

ANALYSIS OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT IN THE PIKE-PINE CORRIDOR

1. 401 East Pike Street



The site is a rectangle 105' wide and 90' deep, on the south side of East Pike Street between Bellevue Avenue and Crawford Place. It is currently used for surface parking. Nearby structures in the immediate vicinity include the First Covenant Church (1910), directly across Pike Street, and the Northwest School, whose rear façade abuts Crawford Place. Other buildings include the Pike Lofts across Bellevue Avenue, built in the late 1990s, and the Pagliacci Pizza offices (a 1990s renovation), across Crawford Place.

A six-story, 54-unit residential structure is proposed for the site, with 5,500 square feet of ground floor retail (DPD Project No. 3010046).

Architectural and Urban Context

This portion of Pike Street is somewhat of an architectural jumble. The archetypal buildings of the Pike-Pine corridor – early twentieth century auto showrooms and garages, and warehouse-type structures – are intermingled with mixed-use buildings of various vintages from early to late twentieth century, one- and two-story commercial buildings, and the neoclassical First Covenant Church across Pike Street, itself an architectural anomaly in this neighborhood.

Because of Crawford Place, this block is uncharacteristically short for the Pike-Pine corridor, measuring only about 150 feet along Pike Street. It is also among the last undeveloped parcels on E Pike Street east of Broadway, and thus a significant opportunity for both development and for shaping the character of this portion of East Pike Street.

The character-defining buildings in this stretch of Pike Street include the First Covenant Church, twin former garage buildings, and the Pike Lofts building. These are, respectively, a neoclassical temple structure, two early twentieth-century one-story garages with matching curved parapets, and a late-1990s metal- and glass-clad mixed-use building. A Greek Revival house (now law office) is just south of the Bellevue Avenue side of the site, set back and separated from the street by a hedge and gracious lawn. (The landmark Northwest School is oriented toward Summit Avenue and Union Street, is separated from Pike Street by a change in elevation, and is thus less directly engaged with the context.)

Other nearby structures are less prominent, though are mostly low-rise brick or concrete buildings that also recall the former auto row character of East Pike Street. The character of this block is therefore mixed, yet urban in form and usage. The church is a solid anchor, as well as a prominent visual landmark: its low dome is placed at the visual center of the bend in East Pike Street, and it is seen in semi-profile as one walks up the incline of Pike Street from downtown. In both architectural style and scale, it stands out among the other buildings on this portion of Pike Street. The smaller garage and automobile showroom buildings contribute to a general early twentieth-century flavor, a solid street wall of buildings evoking sturdy construction in brick or concrete, and large openings for garage doors and showroom windows.

The Pike Lofts, while not the only residential building in the vicinity (the Wintonia Apartments and McDermott Apartments are early precedents), is of recent vintage and represents a new form that may define the future character of the Pike-Pine corridor: a taller (5- to 6-story) residential building that borrows from the showroom/warehouse archetype with tall ceilings and large expanses of glass, including floor-to-ceiling windows. Like 611 E Pike, another 1990s mixed-use apartment building two blocks to the east, the Pike Lofts uses large glass panes and metal cladding. Both buildings thus appear lighter, more transparent, and less solid than the older apartment buildings, and are more evocative, in an updated version, of the auto showroom and garage buildings in the neighborhood. Both the Pike Lofts and 611 East Pike also have inflections: notches and curves where the building meets a corner, or a bend in the street. Pike Lofts and 611 E Pike also have balconies protruding from the residential units, a feature of residential architectural heretofore unknown in this neighborhood, but now commonly used.

Analysis

The analysis below is based upon the conformity of the proposed project to a proposed guideline for conservation of neighborhood character, and is exclusive of its adherence to existing neighborhood design guidelines.

Proposed Guideline: Maintain site, setback, building orientation, massing, and rhythm at the street level, and maintain existing streetscape character.

Site, setback, orientation: This residential building will reinforce the existing street wall of buildings on E Pike Street, and include high-ceiling ground floor retail space, consistent with the neighborhood character. Its principal façade is on E Pike Street, with two retail entries from E Pike, and a residential entry from Bellevue Avenue.

Massing and rhythm: Seen as a light, modulated frame building (residential) atop a concrete plinth (retail) from E Pike Street, the side elevations present two volumes with opposing shed roofs. A rhythm

of bays, six in all, is seen in the E Pike Street elevation. These bays are characterized by protruding bay windows and balconies. Window placement on the side elevations is characteristic of older residential forms (smaller, punched windows), while that on the E Pike façade is more similar to the storefronts and auto showrooms of the characteristic commercial buildings—expansive floor-to-ceiling windows. The strongly delineated roofline and its slight overhang evoke the strong cornice lines of the older apartment buildings in the neighborhood.

Streetscape: With ceiling heights from 13'-8" to 15'-8", the ground floor retail spaces are approaching double-height, similar to the industrial or auto showroom buildings. The greater ceiling height allows for generous glazing on the ground floor, and the proposal shows large, floor-to-ceiling height transparent storefront windows. The storefronts are also covered by steel-framed glass canopies. Storefront windows and canopies wrap around the east and west sides of the building onto Crawford Place and Bellevue Avenue. Slightly recessed retail entrances provide weather protection and a transition space between sidewalk and store. The proposal includes the retention of the existing street trees on E Pike Street, and low shrubs in a planting pit surrounding the trees.

Conclusion

This proposed building will both contribute to the existing character of the Pike-Pine neighborhood and contribute to the evolving character of the neighborhood.

Existing character:

The proposed construction would maintain the existing street wall of E Pike Street, with façade and entrances flush to the sidewalk, and principal orientation to Pike St.

The large expanses of glazing on the ground floor, as well as floor-to-ceiling glass on upper floors, evoke the light industrial and auto showroom buildings of the early twentieth century that dominate the Pike-Pine corridor. Similarly, the large expanses of windows give the buildings a lightness and transparency that respect the industrial building tradition.

