1871 Chicago fire, when new building codes prompted the specification of unglazed terra cotta as a lightweight, fire-resistant structural element in floor framing systems. Hollow structural terra cotta blocks were thus incorporated into fireproof construction in floors, walls, and ceilings. Soon glazed terra cotta was used as exterior cladding, and was popular in tall buildings, providing fire protection for steel framing, such as the Woolworth Building in New York and the Wrigley Building in Chicago. In Seattle, examples of skyscrapers clad in terra cotta include the Alaska Building (1904) and Smith Tower (1914). However, the material was commonly used as ornament for smaller commercial buildings or apartment houses.

In Seattle, several terra cotta manufacturers operated during the period of the 1910s-1920s, including the Northern Clay Company and the Denny-Renton Clay & Coal Company. In 1925, the Gladding-McBean Company, a firm based in California, purchased both companies, thereby becoming one of the largest producers of terra cotta in the country.

In the postwar period of the 1940s and 1950s, terra cotta fell out of favor and production began to slow dramatically. Newer materials being developed were less expensive, and Modern trends in architecture began to eschew ornamentation of any kind.

## **Spanish Eclectic style**

The building was designed as an automobile dealership service garage and showroom in the Spanish Eclectic style, with the primary elevations originally clad entirely in glazed terra cotta and built in 1921. The style derives from the more rigorous Spanish Colonial Revival style, but with a freer use and invention of ornamental elements. The Spanish Colonial Revival style developed as an extension of the Mission Revival style.

Mission Revival developed beginning around the 1880s in California, after several architects there sought inspiration in the colonial history of the western United States as the basis for architectural design, rather than continuing to “import” and use the seemingly out-of-place English Colonial Revival architecture of the eastern United States. Influences included a broad range of buildings, from the occasionally ornate 18th century Spanish Franciscan order mission churches (which themselves were derived from earlier Spanish baroque and renaissance architecture in Europe) to the modest adobe dwellings of the Southwest.

The first widespread notice of the Mission Revival style was gained with the construction of the California State Building at the Chicago Columbian Exposition in 1893. In the Pacific

Northwest, the style was particularly popularized by its widespread use in the 1905 Lewis & Clark Centennial Exposition buildings in Portland, Oregon.

Mission Style buildings typically include the following features: Arched openings, either round or segmented; low-pitched hipped or gable tile roofs and pent-roofs with exposed rafters and deep overhangs; and scalloped or curvilinear shaped parapets. Exteriors are generally stucco, but examples in brick, wood, and stone can be found.

Mission Style quickly became popular in the western states but could be found nationwide. It was used in a variety of building types, including churches, train stations, club buildings, commercial buildings, and especially single-family houses. In Seattle, it was popular from about 1900 to 1920; excellent examples are the LaCrosse Apartments (1907) at 302 Malden Avenue E., and the L'Amourita Apartments (1909) at 2901 Franklin Avenue E. Early on, the style sometimes began to merge with Arts & Crafts movement, resulting in an emphasis on simple forms, little superfluous decoration, and emphasis on the quality of materials. In rare instances, highly simplified applications of the Mission Style appear as a kind of stark, stripped-down pre-Modernism.

At the other extreme, some builders and architects chose to focus on the ornamental possibilities of the Spanish Colonial architectural inheritance in the west. In 1915, the buildings of the Panama-California Exposition in San Diego were designed in a highly elaborate mode, tapping the Spanish architectural baroque Plateresque and Churrigueresque styles, Spanish Gothic, Moorish, and Spanish Renaissance elements found in both Spain and its colonies. After 1915, this Spanish Colonial Revival style became very popular in California, the western United States, and Florida during the 1920s, through the 1930s.

According to Marcus Whiffen's style guide *American Architecture Since 1780*, characteristic features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style include the low-pitch red-tiled roofs of Mission Style, but also flat roofs with tiled parapets. Arches, though frequently used, are not as universally used as in the Mission Style, and houses may lack them entirely. Walls are plastered or stuccoed, and doorways or window openings may be flanked by columns or pilasters, or otherwise be the focus of considerable carved or cast ornament. Balconies with railings are common, as are wrought iron or carved wood details, such as window grilles. Windows often vary in size, and may be asymmetrically disposed on an elevation, with broad expanses of solid wall between. High-style buildings might include towers or tower-like forms, or decorative colorful glazed tiles. In 1920s Los Angeles, the style was associated with glamorous Hollywood mansions.

In Seattle, the Spanish Colonial Revival style was relatively popular but usually employed less extravagantly than can be found in California. Designers in Seattle generally employed a freer, "Spanish Eclectic" style reflecting a looser use of Spanish-Colonial-derived ornamental details to create a pleasing façade. Spanish Eclectic buildings in Seattle are often found as single family homes or apartment buildings from 1915 to about 1940. Examples of apartment buildings include the Hacienda Court (1925) at 1025 Summit Avenue; 2345 Franklin Avenue E. (1925); Morris Apartments (1926) at 2107 5th Avenue N.; La Quinta (1927) at 1710 E. Denny Way; El Monterey (1928) at 4204 11th Avenue E.; Villa Costella (1929) at 348 W.

Olympic Place; and El Cerrito (1931) at 608 E. Lynn Street. Elaborate examples include the Piedmont/Tuscany Apartments (1928) at 1215 Seneca Street, and the LaFlor Apartments (1929) at 323 16th Avenue.

Commercial examples of buildings which can be categorized as Spanish Eclectic include the following:

- Metropolitan Printing Press Company/Brasa building (1923, George Wellington Stoddard) at 2107 3rd Avenue, a Seattle landmark;
- Republic Building/Melrose Tower (1927, Lawton & Moldenhour), at 1511 3rd Avenue, an example of the style applied to a high-rise building;
- Seville Building (1929, George Wellington Stoddard, altered) at 2226 3rd Avenue;
- Fashioncraft Building (1929, Henry Bittman) at 2022 Boren Avenue, a Seattle landmark.

There were several large automobile-related buildings designed in the Spanish Eclectic style, like the subject building, during the 1920s. These include:

- Eldridge Buick (1926, Schack Young & Myers, altered) at 4501 Roosevelt Way, which originally featured two typically Spanish baroque entry surrounds, but also Italian Renaissance ornament, and so begins to blur into a broader category of the Mediterranean Eclectic style.
- W.L. Eaton Dodge automobile dealership (1927-28, The Austin Company, altered), 1110 East Pine Street.
- White Garage (1928, Henry Bittman) adjacent to the subject building at 1915 3rd Avenue, a Seattle landmark.
- American Automobile Company Chrysler automobile dealership, later the Stan Sayres Chrysler-Plymouth dealership (1928-29, Earl Morrison, demolished), filling half a city block at the prominent corner of Harvard Avenue and Madison was an excellent example of Spanish Eclectic design until it was demolished in the late 1960s.

The subject building's Spanish Eclectic features include arched openings, red tile pent roof at the parapet, and the shaped parapets at building corners. The shaped parapets, arched lower window, squared and enframed upper window, and projecting vertical elements all serve to create the appearance of tower-like elements at building corners.

Charles L. Haynes, the architect of the subject building, designed at least two other buildings with some Spanish Eclectic details, including the Dunlap Apartments (1926) and the Broadway Market (1928, altered).



## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Aldredge, Lydia S., et al. *Impressions of Imagination : Terra-Cotta Seattle*. Allied Arts of Seattle, 1986.

Bagley, Clarence. *History of Seattle from the earliest settlement to the present, Vol. 3*. Chicago: S. J. Clarke Publishing Company, 1916.

City of Seattle Department of Construction and Inspections, Microfilm Library, permit records and drawings, and parcel data. [www.seattle.gov](http://www.seattle.gov).

City of Seattle Department of Neighborhoods, Historic Resources Survey database, [www.seattle.gov/neighborhoods/preservation/historicresources](http://www.seattle.gov/neighborhoods/preservation/historicresources).