A ground floor of small storefronts in the new building contributes to and adds to the existing small-scale neighborhood storefronts, and is consistent with the existing street-level uses in the neighborhood. The storefront height of 13'-8" to 15'-8" is a nod to the older buildings' ground floor double-height ceilings.

A strong roofline is a nod to the traditional heavy cornices of the neighborhood, without being imitative.

Evolving character:

Height: As the neighborhood becomes more densely populated, the buildings will become taller. The current height limit is 65 feet with provisions to allow an additional four feet in order to accommodate higher floor-to-ceiling heights for the ground floor. Recent zoning changes allow additional height up to a maximum of 75' when certain conditions are met.

Methods and materials: Different construction methods and building materials prevail in the late twentieth-century and twenty-first century architecture, allowing newer and more lightweight materials

and less labor-intensive construction methods than the early twentieth-century character buildings. This gives modern construction an unavoidable difference in look and feel from the older construction.

Architectural features: With this as the third residential development in this area of E Pike Street with balconies facing the street, the residential balcony is on its way to becoming a character feature in new construction in Pike-Pine. Similarly, the protruding boxy bay windows are similar in form to those on the Pike Lofts across Bellevue Avenue, and may also become a character-defining architectural feature in this neighborhood. The steel-framed glass canopy on this proposed building and the Pike Lofts is another architectural feature that may become part of the neighborhood's character.

Pedestrian environment: The street trees surrounded by low hedge tree-planting scheme of this building is similar to that on the 600 block of E Pike St., and may become a future template for E Pike Street.

No particular style dominates this segment of E Pike Street. However, this proposed development, along with the Pike Lofts and 611 E Pike, contribute to an evolving and eclectic mix of architectural styles for the neighborhood, which will contribute to defining its character.

2. 1623 Bellevue Avenue



The site is a rectangle 50' wide and 105' deep, on the west side of Bellevue Avenue, between E Pine St and E Olive St. A rather forlorn-looking chalet-style apartment building, atop parking, is on the site now. Nearby structures in the immediate vicinity include a six-story 1990s mixed-use building immediately to the north; the Hawthorne, a recent mixed-use building; two older brick apartment buildings, the Ansonia and the Stephensburg; and a classic terra cotta automobile showroom building on the northeast corner of Bellevue and East Pine. The apartment building immediately to the south of the proposed project site is vacant, and scheduled to be demolished and replaced with a six-story mixed-use building.

A six-story, 23-unit residential structure is proposed for the site, with 1,020 square feet of ground floor retail (DPD Project No. 3008760).

Architectural and Urban Context

This block contains a mix of older character buildings and newer mixed-use buildings. The character buildings include two old brick apartment buildings, with classic characteristics: red or yellow brick with terra cotta trim, a cornice or string course, and terra cotta decorative elements. There is a simple but

strong rhythm of bays, double-hung sash windows with multi-part mullions and a narrow reveal; and a basement level one-half story below grade. The third character building is a creamy white terra cotta building at the corner that has features of the auto-row era: large glass windows, terra cotta detailing and decoration, and vertical and horizontal structural elements strongly expressed in the building's architecture.

One contemporary building on this block is worthy of note: The Hawthorne, across Bellevue Avenue. This building has elements of brick storefront architecture, combined with features of modern apartment buildings. The ground floor is flush to the sidewalk, faced with red brick on a concrete base, and has large expansive glass storefront windows. Its bay system is accentuated by brick pilasters, which are topped by concrete caps. A band above the storefront windows is executed in brick and patterned tile. Canopy supports also act as decorative elements. There are retail entrances and an entrance to the residences from the street. The upper floors, in stucco, have a modulated elevation on Bellevue Avenue. Portions of the upper floors are thus set back from the lower building's cornice, giving the impression that the upper floors are somewhat separate from the ground floor, as they are in function.

Analysis

The analysis below is based upon the conformity of the proposed project to a proposed guideline for conservation of neighborhood character, and is exclusive of its adherence to existing neighborhood design guidelines.

Proposed Guideline: Maintain site, setback, building orientation, massing, and rhythm at the street level, and maintain existing streetscape character.

Site, setback, orientation: The building occupies the entire site, which is the smallest one on this block. The size of this site is only slightly larger than those of the older apartment buildings to the north.

The current apartment building on this site is set back from the street, and turned to the side, giving a blank façade to the street. The proposal remedies this by bringing the street elevation forward and flush to the sidewalk. The rendering shows a ground floor that appears quite open to the street: full window glazing, floor to ceiling, or glass doors welcome passersby into ground-floor shops.

Massing and rhythm: The massing borrows from the warehouse or auto showroom features: wide bays set into a structural frame. While the ground floor occupies the entire street wall, the upper stories step in, and slightly pull away from the frame, an unusual but pleasing massing.

The bay system of windows gives the west side of Bellevue Avenue a rhythm that it currently lacks. The expressed structural framework, defined bays, heavy glazing, and deeply recessed windows are all evocative of warehouse/showroom/loft architecture of the early twentieth century.

Streetscape: This proposed building would enhance the streetscape by providing a needed street wall to this portion of Bellevue Avenue, and potentially enhancing street activity with large transparent storefront windows, and presumably retail shops within.

Conclusion

The proposed building appears to perform well against the proposed design guideline above. It adheres to the site, setback, and building orientation required by the proposed guideline. Its massing and rhythm enhance the block, and are harmonious with the auto-row buildings of the early twentieth century. Its small site is similar to early twentieth-century apartment buildings. Small shops proposed for the ground floor are in keeping with the desire for ground-floor storefront activity in this neighborhood, which this building and its proposed neighbor to the south may help to pull around the corner from E Pine Street.

After early design guidance, it appears that the exterior cladding materials of the building will be concrete at the base, and cementitious panels above, with visible joints. These materials are in keeping with and revealing of the proposed building's frame construction. Revealing structure through exterior expression and materials are in keeping with the auto row vernacular. It is hoped that the final design and construction will maintain this level of exterior finish materials; the use of poorly selected materials could introduce a false note to an otherwise worthy building, one that has the potential to provide a welcome enhancement to this block.