City of Seattle Department of Neighborhoods. "Downtown Commercial Core" neighborhood context statement, pp. 7-33, undated but c.2000.  
<http://www.seattle.gov/neighborhoods/preservation/contextstatements.htm>.

"Crocker-Langley San Francisco Directory." *Crocker-Langley San Francisco Directory*, 1904, p. yr.1904/05.

D.A. Sanborn. *Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps*. Seattle, Washington (various dates) maps accessed from Seattle Public Libraries, online. [www.spl.org](http://www.spl.org).

The Henry Ford Museum, Collections and Research, Dearborn, Michigan.  
[www.thehenryford.org](http://www.thehenryford.org).

HistoryLink, the Online Encyclopedia to Washington State History. [www.historylink.org](http://www.historylink.org).

Howard, Spencer, and Katie Pratt. Northwest Vernacular Inc. "Mount Baker Park Historic District," National Register of Historic Places registration form, January 2018.

King County Assessor's Records, at Puget Sound Regional Archives, at Bellevue Community College, Bellevue, WA.

King County Parcel Viewer website. [www.metrokc.gov/gis/mapportal/Pviewer](http://www.metrokc.gov/gis/mapportal/Pviewer) main.

Krafft, Katheryn H., Krafft & Krafft Architecture, and Allison LaFever. "Securities Building," Seattle Landmark Nomination report, undated (2007?).

Kroll Map Company Inc., "Kroll Map of Seattle," various dates.

Michelson, Alan, ed. PCAD (Pacific Coast Architecture Database), University of Washington, Seattle, [www.pcad.org](http://www.pcad.org).

Ochsner, Jeffrey Karl, ed. *Shaping Seattle Architecture: A Historical Guide to the Architects*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2014.

O'Connor, Erin, Lee O'Connor, and Cheryl Thomas, Friends of Roanoke Park (Seattle). "Roanoke Park Historic District, National Register of Historic Places Registration Form," Washington State Department of Archaeology and Historic Preservation, March 2009.

Phelps, Myra L., et al. *Public Works in Seattle : a Narrative History [of] the Engineering Department, 1875-1975*. 1st ed., Seattle, Seattle Engineering Dept., 1978.

R.L. Polk and Company. *Polk's Directory to the City of Seattle*. Seattle: various dates.

Roth, Leland M. *A Concise History of American Architecture*. New York: Harper & Row, 1979.

*The Seattle Times* newspaper. Seattle, Washington. Includes previous incarnations as *The Seattle Press Times*, *The Seattle Daily Times*, and *The Seattle Sunday Times*. Searchable database available through the Seattle Public Library.

Sheridan, Mimi. "Belltown Historic Context Statement and Survey Report," Seattle Department of Neighborhoods, Historic Preservation Program, November 2007.

Stoddard, William, et al. *History of the Great Northwest and Its Men of Progress: a Select List of Biographical Sketches and Portraits of the Leaders in Business, Professional and Official Life*. Minneapolis Journal, 1901.

Swope, Caroline T. *Classic Houses of Seattle*. Portland, Oregon: Timber Press, 2005.

Tobin, Caroline, and Artifacts Consulting, Inc., "Mount Baker Historic Context Statement," for the City of Seattle Department of Neighborhoods, May 2004.

Whiffen, Marcus. *American Architecture Since 1780*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: MIT Press, 1969.

Williams, David B. *Too High and Too Steep: Reshaping Seattle's Topography*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2015.

**The features of the Landmark to be preserved include:** *The exterior of the building.*

Issued: December 21, 2018



Sarah Sodt  
City Historic Preservation Officer

Cc: David Peterson, Historic Resource Consulting  
Jack McCullough, McCullough Hill Leary PS

Ed Segat, Continental Properties Inc.  
Jordan Kiel, Chair, LPB  
Nathan Torgelson, SDCI  
Maria Cruz, SDCI  
Ken Mar, SDCI