3. 1222 E Madison St



A six-story, 120-unit residential structure is proposed for this 18,000 square foot site, with 5,000 s.f. of ground floor retail and below grade parking for approximately 59 vehicles (DPD Project No. 3008615).

Architectural and Urban Context

The site of this proposed building is in the newest addition to the Pike-Pine overlay conservation district, in the area known as the “bow-tie”, where E Madison St, E Union St, and 12th Avenue converge. Historically an overlooked and under-traveled (on foot) portion of the neighborhood, this proposed building, along with the recently completed Trace Lofts, has the potential to ignite activity along this portion of Madison St, and connect it to the small hub of activity on E Madison between 13th and 14th Avenues.

The surrounding context includes several character buildings in the neighborhood vernacular: the Trace Lofts building on 12th and Madison, recently renovated for mixed-use; the Elysian Brewery on 13th and Pike, a former light-industrial building now a popular brew-pub; the Seattle Academy of Art and the Bekins Storage building at the south side of the 12th and Madison intersection, examples of the terra cotta showroom and concrete frame warehouse vernacular, respectively; and the Park Hill apartments, an early twentieth-century classic brick apartment building. There are also several under-utilized sites or gaps in the neighborhood fabric that are noteworthy: a drive-in bank and its parking lot occupying an entire block across 13th Avenue; a diminutive and non-descript florist building surrounded by surface parking across E Madison St; a parking lot between this site and the Elysian Brewery on 13th Avenue; and other drive-in related uses on the site occupying the west side of the bow-tie (though there is an active development proposal for that site).

Analysis

The analysis below is based upon the conformity of the proposed project to a proposed guideline for conservation of neighborhood character, and is exclusive of its adherence to existing neighborhood design guidelines.

Proposed Guideline: Maintain site, setback, building orientation, massing, and rhythm at the street level, and maintain existing streetscape character.

Site, setback, orientation: The site slopes upward from west to east, so that the east side is 13 feet higher than the west side. The project takes advantage of that condition to use a portion of the lower elevation for a garage. Additionally, it appears from the drawings that the building steps up the hill on Madison, so that commercial spaces on the lower portion of the site benefit from added ceiling height, another opportunity that the sloping site yields.

The building occupies the entire site, with a setback flush to the sidewalk. All principal façades and entrances to the building are oriented to E Madison St and 13th Avenue.

Massing and rhythm: The Elysian and the Trace Lofts, renovations of two existing buildings, both provide anchors on this block face. Through massing and a rhythmic structural expression, both buildings represent excellent examples of the Pike-Pine vernacular. The designers of 1222 E Madison appear to recognize the existing context of these two buildings: heavy spandrels, and a rhythmic bay system are apparent acknowledgments of the Trace Lofts and the Elysian, respectively. The bays appear to be narrower than those on the Elysian, approximately 15' wide, rather than 25'. Windows that are slightly recessed behind the spandrels, and recessed balconies, add depth and shadow to the building, which makes it appear less bulky. The 13th Avenue façade appears to have small capitals terminating the slender pilasters, providing a pleasant decorative element to the flat roofline, but this condition is not repeated on the E Madison St façade. (These pilaster capitals appear in the exterior rendering, but not in the elevation drawings.)

The Elysian and the Trace Lofts both occupy corner sites, and take advantage of their prominence through their architectural expression. 1222 E Madison also occupies a corner site, one which, if the building is successful, could also become prominent. Thus, it is somewhat of a disappointment to see such an unresolved corner in the building elevations and rendering. The corner is fully glazed, which appears to split the building into two at the corner, separating rather than joining the south and east façades. Such a corner treatment is neither prominent, nor unifying to the building's architecture.

Streetscape: Commercial spaces wrap the ground floor, along E Madison St and onto 13th Avenue. The proposal states that the 13th Avenue storefronts would have double height ceilings, which would be consistent with the neighborhood's vernacular showroom architecture. Some of the E Madison St retail spaces may also have high ceilings, due to the sloped site. Also consistent is the extensive floor-to-ceiling glazing of the retail spaces. Small shop sizes (approximately 1,000 s.f.) and frequent entries from the street also provide an enhancement to the pedestrian. Fifteen-foot sidewalks and a rhythm of trees and shrubs are a model for an otherwise treeless portion of the neighborhood.

Conclusion

The proposed 1222 E Madison building performs well against several of the criteria in the proposed guideline above: in site, setback and building orientation, it does a service to its surroundings. With its proposed small storefronts, high ceilings, extensive glass, multiple entrances, and sidewalk landscaping, it also is successful.

However, in massing and rhythm, the building is less than successful. Recesses in the building's façade are helpful in reducing overall mass on this large building. Yet an unresolved corner treatment in the proposed design is inconsistent with the need for a prominent corner at this site. At this site, the corner is crucial; it must be strong, prominent, and encourage pedestrian activity along both façades, as well as around the corner. This building's massing at the corner does not appear to do that. The building appears to dissolve at the corner, which would diminish the building's massing, and architectural integrity.

Rhythmically, the building appears to borrow from both the Trace Lofts and the Elysian Brewery buildings. The rhythm expressed here is a bit more horizontal than vertical; more emphasis of the vertical elements, especially on this corner site, would have been stronger.

Because there are gaps and underdeveloped sites in the urban fabric of this "bow-tie" part of the neighborhood, new development that takes place in this area has the opportunity to set a tone and establish a context for future development. As one of the first new developments proposed for this neighborhood, and on a rather large (18,000 sf) and prominent site, this building appears to co-exist comfortably with neighboring character structures. However, it has an opportunity to contribute in a stronger and more bold way to neighborhood character than the renderings indicate.

4. 1222 E Pine St



Proposed for the 15,400 square-foot site is a six-story building containing 4,830 sf of office and 2,545 sf of restaurant use at ground level, with 75 residential units above, and below grade parking for 131 vehicles (DPD Project No. 3007044).

Architectural and Urban Context

The site is at the northwest corner of E Pine St and 13th Avenue. While within the Pike-Pine conservation overlay district, and on one of the principal streets, the urban and architectural context of this site is somewhat paltry. The architecture of the properties immediately adjacent to the site on the north and west is single family residential. Across Pine Street is a one-story former automobile garage, now a bar and nightclub with all windows covered. Across 13th Avenue to the east is the Seattle Fire Department's Fire Station 25, a one-story 1970s Brutalist poured-concrete structure, well set back from the street, and with a large parking lot behind it. Diagonally across the street is a small Modernist building, a real estate office, surrounded by surface parking. Continuing south on 13th Avenue, there are several underutilized character buildings, and much surface parking. East on Pine Street are a character apartment building and one-story commercial buildings. West on Pine Street the urban fabric begins to cohere: the Packard Building and police precinct are at the corner of 12th Avenue, along with a tighter collection of character buildings.

Analysis

The analysis below is based upon the conformity of the proposed project to a proposed guideline for conservation of neighborhood character, and is exclusive of its adherence to existing neighborhood design guidelines.

Proposed Guideline: Maintain site, setback, building orientation, massing, and rhythm at the street level, and maintain existing streetscape character.

Site, setback, orientation: Based upon the drawings, 1222 E Pine St appears to satisfy the requirements of this proposed guideline. The building occupies the entire site and appears to respond to the slight incline of E Pine St. On both E Pine St and 13th Avenue, the building is shown as flush to the sidewalk, continuing or creating a street wall that is essential to the character of this neighborhood. As a corner site, this building has two elevations that are visible from the street: E Pine St is the primary elevation and 13th Avenue is the secondary elevation. There are entrances to retail, restaurant, and office from both principal elevations, and a notched corner with entries to commercial spaces, as well.

Massing and rhythm: Viewed from E Pine St, the building appears as two volumes, the residential volume slightly set back and resting atop the retail/garage concrete plinth. While the 13th Avenue elevation does not show a setback on the upper stories, the building still reads as two separate volumes, in part due to the overhanging third story.

In its rise from grade to parapet, 1222 E Pine has none of the sheer mass of the light industrial buildings of the Pike-Pine neighborhood, nor the scale and decorative treatment of the neighborhood's classic vernacular apartment blocks.

This proposed building is located on a corner site. Not only that, but it is surrounded by buildings of a lower height and scale; thus, all façades and all corners of the building have a degree of prominence. At the corner of E Pine St and 13th Avenue, there is a wraparound bay of extensive glazing on the residential levels, set back from and separated by heavy spandrels.

Rhythmically, there is a confusion of modulation of the building's façade, both horizontally and vertically. There is a bay system of alternating solids and voids, solids protruding, voids receding. The protruding solids appear to have a punched window system, similar to those found in masonry construction, while the voids are fully glazed. The protruding solid vertical forms are capped by canopies, creating a dissonant staccato rhythm at the building's cornice line. Horizontally, the protruding spandrels give the building a stacked appearance, accentuated by the concrete base, which protrudes even further.

The over-modulation does not appear to borrow from any of the neighborhood's vernacular architecture, nor is it integrated into an overall structural system, or expression of materials, as in the showroom vernacular. Instead, the modulation appears to isolate the building's components from one another. The canopies are distracting to the overall form.

Streetscape: Along E Pine St, there are two commercial spaces of over 2,000 sf each, intended for restaurant and office use. The notched corner includes a smaller (500+ sf) space for retail, with entrances for this space as well as the residences, within the corner notch. Extensive transparency at the

ground floor, a continuous canopy for weather protection, a ground-floor 17' 6" bay system, 15-foot sidewalks, and tree plantings at 20' spacing all contribute to an enhanced pedestrian experience along this block of E Pine St, and a healthy streetscape. The building also modestly turns the corner; the notched corner with an entrance to commercial space and the building lobby helps to continue some of the flow of foot traffic along 13th Avenue as well.

Conclusion

1222 E Pine St is a pioneer building of sorts: it is being proposed to be built in a quarter of the conservation district with few good examples of the neighborhood vernacular architecture for which Pike-Pine is known and celebrated. Objectives for neighborhood conservation for a building at this site, then, might include integration with some aspects of existing neighborhood vernacular architecture, in order to continue and perhaps provide a contemporary take on that vernacular; or the creation of a new neighborhood context into which future development might integrate, or take its cues.

At the ground level of the building, and along the streetscape, the building has aspects that could improve the existing context: a continuous street wall of storefronts on E Pine St, with glazing from the ground level to the ceiling, entrances to shops and commercial spaces, a bay rhythm that is pedestrian-friendly, wide sidewalks, a continuous canopy, and street trees are all desirable elements that contribute to this neighborhood's character.

There appears to be an overall lack of integration in the building's architecture. The concrete base with frame upper stories is a common construction method in Seattle, but the distinct separation of the base and frame elements is not practiced in the character-defining areas of the Pike-Pine neighborhood. Also, neither the façade modulation nor the broken canopy evokes any forms familiar here. While the street level has some definite contributions to neighborhood character, the building's appearance would introduce a more generic style of architecture to the neighborhood.

5. 1110 E Madison St



The proposal includes demolition of the existing buildings and the construction of a new six-story building. The new structure would include approximately 91 residential units, ground level retail uses and below grade parking for approximately 37 vehicles (DPD Project No. 3007732).

Architectural and Urban Context

This site, a small triangular lot at the intersection of E Madison St, E Union St, and 12th Avenue, and extending west as far as 11th Avenue, is a dramatic location, at the very edge of the Pike-Pine district, where it meets the south side of 12th Avenue, an up-and-coming district in its own right. The site, the 'bow' of the 'bowtie' corner, is prominently exposed on all of its elevations.

There are several early twentieth-century character buildings in the immediate vicinity of this structure: the red-brick former light industrial Union Arms Artist Co-op is directly across E Union St, and another one-story light industrial brick building is diagonally across the street. Also across E Union St is a low-slung, white, and well-windowed luxury car showroom. The yellow-brick Trace Lofts is diagonally across E Union St, and the concrete self storage building stands like a massive grain silo across E Madison St. On the southeast corner of 12th Avenue and E Madison St is the former terra cotta automobile showroom that is now the Seattle Academy of Art. However, across 11th Avenue to the west are four small blocks of somewhat disintegrated urban fabric: buildings set back from the street with parking lots, and buildings without strong architectural character.

Architecturally and contextually, this intersection is quite rich, and thus offers some excellent opportunities and challenges in all directions.

Analysis

The analysis below is based upon the conformity of the proposed project to a proposed guideline for conservation of neighborhood character, and is exclusive of its adherence to existing neighborhood design guidelines.

Proposed Guideline: Maintain site, setback, building orientation, massing, and rhythm at the street level, and maintain existing streetscape character.

Site, setback, orientation: The building fully occupies this triangular site. It acknowledges the slight elevation change with an uplifted prow at the triangular corner. With all façades exposed, the building orients to each street that it faces, with commercial spaces on the ground floor. E Union Street, the quietest street because traffic cannot continue through to the east at this intersection, is the location of the residential entry and the parking garage.

Massing and rhythm: Like the best of the vernacular architecture of this neighborhood, this building rises straight from the ground to its parapet, with its vertical elements strongly emphasized on the building's exterior. The triangular corner wedge is lifted one full story above the remainder of the building, emphasizing that corner as the building's most prominent. At the base, the building is visually lifted off the ground by its sheer glass walls, with the almost completely transparent ground floor brought to a glassy point at 12th Avenue.

However, this is still a very large building for this fine-grained neighborhood. It will have two façades over 200' in length. The E Union St elevation is broken up by a notch that inflects the building, and each façade has narrow recesses that create modulation points. Yet it must be noted that the typical character building in this neighborhood is approximately 100' to 120' wide along the block face. A recent development in the neighborhood that was an entire block in its massing, though the building mass was broken into elements separated by a courtyard, has been an often-cited example of building mass that is not appropriate to this neighborhood.

Rhythmically, the building is divided into a series of broad bays with large horizontal windows, divided by mullions. Narrow bays are inset into a few recesses on the E Madison St and 11th Avenue elevations. The rhythm of this bay system is compatible with, while not imitating, the frame-revealing structurally expressive rhythm of that building's bay system.

Streetscape: There is a strong effort to engage the pedestrian on all three elevations and to create an interesting and vibrant streetscape. The transparency of the ground floor, with nearly continuous glazing, invites passersby, as do the small (1,000 sf) retail shops and multiple building entrances. Tall (13'+) ceiling heights in the shops are also compatible with the Pike-Pine vernacular. A small portico on the E Union St elevation creates not only weather protection, but an interesting and as yet uncommon architectural feature in this area. The designer has made a major effort to locate as many curb bulbs and sidewalk extensions as possible around this site, in order to improve pedestrian navigation and safety, as

well as provide more space for landscaping. Sidewalks of over 13'6" width also improve the streetscape and set a standard for future development in this area.

Conclusion

This building is proposed for a very important site, both visually and urbanistically, in the Pike-Pine district. Its visual prominence derives from its location on one of the "bow-tie" intersections along E Madison St. In terms of its urban context, this lot rests at the edges of two burgeoning neighborhood commercial districts, which both straddle this intersection. Though the physical linkage between the neighborhoods has become much stronger in recent years, this intersection is still perceived as a small void that must be crossed, and that could be a bridge between the two. The fact that the intersection of 12th and Madison is the only physical connector between these neighborhoods only heightens this site's significance.

In the criteria of the proposed guideline, the proposed building succeeds in all of the relevant factors. It sets back a few extra feet to allow for greater sidewalk width, and is oriented to each of the streets it faces. The designers attempt to organize its mass in ways that are evocative of the character architecture of the Pike-Pine neighborhood, and similarly create a compatible rhythm. It generously acknowledges the street level as its public face to the neighborhood, and its small, glazed, high-ceilinged storefronts look to carry some of the neighborhood's commercial energy to this prime intersection.

It has already been stated that the building has about twice the mass of a typical Pike-Pine vernacular building. Slight recesses in both the horizontal and vertical elements add visual depth to the overall mass, but it will not be known until it is built what the overall impact of a building of this mass will have on the character of the neighborhood, especially in this bowtie area, which is still in the process of being made. However, it appears to be out of proportion with the fine-grained architecture of its neighbors.

On page 13 of the designer's December 2009 submittal, a palette of materials for the building's exterior cladding is preceded by photographs of recently completed buildings in the area, showing the precedent for metal cladding. Over the past decade, metal cladding has become a common cladding material for new buildings. Exterior claddings often refer to their periods of construction, and it appears that metal cladding will become part of the architectural character of this and many other Seattle neighborhoods.

One of the objectives of the formation of the conservation district was to create a mechanism to save the neighborhood's character buildings. This project requires the loss of one of the last remaining timber apartment buildings in the neighborhood. It is hoped that, had the project gone through its development after the legislation for the conservation district was approved, there would have been more incentive for the developer to conserve the existing character building.

In conclusion, this is a large building on a prominent site. Seattle is a city of shifting grids, with many flatiron sites where the grids meet – Olive Way, Denny Way, and Yesler Way, for example. Given this, there are surprisingly few good local examples of architecture that celebrates the particular drama of that type of site: the Times Square Building at Olive and Stewart and the Yesler Building on Yesler and Terrace Street are probably the best examples. A building on a crucial and coveted site, with each façade visible, has the opportunity to be bold and inspiring, as well as integrated within the neighborhood context. This proposed building does a better job at the latter than the former.

6. 1424 11th Ave



A six-story, 60-unit residential structure is proposed for the site, with 6,150 square feet of ground floor retail and 27 parking stalls (DPD Project No. 3005060).

Architectural and Urban Context

The building proposed for 1424 11th Avenue is at the heart of the Pike-Pine district. It is also in the midst of some of the best of the old and new character buildings of Pike-Pine. The Agnes Lofts and 1111 E Pike represent the new character buildings, and are in the immediate vicinity of this site. Also, 1101 E Pike St is a classic light industrial building of the early twentieth century, clad in yellow brick with a double height heavily glazed ground floor, and oversized multi-paned windows on the upper stories. The diminutive stucco-covered brick Balagan Theatre building is around the corner on E Pike, and there is one of the last remaining timber apartment houses of the neighborhood across the street, at the southwest corner of E Pike St and 11th Avenue. The Union Arts Co-Op is at the corner of 11th Avenue and E Union St. The variety of old and new character architecture surrounding this site gives it an eclectic appearance, yet it also retains a fine-grained urban fabric and contains a broad range of uses.

This block of 11th Avenue is a quiet one, just around the corner from most of the activity on E Pike St. There is an unusual grade change on this block, where 11th Avenue is lower than 12th Avenue, and a large portion of the interior of this block is used for parking “below grade”. The energy of the Pike-Pine

corridor is somewhat dissipated on this block, in part due to the change in grade and the amount of surface parking there now.

Besides scale, what it also borrows from the neighborhood context is its large window openings, strong horizontal and vertical bones, and tall, glazed retail space and a harmonious palette of real, but muted colors that is intended to complement both the old brick of the two neighbors on 11th (1101 E Pike and the Union Arts building) as well as the new Tom Kundig-designed project that backs onto it from the north.

Analysis

The analysis below is based upon the conformity of the proposed project to a proposed guideline for conservation of neighborhood character, and is exclusive of its adherence to existing neighborhood design guidelines.

Proposed Guideline: Maintain site, setback, building orientation, massing, and rhythm at the street level, and maintain existing streetscape character.

Site, setback, orientation: 11th Avenue is approximately 11 feet lower than 12th Avenue. The change in grade provides an opportunity for a development to engage adjacent properties to this site. The undeveloped portion of the site, now used for surface parking and access to basement levels, would be used to provide a physical connection between 11th Avenue and the restaurant and retail uses on 12th Avenue.

The proposed building is flush to the sidewalk and oriented towards 11th Avenue, while at the same time providing a pedestrian alleyway, with small retail spaces opening onto that newly created walkway from the building's north façade.

Massing and rhythm: The building is 64 feet wide, with a 7,000 sf footprint, well in keeping with the fine-grained scale of the character buildings of the Pike-Pine neighborhood. The building is massed as a solid volume resting on a highly glazed base, a treatment common in the former auto-row showroom buildings. That solid volume is then punctured with large windows on the western façade (facing 11th Avenue). This reads as a sheer wall rising above the ground-floor plinth. The windows, besides breaking the volume, are used for several other architectural functions: the window wall is slightly offset from the front façade, giving it its own mass and simultaneously emphasizing the frame structure of the shell that supports it. The windows are also stacked, and their horizontal alternation with recesses in the front façade, creates a columnar effect, emphasizing the verticality of this structure. The alternating recessed panels, colored a rusty red, also emphasize verticality.

On the alley side (north façade), the small offset of the front façade is used to carry that plane into a continuous canopy over the retail stores. Several boxy bays jut out from the north façade, overlooking the pedestrian alley.

The ground floor of this building stretches to 16 feet, in order to match the double-height of the 1101 E Pike building next door. After marking that datum, the building is free to express its own reference lines, which are different from its next-door neighbor, but compatible with it. The building is only one story above the parapet of 1101 E Pike, a height which integrates it comfortably with its surroundings.

The building has a simple rhythm on its street façade, alternating large windows with solid panels punched through with small windows. The façade modulation is gentle, and only serves to emphasize the large expanses of window, which is an acknowledgment of the beautiful glazing of 1101 E Pike, while not trying to resemble or imitate it.

Streetscape: The double-height windows of the ground floor will give this building's retail floor a lightness and transparency that the great older character buildings of this neighborhood already embody. The ground floor retail spaces are light and open. Further, and more important, the project continues the streetscape into a pedestrian alley that will expand the public realm within the block face, creating more spaces to gather and play, and parsing the grain and texture of this block much finer than any other in the neighborhood. Landscaping, parking, and sidewalk improvements will improve the pedestrian experience, and enhance pedestrian connections along 11th Avenue, which is only lightly traveled now.

Conclusion

This proposed building is a refreshingly updated Modernist structure -- a solid geometric volume floating above a glazed base -- harmoniously inserted among the early twentieth-century automobile showrooms and former garages of this former auto row neighborhood. Different from its Corbusian forbears, it not only engages with the street, but it welcomes activity off the sidewalk, bringing it into a new pedestrian alley, carved out of the interior of the block. The scale of the building (only 64' wide) fits in well with its neighbors. The building's solid form, inset with large windows, and set on top of a double height ground floor, is familiar to the neighborhood, in its original early twentieth century vernacular. Its massing and rhythm, while not at all similar to older light industrial buildings of the neighborhood, fits in harmoniously among them, both evoking and redefining the architectural character of the neighborhood.

The only regrettable aspect of this project is the loss of the character building now on this lot. The building there now is a rehearsal space, a building type and use which are both endangered in the Pike-Pine neighborhood.

7. 1530 11th Ave



Six stories of apartments are proposed to be built above an existing one-story building, incorporating 92 residences, 36 parking stalls and 9,100 square feet of ground floor retail, plus 1,000 square feet of mezzanine retail (DPD Project No. 3010451).

Urban Context

This proposed project is located on a prime corner in the Pike-Pine neighborhood, on a block of older character buildings that is virtually intact. Brick and terra cotta prevail. The predominant pattern is similar to that in this building: expansive first story windows, perhaps three- or four-part, with a transom above, giving the ground floor a true double-height space. A decorative band above this ground floor separates it from the upper stories, which are typically multi-paned mullioned windows, lined up directly above the ground floor windows. Distinct from the windows in the ground floor, the windows in the upper stories appear to have been punched through the solid material, giving the overall mass lightness and the quality of a building frame. It is apparent that several of the buildings on the interior of the block performed garage function, from the observation of several of the remnant of garage doors, the widened space sometimes converted to a front patio for a restaurant/bar, a widened building entry, or a theatre entry.

Directly across E Pine St is the Richmark building, which appears to have the characteristics of one of the auto showroom buildings, but one whose ground floor windows have been bricked and stuccoed over. And diagonally across E Pine is the Bobby Morris Playfield, and oasis of green in a neighborhood of hardscape.

Architecture

This building has the appearance of a former garage or automobile repair shop, possibly combined with a showroom. It has two different bay systems on the 11th Avenue elevation. The northern portion of the building is a regular twenty-foot system of bays, separated by heavy brick pilasters. At the southern end of this elevation, the building reads as one broad bay (garage door) flanked by two narrower bays. Along E Pine Street, the twenty-foot bay system is applied consistently.

This is a one-story building with cavernous 25' ceiling heights. Even with such a grand height, it appears to be rather restrained in its ornamentation. The brick pilasters are finished with simple terra cotta finials, and there is a thin band of terra cotta demarcating the ceiling height and a band of brick that is the base of the parapet wall. Small diamond-shaped terra cotta or tile medallions are regularly spaced at 25' intervals along the brick band. At the south end of the building's west façade, the center bay is accentuated by a gabled parapet, inset with a small terra cotta cartouche as ornament. A much more modest parapet marks the building's corner at E Pine St and 11th Avenue, also inset with a cartouche.

Analysis

The analysis below is based upon the conformity of the proposed project to proposed guidelines for conservation of character buildings and conservation of neighborhood character, and is exclusive of its adherence to other existing neighborhood design guidelines.

Proposed Guideline: Identify the form and detailing of those architectural materials and features that are important in defining the building's historic character and which must be retained in order to preserve that character.

The character structure is a former auto repair shop or showroom, characterized by frame construction, and brick exterior finish material with modest ornamentation in terra cotta. Although a single story, it has ceiling heights that are double height or greater, measuring approximately 25'. The structural frame creates a regular bay system, which is a strong visual element of this building: Brick pilasters frame large expanses of glass, emphasizing lightness and transparency within a sturdy structure. The building is topped by arched and gabled parapets. Frame construction, a soaring ceiling height, and large windows are the primary architectural characteristics. Brick finishing and terra cotta decoration are secondary character features of this building.

Proposed Guideline: Avoid all but minor changes to the primary elevation(s) of the character structure.

Proposed Guideline: Do not obscure significant features of the character structure.

The proposed new structure would be placed on top of the existing structure. Although the façade of the original building would be retained, it can be shown that the new building creates an architectural intrusion that is a major change to the exterior elevation.

It has been stated that the existing building has ceiling heights that are approximately 25'. This height is substantially greater than many of the character buildings in the neighborhood, where 16' height is more typical. The proposed design would lower the ceiling height of this first floor to less than 14'. The floor of the new second story would be inset at the level of the brick banding separating the large showroom windows and the transom windows above. This transom level would become a new second story of apartments, with a ceiling height of approximately 10'-6".

Therefore, the double-height first floor character feature of the primary elevation would be eliminated by this addition. This would be both a major change to and an obscuring of a significant character feature of this building.

Proposed Guideline: Make a visual distinction between old and new: new construction should be distinguishable from the character portion.

The new building proposed is a six-story residential addition to the existing structure, with the bottom floor of the addition sunken into the original structure, so that five stories appear above the existing façade. The new structure has a north and a south wing, the former of which is set back 1'-6" from the principal façade, and the latter 3'-6". The new structure extends the existing bay system upward, and imitates the form and height (approximately 8'-6") of the ground floor transom windows. Its dark coloration, while of a metal exterior finish, is similar to that of the dark brown brick of the original building. The new building provides parapet walls and trim that are pastiches of those on the original structure.

There are several features of the new building that cause it to lack a significant visual distinction from the original structure:

- Imitation of form: the new structure directly copies the form of the original structure, and extrudes it for an additional five stories.
- Lack of setback: the minimal setback of the new structure from the existing façade does not provide any visual relief or separation between the structures, welds them together visually, and causes the new structure to be ever-present from any visual angle.
- Color of exterior materials: the dark color of the metal finishes on the new building appears to blend too easily with the dark brick of the original structure. Too, the imitation of the terra cotta band and ornamentation at the cornice line only serves to confuse the distinction between the buildings, and diminishes the original structure.

Proposed Guideline: Keep the addition compatible with the character structure in form, scale, massing, and proportion.

The designers of this building have confused the notion of compatibility with imitation. Imitation of the existing building, which is what this building is, diminishes the architecture and construction of the original. While the form, bay system, and window pattern of the new building is the same as the original, simply extruding these forms upward five stories in an imitative fashion distorts the proportions of the original by attempting to place an elongated version of itself on top.

Proposed Guideline: Maintain site, setback, building orientation, massing, and rhythm at the street level, and maintain existing streetscape character.

This proposed building would not change the site, orientation, massing, or street-level rhythm of the existing structure. However, streetscape character of the existing building includes its greater than double-height ceiling, which would be eliminated if this proposed building were built.

Conclusion

This building has been vacant for over fifteen years, and its fate has been the subject of much neighborhood concern. Conserving the façade of this structure has been considered important to conserving the overall character of this block, and its loss would be a symbolic blow to the efforts to maintain the character architecture of the Pike-Pine neighborhood.

The proposed structure does conserve the façade of the original, and would restore its appearance and bring back a long-vacant structure back to a new neighborhood use. Ground floor retail would be provided behind large transparent windows. More housing would be brought into this neighborhood. The presence of more retail patrons and more residents would be welcome additions and enliven street activity in this pedestrian-oriented neighborhood.

However, the proposed new structure serves at best to highlight the costs of keeping a façade intact. The resultant building, while conserving the existing façade, would create a cheaper looking copy of the older building on top of it, in a strangely elongated form. Its lack of setback causes it to loom uncomfortably above its progenitor, and rest very heavily on top of it. With the bottom floor of the new building usurping the transom level of the ground floor, the proposed structure appears even heavier, as if its weight were collapsing into the character building.

The proposed new building would change and obscure the original character building, appear insufficiently distinct from it. As a pastiche of the original, its compatibility in form and massing is debatable, but its incompatibility in scale and proportion is not.

8. 954 East Union Street



Proposed is a six-story building containing 8,000 sq. ft. of retail at ground level and 79 residential units above. Parking for 75 vehicles is also to be provided, at and below grade. (DPD Project No. 3003238).

Architectural and Urban Context

The site occupies a double lot, approximately 18,785 square feet and rectangular. The site is relatively flat and is currently developed with a single story industrial building. The property is bound to the east by 10th Avenue, with East Union Street to the south.

The surrounding context includes buildings that are of a lower-scale, light industrial character. These warehouses historically accommodated automotive services, several of which are still in operation. These buildings are generally brick with large windows and strong cornice lines. The haphazard sidewalk conditions and right-of-way configuration with 90-degree parking down the west side of 10th Avenue creates an alley-like character along this street.

On this block of 10th Avenue, there is perhaps only one exemplary character building, a restaurant and bar at the southeast corner of E Pike St and 10th Avenue. Other buildings are of a small scale and fine-grained, most 50' to 60' in width, but some are as narrow as 30'. Of the other older buildings on this block, some have had windows replaced in a fashion not in keeping with the character architecture, others rather casually renovated. There are also two surface parking lots, both below grade, due to elevation changes between 10th and 1th Avenues. While the architectural character of this block is not particularly strong, this block is perhaps the center of gravity of the area's nightlife and pedestrian activity.

Along E Union St, the lot adjacent to this site contains a small Greek Revival temple structure with a front portico colonnade of Doric columns. This small building does not occupy its entire lot, so there is a separation of approximately 40' between the proposed structure and its neighbor.

Analysis

The analysis below is based upon the conformity of the proposed project to a proposed guideline for conservation of neighborhood character, and is exclusive of its adherence to existing neighborhood design guidelines.

Proposed Guideline: Maintain site, setback, building orientation, massing, and rhythm at the street level, and maintain existing streetscape character.

Site, setback, orientation: The proposed building would occupy the entire 100' x 80' double lot comprising the site, and its two street-facing façades would be flush to the sidewalk. This site occupies a corner lot, so there are two principal facades: 10th Avenue and E Union St.

Massing and rhythm: Because this site occupies a double-width lot, there appears to have been some effort to break down the massing of the building. Above its continuous base, the massing is broken into three unequal volumes separated by recessed bays, which are meant to read as voids. With differing width, different datum lines and distinct fenestration patterns, the intended appearance of reduced massing seems more or less successful.

The volumes are separated into bays of three- and four-part window patterns. The windows appear carved out from the solid volumes rather than a curtain wall. The bays are separated by rather wide pilasters, emphasizing the structure's verticality. Within some of the columns of bays are projecting and recessed balconies. The building is designed as a frame structure with masonry and cementitious panel cladding.

At the attic level is a metal trellis above the top story windows. Vertical metal siding serves as the building's cornice. The cornice height at the corner is slightly higher than the rest of the building.

Streetscape: Above the concrete base of the building, the ground floor pilasters are clad in brick. The drawings show roll-up garage doors on several of the bays between the pilasters, four on E Union St, and four on 10th Avenue. These doors, designed to be transparent, give a lightness and informality to the ground floor retail spaces, and, when open, would move the indoor retail spaces outdoors, and make much of the ground floor façade disappear. These ground floor retail spaces have ceiling heights of approximately 13' to 14'. The three corner bays are slightly inset behind pilasters, with large windows. A continuous canopy runs along both primary façades, at the 9' level. A garage entry to the building is placed at the north end of the 10th Avenue side of the building.

Conclusion

This proposed building occupies a double lot on 10th Avenue, one of its principal façades. That elevation is therefore approximately 100' wide, twice as wide as any other structure in this block, and three times as wide as some of the narrower buildings. Thus, whatever is built upon this site is bound to have a large impact on the architectural character of this particular block. Also, given that the surrounding architectural context is not particularly strong, this building will have a major impact, by its size, its

newness, and its design features. This building, along with at least three other proposed projects within two blocks, will have an effect on the architectural and contextual character of the Pike-Pine neighborhood, particularly in those blocks nearest the 12th and Madison 'bowtie'.

Its size is problematic, as has already been said. The attempts to ameliorate the mass of this building by breaking it into three components, distinguished by slight differences in finish materials and bay rhythms, are admirable, but it is not clear to what degree they will be successful, and whether the presence of this building will dominate or overpower the block.

The building incorporates elements that will enhance the character of the streetscape in this neighborhood: roll-up garage doors on the retail spaces, for example. Even the presence of an actual garage door on 10th Avenue seems less problematic here than on other streets, because this neighborhood still does have some garage-related uses, and the street has an informality and a relaxed interchange between pedestrians and cars. This building will also give definition to sidewalks and pedestrian areas, which are somewhat haphazard now.

The balconies strike a false and curious note: in this area of heavy and sometimes raucous nighttime activity, why invite unnecessary conflict with balconies facing directly onto 10th Avenue?

This most lasting benefit of this building and other nearby developments will be in bringing activity further south, helping to bridge Capitol Hill and the 12th Avenue/Seattle University neighborhood immediately to the south, thereby also re-connecting the city.